

Indigenous Peoples Development Plan (IPDP)

Education for a more Productive and Equitable Argentina Project (P070963)

Desk Reviews and Informed Consultations

A social assessment was carried out by local teams in two parts: (a) A nation-wide qualitative assessment titled “Study of Social Demands” was carried out from November 2004 to February 2005 with the purpose of informing the project design on aspects related to rural, technical and vocational schools in project areas. A purposeful sample selected by the Ministry of Education included provinces located in the six major regions of the country: Mendoza, Río Negro, Salta, Misiones, Catamarca and Rosario/Santa Fe. Teachers, parents, students, social communicators, education specialists, High School authorities, potential employers and representatives of the industrial sector shared their perceptions, views and expectations of the current educational system, and the constraints and challenges of the labor market for high school graduates. The methods used to collect information were focus groups and interviews. To complement the above assessment, a desk review of secondary sources carried out between April and June 2005 analyzed some institutional and political issues of supply and demand of education in Argentina.

(b) A desk review of existing information on the status of education among indigenous peoples was carried out in June, 2005. It was based on the 2001 Census, documents and studies by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology MECyT (1997-2005), the Center for Legal and Social Studies (CELS), the International Federation of Human Rights (CAREF), and other sources. The desk review was completed with consultations with government officials and stakeholders at the central level (INDEC; National Institute of Indigenous Affairs INAI; MECyT) and at the provincial level. The assessment concentrated on the Northeastern (NEA), and Northwestern (NOA) regions, which include some of the poorest provinces in the country, with the highest student dropout, repetition and over-age rates, and therefore, the highest demand of support. Coincidentally, these provinces are home to the largest majority of indigenous students.

Indigenous Peoples in Argentina

The exact number of indigenous peoples in Argentina is not known. The 2001 Census included a question on ‘self-identification’ which created resistance from the indigenous organizations. A general estimate between 1.5 and 2.7 percent of the total population may vary. There are 20 different groups, the most numerous of whom are the Colla, Diaguita, Mapuche, Wichí and Toba. According to the Census, there are 281,959 homes with at least one member self-identified as indigenous. One third of those homes are located in the province of Buenos Aires. A complementary Household Survey module tracing the 2001 households inhabited by one or more indigenous person will be ready in late 2005.

Table No. 1 Indigenous Population in Argentina, by ethnic group and estimate source

Ethnic group	Provinces	Nat Indigenous Census 1968	Indigenous Affairs Serv 1974	Guillermo Magrassi 1986	ENDEPA 1987	INCUPO 2003*
Colla	Jujuy, Salta, Catamarca; Slums of Bs.As and Cordoba	1,012	35,340	180,000	138,000	170,000
Mapuche	Neuquen, Rio Negro, Chubut, La Pampa, Bs.As.	27,214	21,637	60,000	60,000	90,000
Wichí	Salta, Formosa, Chaco	10,022	21,884	20,000	60,000	80,000
Toba	Chaco, Salta, Formosa, Sta Fe, Slums Bs.As. Rosario	17,062	32,639	36,000	50,000	60,000
Chiriguano-Chane	Salta, Jujuy	14,506	24,680	25,000	21,000	22,400
Mocoví	Santa Fe, Chaco	2,876	8,945	5,000	3,000	7,300
Diaguita Calchaquí	Tucumán, Catamarca	n/d	n/d	n/d	6,000	6,000
Pilagá	Formosa	1,137	2,516	5,000	5,000	5,000
Mbyá	Misiones	560	683	2,500	3,500	3,000
Tehuelche	Sta Cruz, Chubut	167	287	190	60	2,200
Chulupí	Salta, Formosa	562	171	1,000	n/d	1,200
Chorote	Salta, Formosa	719	1,013	1,000	n/d	900
TOTAL		75,837	149,795	335,690	346,560	448,000

Source: MECyT. Social Education Plan. "Compensatory Policy and Intercultural Bilingual Education. 1998
*Compliance Report of the Argentine Government with ILO Agreement 169, 2003.

According to the 2001 Census, 58.4 percent of indigenous peoples live in urbanized areas such as the Pampeana Region (Buenos Aires, Santa Fe, Cordoba, Entre Rios and La Pampa) and Gran Buenos Aires. The other 41.6 percent live mostly in rural areas, distributed among the NOA region (15.1), Patagonia (13.5), NEA (7.3) and Cuyo (5.7).

Nevertheless, as can be seen in Table 2 the largest amount of indigenous communities is found in NOA (451) and NEA (275) regions respectively.

Mapping of Indigenous Peoples and Unsatisfied Basic Needs

The largest number of households suffering from unsatisfied basic needs (UBN) correspond to NEA and NOA. i.e. Formosa (28 percent); Salta (27.5 percent); Chaco (27.5 percent); Santiago del Estero (26.2 percent); Jujuy (26/1 percent); y Corrientes (24 percent) compared to the Buenos Aires province (13 percent) or Cordoba (11 percent). The provinces with highest indigenous population also have the highest UBN, such as Formosa, Salta and Chaco, where some of their departments may reach up to 79.3 percent of UBN.

According to the National Registration of Indigenous Communities (RENACI), there exist 867 indigenous communities legally constituted at the national and provincial levels, and many others in the process of acquiring legal personality.

Table No. 2: Indigenous Communities registered in RENACI per province

Province	Nr. of Communities	Province	Nr. of Communities
Buenos Aires	14	Chaco	89
Chubut	24	Formosa	103
Jujuy	162	La Pampa	2
Mendoza	13	Neuquén	51
Río Negro	13	Santiago del Estero	13
Santa Fe	18	San Juan	2
Salta	281	Tucumán	8
Tierra del Fuego	1	Misiones	83
		TOTAL	867

Source: National Program for Intercultural Indigenous Education

Indigenous Languages

There are twelve live languages: Quechua-Aymara, Quichua-Santiagoño, Mapuzungun (Mapuche), Mbyá-Guaraní, Wichi, Pilagá, Qom (Toba), Guaraní-Yopará, Mocoví, Chané, Chorote and Chulupí. Neither language has an official grammar and dictionary. Language coverage may go beyond race, as is the case of Corrientes, where Guaraní is spoken by non-indigenous. On the other hand, some indigenous groups are bilingual and in process of recuperation of their indigenous language, such is the case of the Huarpes (Milcayac-Spanish) and Diaguitas (Kakan-Spanish).

The homogenization of the population through the “castellanización” (Spanish enforced and indigenous languages shunned) has been the norm in the education system. That, together with the gradual loss of ancestral territories, has contributed to the loss of identity.

There are ten live languages: Mapuzungun (Mapuche), Mbyá-Guaraní, Wichi, Pilagá, Qom (Toba), Guaraní-Yopará, Mocoví, Chané, Chorote and Chulupí. Neither language has an official grammar and dictionary. Language coverage may go beyond race, as is the case of Corrientes y Santiago del Estero, where Guaraní y el quichua santiagoño is spoken by non-indigenous. On the other hand, some indigenous groups are bilingual and in process of recuperation of their indigenous language, such is the case of the Huarpes (Milcayac-Spanish) and Diaguitas (Kakan-Spanish). Quechua and Aymara language are not spoken by indigenous communities but it is still spoken in some areas of the Province of Jujuy.

Legal Framework

The National Constitution as well as legislation at the provincial level protects the right of indigenous peoples to education.

- The National Constitution, Art 75, paragraph 17 states: “To recognize the ethnic and cultural pre-existence of Argentinean indigenous peoples. Guarantee respect for their identity and their right to an intercultural bilingual education...”
- Integrated Law of the Aborigines of the Province of Formosa No. 426/84, followed by National Law 23.302/85 that grants indigenous communities statutory rights to

participate in socio-economic and cultural processes. The same law decrees that the first three years of education should be in mother tongue, and the years thereafter should be bilingual.

- In 1992, National Law No. 24.071 ratified ILO Agreement 169 on Indigenous “Peoples and Tribal Groups in Independent Countries”.
- Federal Education Law 24.195/93 recognizes “...the right of indigenous communities to preserve cultural traits, the right to learning and teaching in their language, with the participation of the elders of each community in this process. Chapter VII, Art 34 establishes: “... the National Government will promote programs to rescue the cultural heritage and strengthen indigenous languages and cultures...”
- In 1996, the National Registry for Indigenous Communities (RENACI) is created under the Ministry of Social Development.
- Resolution 107/99 of the CFCyE created the title of “Intercultural Bilingual Teacher” for EGB1, EGB2, EGB3 and 'Polimodal’.
- The presentation before the Racial Discrimination Committee (CERD), July 2004, reads: “Indigenous peoples receive minimal education assistance and the Government has not been able to implement an educational policy which takes into account the cultural identity and educational and linguistic characteristics of indigenous peoples at the Federal level. It has also failed to implement the urgent necessary reforms to the contents of the Education Plans addressed to all the society at large”.
- Argentina has also ratified the UN Declaration of the Rights of the Indigenous Peoples, Resolution 1994/45, and the OAS Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, Act 1333, Art IX, which states: “(1) Indigenous Peoples will have the right to: (a) define and apply their own programs, institutions and educational facilities; (b) prepare and apply their own plans, programs, curricula and learning materials; (c) train and accredit their teachers and administrators. (2) When indigenous peoples so desire, education programs should be carried out in the indigenous languages. Training for mastering of the indigenous language and official languages. (3) The States will warranty the educational systems for indigenous are the same in quality, efficiency and access to those offered to the mainstream population. (4) The States shall include in their education systems, contents that reflect the pluri-cultural nature of their societies. And, (5) The States will provide the financial assistance to set forth those provisions

The National Intercultural Bilingual Education Program (PNEIB)

PNEIB is in infancy, as it was officially born at the end of 2003. PNEIB is located at the MECyT, under the National Directorate of Compensatory Programs of the Ministry of Education.

The experimental phase of PNEIB initiated in 1997, when the MECyT launched Project 4 within the framework of compensatory policy of the Social Education Plan, “to respond to the needs of schools with aborigine students”. Some of the initial actions included:

- The identification of 800 schools that registered indigenous students;
- Salient initiatives were identified and a network was formed;
- Guidelines and pedagogical strategies were applied in 5 schools in 5 provinces with 5 different language groups;
- Support to the production of teaching materials: bilingual sets with 10 titles in Toba and Wichí languages;
- PNEIB training for education staff, teachers and auxiliaries;
- International Integration agreement of PNEIB to PROEIB-Andes;

- Legal framework for the generation of EIB norms. Resolution 107/99 regulates EIB and teacher training.

In 2000, the above program was called “Project for the Improvement of Educational Quality for Indigenous Peoples” and expanded to more schools. In 2001, an agreement between MECyT and PROEIB-Andes made official and expanded the EIB network to sensitize the education community to the recognition of special needs of PNEIB.

The National Intercultural Bilingual Program (PNEIB) at MECyT began operations in mid-2004, with prospects to provide an Intercultural Bilingual Program to all the indigenous students who may demand such program. PNEIB plans include:

- (a) The inclusion of EIB Units in the structure of provincial MECyT offices;
- (b) The promotion and cooperation for the officialization of EIB norms and its inclusion in the school year;
- (c) The definition of a teacher profile for schools with indigenous population;
- (d) The design of basic pedagogical strategies beyond the typical Identity-Language-Culture scheme present in the current curriculum;
- (e) Strengthening statistics and data on the education status of indigenous students, and reinforcing the links with data sources;
- (f) The systematization of national EIB experiences and learning from international experiences in Latin America;
- (g) The promotion of socio-linguistic research;
- (h) The creation of monitoring and evaluation mechanisms that isolate the ethnic variable to trace progress of vulnerable ethnic groups;
- (i) The inclusion of indigenous participation in the decision-making processes of educational policy;
- (j) To contribute to the cultural and linguistic enrichment of Indigenous society at large.

Issues in Intercultural and Bilingual Education

Despite its conceptual framework and sound legal basis, the National Intercultural Bilingual Program (PNEIB) is not pedagogically normed, fully developed and operational yet, but sound steps are being taken.

Education Census. The ethnic variable was incorporated in the education census by the Ministry of Education National Directorate of Data and Evaluation of Education Quality (RA-DiNIECE) in 2005, and the results will be available late in the year. In 2004 PNEIB began to collect data on enrollment of indigenous students, and languages spoken. Apart from that, the criteria to identify indigenous people is not uniform in the country. Consequently, data on enrollment, retention, achievement, or over-age status of indigenous students is scarce or unreliable.

According to the 1998 Survey to Detect the Needs of Aboriginal Population (Project Four of the Social Development Plan) and the Systematization of EIB Experiences, there were approximately 2,711 schools serving indigenous students in 2001. The current estimate is 3,000 schools.

Pedagogical Framework. Although valuable pedagogical experiences have been systematized in the past few years, there is not a specific pedagogical EIB model. For example, there is no official intercultural or bilingual curriculum. Local programs have developed their own Education Plans based on their local context and needs.

Indigenous Teachers. The intercultural team formed by “a regular teacher and an Auxiliary indigenous teacher (MEMA, ADA, non-official)” was a breakthrough in the system, which recognized the need for intercultural exchange and teacher complementarity in the classroom. However, unofficial indigenous educators which have been in the system as Auxiliary teachers for the past 20 years, demand professionalization and regularization. The intercultural teacher team is found in some schools mostly in grades 1 through 3 but not in all schools. A common scenario encountered in schools visited in indigenous communities showed a one-teacher multi-grade school where the teacher has not received intercultural education and is unable to understand and respond to socio-cultural and socio-linguistic complexities.

Teacher Training to teach Indigenous Schools, and to teach under the PNEIB. Although the Resolution 107/99 of the Federal Council of Education created the title of “Intercultural Bilingual Teacher” for EGB1, 2, 3 and Polimodal, such Training Program does not exist. Two efforts are noteworthy. In Formosa (1997) the first 195 MEMAs were trained to teach pre-school and EGB1 in Aboriginal Schools and incorporated in the system. In Chaco, there exists the Aboriginal Auxiliary Teachers (ADAs) and the unofficial teachers (*‘maestros idóneos’*) but the number is uncertain. In general, there are at least 500 aboriginal/non-aboriginal teachers demanding professionalization and official recognition.

There is neither an institutionalized modality to prepare teachers to teach rural schools in indigenous communities, nor a Professionalization program for Auxiliary indigenous teachers working in schools with indigenous student population. However, there is an Indigenous Teacher Training Program under the Center for Research and Aboriginal Teacher Training (CIFMA) in Chaco Province.

A series of three workshops were conducted in 2004-2005 on “Teacher Training, Interculture and Bilingualism in Education” by the PNEIB in coordination with the Teacher Training Unit of the National Directorate of Curriculum and Teacher Training, with purpose of formulating a Proposal for Teacher Training in Intercultural Education and Intercultural Bilingual Education, to be submitted to the Federal Council of Education for the discussion of a Federal Policy for Intercultural and Bilingual Education. The workshops took place in Bariloche (for Patagonia region, Central Argentina, Mendoza and Federal Capital), Formosa (for NEA and Federal Capital), and San Miguel de Tucumán (for NOA and Federal Capital). The results are reflected in the recommendations of the present Annex.

Educational and reading materials in indigenous languages. With some exceptions, many materials used in PNEIB are translations of materials used in regular schools with monolingual Spanish-speaking students.

Grammars, dictionaries and reading materials in indigenous languages. The only existing grammar is that of Guaraní. Other grammars in planning stage are Wichí, Qom (toba), Mapuzungún, Mocoví and Quechua.

Scholarships for indigenous students. In coordination with INAI, according to MECyT the National Scholarship Plan assigned 8,000 scholarships to indigenous students in 2005 in 1,286 schools (6,000 from MECyT, 1,300 from Social Development Plan and 700 from other sources) for EGB3 and Polimodal. According to INAI two problems remain: (a) lack of data to identify ethnic background of recipients; and (b) lack of tracing studies to monitor results. There is no data on scholarships for indigenous students for pre-school, EGB1 and EGB2.

Recommendations of the Assessments

For Rural Education

1. Regionalization and diversification of the curriculum. The curriculum for rural schools should be adapted to the learning needs of rural areas, based, however, on the national curriculum, so that indigenous students can compete at the national level.
2. Accelerated learning for over-age students. Support the accelerated learning programs for over-age students in rural areas, with the help of itinerant teachers and extra-curricular activities. Community-based efforts are vital to support students going from 6th to EGB3 level, and through high school.
3. Teacher Training. Specialized training to teach rural areas should be provided to teachers. A Module on Intercultural Education is recommended for all teachers working in rural areas.
4. Strengthen Parents' Associations and other community-based organizations supporting the schools.

For the National Intercultural Bilingual Education (PNEIB)

1. Diagnosis. Carry out a diagnosis of supply and demand of schools' infrastructure/conditions, educational resources in indigenous regions (urban and rural). The diagnosis should determine the demand for strengthening of existing EIB Units at the Central and Provincial level, and the creation of new ones in provinces lacking an EIB Unit. Staffing those units with Education Anthropologists, Curriculum designers and EIB materials design specialists will be a key to the development of a sustainable EIB Program. EIB Units in Provinces should provide technical assistance to schools in pedagogical and administrative matters.
2. Data collection. Ensure proper data collection in the Education Census (*Relevamiento annual*) including the ethnic variable and language spoken at home.
3. Homogenize criteria for the definition of a "school with indigenous population" in order to classify them as those needing a full EIB, or classes to strengthen the local indigenous language.
4. Teacher profiles. Define the profiles of (a) rural teachers capable of teaching intercultural students, and (b) "rural EIB teachers".
5. EIB Curriculum. Develop an Intercultural and Bilingual Curriculum (based on the Regionalized Curriculum for rural schools), but likely to be adapted to respond to the needs of rural indigenous schools, which enables students to cross-over from 6th to 7th grade and to complete high school, while preparing them either for the workforce or tertiary education. That curriculum should include fluent reading and writing skills primarily in Spanish.
6. Teacher Training Programs. Three programs are needed: (a) A professionalization program for 500 current 'auxiliary' teachers MEMAS who wish to specialize in EIB (Post Diploma); (b) An on-the-job training program on "Intercultural and bilingual

- education” for rural teachers currently teaching in rural schools with indigenous students; and (c) the incorporation of a Module on “Intercultural and bilingual education” for regular Teacher training programs in general. Also, training on “Intercultural and bilingual education” to academic staff in rural schools with indigenous students and to administrative staff of those schools.
7. Institutional Pedagogical Plans. Support the Institutional Pedagogical Plans submitted annually by schools to MECyT for funding.
 8. Intercultural Teaching-learning materials. Carry out an inventory of teaching/learning materials in schools with indigenous population. Provide support to the development of grammars, dictionaries and educational materials for the teaching of EIB in rural schools. Support the production and reproduction of teaching materials for EIB schools.
 9. School Networks. Support the formation of ‘school networks’, to share facilities, materials and experiences and to improve monitoring of those schools.
 10. The concept of “intercultural education” in Argentina should permeate all subjects: technical, social and arts sciences in education. This concept should guide research with pedagogical purposes to capture valuable traditional knowledge and cultural identity (Bariloche, Formosa, Tucumán Workshops)
 11. Formulate a set of administrative norms to (a) flex the school calendar to accommodate seasonal needs in rural areas; (b) reform teacher statutes to include considerations for rural teachers in indigenous schools.
 12. Systematize best pedagogical practices in EIB and intercultural education in rural areas of Argentina. Support best practices and initiatives in different regions of the country.
 13. M&E programs should include variables to identify coverage of schools in indigenous regions.

Goals and Action Plan of the National Intercultural Bilingual Program (PNEIB) at MECyT.

Seven lines of action are included in the PNEIB 2005 Plan:

1. Teacher Training. It seeks to incorporate EIB in all Teacher Training Programs for pre-school, EGB1, 2, and 3 and to promote the professionalization of all indigenous auxiliary teachers (MEMAs, ADAs, informal, etc.). Also, to promote consultations and participation of formal and informal educators presently working with aboriginal students.
2. Production of Teaching Materials. The introduction of intercultural concepts into existing materials being used in multi-cultural and multi-lingual contexts, as well as the elaboration of new materials.
3. Institutional Pedagogical Projects. Respond to the particular needs of schools and jurisdictions serving indigenous peoples, by supporting their institutional pedagogical

- plans. Also, in coordination with the jurisdictional level, provide technical assistance to schools for the promotion and strengthening of significant EIB experiences.\
4. Scholarships for indigenous students in EGB3 and Polimodal. In coordination with INAI, provide 10,000 scholarships per year to students in EGB3 and Polimodal. Likewise, coordinate with Scholarship Program for Tertiary Education (under the Secretariat of Tertiary Education Policy) scholarship support for students wishing to continue their studies at the university.
 5. Formation of a Federal EIB Network. It seeks to support the creation of a permanent federal network that facilitates the communication among provincial teams for a coordinated participatory decision-making process with regard to EIB policy. It also aims at participating in the PROEIB-Andes program with the purpose of strengthening the articulation among the provincial Ministries of Education, the Universities and the Indigenous Peoples in the country.
 6. Systematization of data and information on education of indigenous peoples, and proper Monitoring and Evaluation of EIB experiences. It seeks to generate an accurate diagnosis and baseline capable of reflecting the education reality of indigenous students, and adequate instruments to monitor changes in each jurisdiction.
 7. Educational research and participation in regional research projects. Also, the incorporation in the network of Document Centers of PROEIB-Andes through the National Teachers' Library, which allows access to EIB materials produced in other countries.

Indigenous Peoples Development Plan (IPDP)

Given the presence of indigenous peoples in Argentina, and consistent with the Bank Policy 4.10 on Indigenous Peoples, the proposed project will include an Indigenous Peoples Development Plan (IPDP) which supports the ongoing GOA programs addressed to improve the education conditions of rural schools attended by indigenous students. The GOA counterparts have proposed the IPDP below to support the action plan of the National Plan for Intercultural Bilingual Education (PNEIB) for 2005-2010. The IPDP has been agreed on, incorporated in the project design and disseminated by the Ministry of Education in the country. It will also be incorporated in the Project Operational Manual.

Project Component		Activities to be financed from Loan Proceeds	Cost US\$
A. Efficient Provision of Quality of Rural Education	Professionalization of Auxiliary Aboriginal Teachers (MEMAs and ADAs)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Workshops with technical teams in four country regions to discuss elements of Plan; (b) EIB Teacher Professionalization Plan (Curriculum); (c) Production and distribution of Teaching Manuals to support professionalization; 	604,700

	Support for Institutional Pedagogical Projects in 3,000 schools serving indigenous students in 4 years	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Promotion of projects in schools (b) Training workshops on EIB and participation of school community in the formulation of the institutional pedagogical project to respond to specific needs 	2,507,460
	Inventory, revision, elaboration, production, reproduction of teaching/learning intercultural and bilingual materials	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Inventory of existing resources/materials (b) Quality review and assessment of utilization of materials (c) Reproduction of approved materials (d) Elaboration of new teaching/learning materials (e) Production of materials 	1,083,000
	Information/data Systematization. Monitoring and Evaluation of EIB in 4 years	<p>Diagnosis/mapping/census of state of education among indigenous and non-indigenous peoples residing in indigenous regions in Argentina (rural and urban) which indicate the following quantitative and qualitative information, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) <u>Demographics</u>: students: number of school-age indigenous children and youths, number of those matriculated and those without access to a school. (b) <u>Infrastructure</u>: Physical condition of schools in indigenous regions (as part of the Annual Census under DINIECE-MECyT). (c) <u>Studies of rates and perceptions in education</u>: access, repetition, over-age, drop-out, completion in pre-school, EGB1, EGB2, EGB3, number of teachers with different types of specialization trained to teach intercultural education; number of teachers speaking indigenous languages and level of education. Reasons for the above rates. Peoples' perceptions and preferences. (d) <u>Language(s) of instruction</u>. (e) <u>Pedagogical materials and tools used</u>: universal Spanish, intercultural, bilingual. (f) <u>School organization, participation</u>: School Council, decision-making schemes, opportunities for participation of parents', business community, civil society. (g) <u>Monitoring and Evaluation</u>: (i) Students' evaluation. Standardized and non-standardized tests. (ii) Teachers' evaluations. 	116,200
	Strengthening of the Federal Network for Intercultural and Bilingual Education	<p>Strengthen existing provincial EIB teams Install EIB teams in provinces where they do not exist yet Annual workshops to train provincial and regional teams in 4 years</p>	688,640
Total			5,000,000