Higher Education Development Program (HEDP)

(P161386)

Indigenous People Planning Framework (IPPF)

for Kalash Valley on Local Development Research Projects

April 23, 2019

Higher Education Commission,

Government of Pakistan

Contents

1   Introduction

The proposed project, Higher Education Development in Pakistan (HEDP) supports the implementation of a subset of activities from the Higher Education Commission's Vision 2025, within the broader development framework for Pakistan as envisaged in the Government's Vision 2025. The project will be implemented over a five-year period of 2019/20 – 2024/25. The project is a combination of Investment Project Financing (IPF) and IPF with Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs). The project has five components. Component 1, 2 and 4 are completely results-based financing and funds will be disbursed against agreed Eligible Expenditure Programs (EEPs) on the achievement of DLI targets. Component 3 and 5 are IPF with input-based financing modality on agreed activities.

2   Project Description

2.1   Project Development Objective

To support research excellence in strategic sectors of the economy, improve teaching and learning and strengthen governance, in the higher education sector.

2.2   Project Components

The project has five components. Component 1, 2 and 4 are completely results-based financing and funds will be disbursed against agreed Eligible Expenditure Programs (EEPs) on the achievement of Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLI) targets. Component 3 and 5 are IPF with input-based financing modality on agreed activities.

Component 1: Nurturing academic excellence in strategic sectors (US$126 million)

This component will help promote relevant and cutting-edge research in universities in Pakistan with a focus on specific strategic sectors for socio-economic progress of the country. This will be done through providing competitive research, innovation and commercialization grants to researchers and entrepreneurs.

Sub-component 1.1: Promoting Innovative and Relevant Research

This sub-component will focus on development and support of relevant and cutting-edge research in universities, both private and public, as well as encouraging commercialization of research. The project will do so through the establishment of two competitive funds: (i) mega research grants supporting cutting edge research for solution of specific national challenges which may require multi-disciplinary solutions; and (ii) funds supporting faculty and students with potential industrial prototype solutions and research projects to make them market relevant and industry ready and to support with industry partnerships

The Grand Challenge Fund: will support large and multisectoral/ multidimensional research projects focused on specific themes within sectors of national interest. The proposals eligible for funding would be from the following strategic sectors: (a) Food Security; (b) Water management and sustainability; (c) Sustainable energy; (d) Sociology/philosophy; (e) Development Economics; (f) urban planning; (g) climate change/environment; and (h) IT/telecom (especially, Artificial Intelligence, Cyber Security, Cloud Computing and Big Data); (i) innovative governance and reforms. Within these strategic areas, proposals from consortia of multi-disciplinary researchers/universities can propose research for solutions of a grand challenge.

Technology Transfer Support Fund (TTSF): The TTSF will support promising technological research with an existing prototype or advanced model for industrialization/commercialization. The fund will be open to existing students and faculty members of both public and private universities in partnership with local industry. The TTSF will be targeted to specific sectors including telecommunication, information and technology and its application in health, textile, agriculture and agri-business such as dairy; engineering sciences, microelectronics, water, power, energy and fleet management; biotechnology; and material sciences, for example nano-technology. The support package will be executed through the Offices of Research Innovation and Commercialization (ORIC). If the selected researchers are from a university which does not have an ORIC, HEC's selection committee will assign the research team to work with a functional ORIC within geographical proximity of the research team.

Sub-component 1.2: Encouraging Entrepreneurship and Self-employment

This sub-component will provide a package of support through a seed fund to university students, recent graduates and faculty from both private and public universities. It will provide financial support for commercialization of a product or service, and/or incubation for a start-up. The package will also include entrepreneurial training, legal training and support, financial education and training among other services. The Innovator Seed Fund (ISF) will be implemented and supported through the Business Incubation Centers (BICs) already established and functional within specific universities in Pakistan.

Sub-component 1.4: Local Grant Funds

This fund will encourage the Tier 2 universities/Higher Education Institutes to establish and strengthen their research capacities by competing for research grants for solutions for pressing socio-economic problems within the district or locality that the university is located in. The grant will be open to research addressing any of the seventeen Sustainable Development Goal targets, with a focus on generating or adapting solution to the local district/division level in Pakistan. The Local Challenge Fund will be setup as a matching grant fund with the province contributing to the research grant. The research grants will be selected on merit taking into account the relevance of the research to the local community, industry and local government.

Component 2: Supporting Decentralized Higher Education Institutes for improved teaching and learning *(US$127 million)*

This component aims to improve the quality of education delivered by the Affiliated Colleges (ACs) and tier 2 Affiliating Universities (AUs). The component will support almost 500 public ACs and 32 AUs in improved teaching and learning activities by; (i) strengthening the college affiliation system; (ii) improving the curriculum offered in the ACs via change in the types of degree offered and the roll-out of the Associate Degree program; (iii) support and strengthen the roll-out of 4-year Bachelor program in ACs and AUs; (iii) encourage diversity of students being enrolled and link students and graduates to potential employers within the locality; (iv) improving monitoring and evaluation of the AC system; and (v) connecting ACs to the Pakistan Education Research Network. Three DLIs are associated with this component. They are related to (i) the Quality Enhancement Cells' units dedicated to ACs; (ii) the revision of curriculum; and (iii) the training of AC academic and administrative staff.

Sub-component 2.1: Strengthening the Affiliation System

In order to make the affiliation mechanism more efficient, the project will support interventions for

making affiliating universities (AUs) more pro-active to support ACs and their ACs more responsive to AUs. Activities include the establishment of units in the Quality Enhancement Cells (QECs) of AUs which are dedicated to ACs and the formation of a "change team" in each AC. The AU units and the AC teams will enter into a memorandum of understanding spelling out their respective responsibilities. The project will support the development of new minimum quality standards for both entities.

Sub-component 2.2: Bringing Education in Affiliated Colleges and Affiliating Universities at par with International Standards

The project will support a comprehensive strategy to bring Pakistan's tier 2 universities and ACs at par with international standards. First, it will facilitate the implementation of the HEC's mandate to roll out 4-year Bachelor programs based on a semester/credit structure through a strengthening and revision (as required) of the curricula.

The Bachelor Program has already been rolled out in almost 205 ACs, and will be rolled out in an additional 95 colleges during the life of the project. The project will support these colleges to transition and implement the program. The AU's QEC-ACs will be responsible for providing support to these colleges on a regular basis. Detailed ToRs for the QEC-ACs will be developed and include the description of responsibility towards the ACs.

HEC's vision is also to focus the roll-out of the Bachelor programs in tier-2 universities during the life of the project. While curriculum structure for a large number of programs has already been revised, its implementation needs continuous effort to put faculty staff in a position to implement the new program. The project will support this effort in about 32 Tier 2 universities. In addition, in these 32 AUs, the project will also support provision of integral teaching learning tools such library and reference books, basic laboratory equipment and some minor civil work as needed for effective implementation of a good quality bachelors' program. In addition, the project will support adoption of a gender policy which includes HEC's policy on sexual harassment in these universities.

Second, it will help develop the new 65-68 credit hour semester system Associate Degree (AD) program. The project will support the development of the new 2-year Associate Degree (AD) program, including curriculum framework and specified number of programs. The project will also support the roll-out of the AD programs in approximately 200 colleges through capacity building of faculty and management. The selection of these ACs for AD programs will be done by provincial governments, against criteria defined by HEC. Criteria include, inter alia, selection of at least 50 percent all women colleges. About 21 affiliating universities (AUs) will be involved and have been pre-identified.

The development of AD curricula will reflect the ACs' mission to equip students with mid-level skills and the need to strengthen STEM disciplines. Development of the curricula will include close consultation and engagement of the selected colleges' locality and local socio-economic needs. A need assessment will precede the implementation of an AD program in a specific AC. 33

Finally, it will support capacity development of faculty and management in almost 500 ACs and 32 AUs to implement the Bachelor program and the AD programs effectively. A comprehensive capacity building plan will be rolled out to facilitate the implementation of the revised curriculum and the semester structure of the AD and Bachelor program. In-service training will be provided to established faculty staff and administrative staff. The training of Master Trainers (faculty and management) will be conducted under the umbrella of the National Academy of Higher Education

(NAHE). The Master Trainers trained will impart the further training through their Affiliated Universities' staff development centers.

Sub-component 2.3: Improving the relevance of ACs to support the local socio-economic landscape

The first set of interventions under this sub-component will support and encourage students, in particular girls to enroll in and continue their education within the new 4-year bachelor system; and support women to enter and progress in diversified fields of study such as material sciences and mathematics. The project will support female students and students from disadvantaged backgrounds in transitioning from a 2- year AD degree to a 4-year Bachelor program. This will be done through a bridging semester in the AUs offering the 4-year bachelors' degree - with particular emphasis on STEM disciplines where women are underrepresented allowing students to acquire the academic foundations needed for bachelor studies. At least 50% of the colleges that benefit from these bridge programs will be women colleges.

Second, the sub-component will support monitoring of the learning outcomes of the newly introduced degrees. AC student learning assessment will be piloted in order to measure progress linked to the project activities. In parallel, tracer studies will be conducted to assess the longer-term impact of the activities on the performance of AC students in the labor market.

Finally, the sub-component will support transformation of approximately 20 ACs of the selected 200 to community colleges on a pilot basis. HEC vision 2025 aims to introduce 150 Community Colleges in the country to provide more access and opportunities in academic, technical and vocational trades. These courses would also enable citizens of all ages to pursue diverse programs in order to develop their creative and problem-solving skills. With the project support, HEC intends to introduce 2 to 3 additional subjects of 3 credit hours each focusing on developing market driven technical skills in affiliated colleges offering Associate Degree programs. These courses will be developed as bridging semester/courses for AD to transition into the 4 year Bachelor Program. To support this transformation, 20 ACs will be selected from already targeted 200 colleges for Associate Degrees and provided the requisite curriculum and staff development from HEC, in collaboration with HEDs to implement these bridging programs.

Sub-component 2.4: Connecting Affiliated Colleges to Pakistan Education and Research Network (PERN)

As a part of its commitment to strengthen education and research enhancing connectivity for higher education institutes (supported through component 3 below), HEC will support the expansion of PERN to institutions (particularly affiliated colleges) using 'last-mile' connections. A total of 300 colleges will be added to the existing PERN network. As part of the last-mile connections, the colleges will receive a campus network, using eduroam technology that offers free WiFi to all staff and students. These connections will be created using the existing PERN infrastructure, that has already connected several affiliated colleges in a few provinces. Colleges will be selected based on Request for Proposals (RFPs), with proposals being submitted from the provincial authorities, affiliating universities and colleges. Credentials for college staff and students will be managed by either the affiliating universities or PERN centrally, depending on the level of readiness of the IT units in the relevant universities. A cost sharing agreement to ensure maintenance and running costs for PERN will be worked out between HEC and respective Higher Education Departments (HEDs) to ensure that the services provided under the project are sustained.

Component 3: Equipping Students and Higher Education Institutions with Modern Technology (US$27 m)

Subcomponent 3.1: Improving the policy environment for ICT use

This subcomponent will involve the drafting of a new ICT Strategy that sets out the overall vision on the use of technology, while also reviewing quality assurance and accreditation standards and guidelines to facilitate innovation. The new ICT Strategy will also focus on how PERN can be leveraged to develop blended education content, reflecting on the technology needs (Learning Management Systems (LMS), cloud-services, use of international vs. national bandwidth), as well as on the pedagogical and didactical model underlying the blended learning (flipping the classroom, use of learning outcomes, etc.).

Subcomponent 3.2: Enhancing PERN Activities

PERN is a leased fiber-optic network that connects all universities in Pakistan, providing both an internet connection and online services to facilitate teaching, learning and research. Recently, PERN has launched its new phase called PERN III that will upgrade the last mile of the major universities to 10Gbps whereas the backbone will be upgraded to 40Gbps. Under, PERN-III, the PERN services will also be extended to smaller cities in remote areas to facilitate tertiary education at all levels across the country.

In line with this upgrade, HEC will develop an improved governance system for PERN. This will include allocating more human resources to manage the network, to improve security, and to develop a model to further diversify generation of income to manage and sustain the network. PERN will also professionalize its relationship with the universities, by giving universities more control over their campus networks (e.g. by facilitating more network monitoring and management and creating a measurement station at each Point of Presence or 'PoP'). Building on the Pakistan identity federation servers and its participation in eduGAIN, PERN will improve identity and access management (IAM), by giving universities Identity Provider Status (IDP status), and moving its services (digital library, network measurement, ticketing, CRM platforms, etc.) under this new IAM infrastructure. Finally, PERN will expand its training offer to universities by creating a certified pool of master trainers, which can conduct training programs on a variety of topics related to network management and service offering.

Subcomponent 3.3: Expanding PERN vertically

This sub-component will support the expansion of cloud services (X as a Service or XAAS), leveraging the new IAM infrastructure. PERN will use a platform-approach for cloud services, in line with international standards for NRENs. Some of these cloud services will be offered directly by PERN or by universities connected to PERN, while others can be offered by third parties to the members of PERN. One central cloud service is the expansion of data centers to create storage to enable other cloud services that can be offered through PERN (e.g. storing research data, video-data, student data, etc.). Secondly, PERN will procure a high-performance computing cluster that can be used for research purposes (i.e. big data analytics). A third service is the development of blended learning in universities, through the development of a platform from which universities can establish an LMS.

Component 4: Higher Education Management Information System and Data Driven Services (US$ 70m)

The objective of this component is to improve the collection and usage of data for policy-decisions at national level, while automating business processes in higher education institutions. This subcomponent consists of two main activities. The first activity is the creation of a national level data repository at HEC, which can be used for planning and strategic purposes. The second activity is to digitize and automate the financial and student administration of the universities.

Subcomponent 4.1: HEC Data Repository

To create the data repository, the HEC will design a data system that maps out which kinds of indicators and variables are needed for its planning purposes. The data system will hold key variables (updated up to four times a year) on students, enrolments, staff, financials, and facilities of all universities in Pakistan. The data integrated into this solution is already collected as part of HEC's regulatory work (primarily by Statistics and Finance Units) and is currently available in Excel format. Initially, HEC staff will feed the data into the portal from the existing proformas. Once completed, the portal will be populated through a 'data-loading' tool that will enable Universities to upload information either through excel spreadsheets or through web-services linked to their existing ERP and student lifecycle solutions. The tool will also validate the data in real time so that the integrity and quality of data being uploaded into the portal will be ensured. Business intelligence tool(s) will be used to slice and dice the data in the portal for purposes of data-driven decision making and predictive analytics.

Subcomponent 4.2: Digitization of University Administration

This subcomponent will support an initiative to digitize the administration of universities, which will make university administration more transparent. It will include two sub-activities, (a) to develop a cloud-based enterprise resource planning system (ERP) to manage universities' human resources, finances and procurement tasks and (b) a digital student administration package that manages the student lifecycle process. HEC will identify 10 (ten) universities – of different types and sizes – to act as pilots for implementation of both the ERP and student lifecycle implementation exercise in the first year. The Finance, HR and Procurement activities will be automated using the ERP solution; the admissions, registrar function, alumni relations and student scholarship/aid functions will be automated by the student lifecycle solution. The procurement for the solutions will be carried out by preparing RFP documents that will outline the needs of the universities. Once the solutions are procured, they will be rolled out using the relevant enterprise class implementation methodology. The implementation steps will, typically, include: Project kick off, determination of functional specifications (analysis phase), solution design (configuration and customization), solution delivery (including user acceptance testing), training and rollout of all modules. Once the pilot is successful, this exercise will be repeated for ten universities per year for the next four years.

Component 5: Capacity Building, Project Management, Monitoring and Evaluation (US$50 m)

This component will support HEC in strengthening its core functions of regulation, capacity building and funding of the higher education sector in Pakistan through strategic and targeted technical assistance. In addition, this component will support the technical assistance required for the implementation of various components and subcomponents and for the achievement of results and DLIs. The operational cost of the project management, monitoring and evaluation and the costs of implementing the environment and social safeguard framework will also be covered in this component.

Capacity Building: HEC is developing National Academy of Higher Education (NAHE) as an apex institution under auspices of HEC. The project will support the reinforcement of the Academy's capacity so that it can respond to the challenging mission of upgrading Tier 2 and 3 academic and administrative staff. Additionally, the university partnership/twinning program will create linkages between selected Pakistani and US/international HEIs for strengthening of those Pakistani HEIs in building their capacity.

Regulation of Higher Education Sector: Autonomy in various aspects (academic, staffing, governance, financial) essential for tertiary education institutions to fulfill their missions. Even if universities have substantial autonomy in some important domains, there are several practical limits. HEC envisages to institute an award called 'Responsible University' which will ensure enhanced autonomy to universities demonstrating certain strong governance practices, including inter alia, effective implementation of HEMIS. TA will be utilized to determine the variances within acts and regulations of universities in

Pakistan, and those in the developed economies, and world best practices.

Funding: Public universities have the autonomy to generate their own revenue. However, most Pakistani universities have limited their revenue stream to student fee. HEC will start rigorous work with the universities to initiate and practice all endeavors of alternate funding streams. For this HEC will engage TA to help universities to devise complete marketing, outreach and donor recognition plans; design and execute comprehensive capacity building program for the universities for fundraising and income generation activities; guide universities to develop their 5-10 years strategic plan for fundraising and income generation activities

In addition to the above, this component will also enhance the implementation of various components and sub-components through a comprehensive but targeted set of technical assistance (TA) activities such as support to ORICs and BICs, support to HEC's new directorate for ACs, AU's QEC-AC units and AC's change teams.

This component will support project operating costs such as cost of consultants hired for the implementation of the project supporting the HEC Project Coordination Division, operational cost such as equipment and supervision cost (transportation and per diems). This will support the monitoring and evaluation of the project and verification of the DLI achievement including the hiring and reimbursement of third party verification agency. This component will also allow HEC and provincial governments to undertake or commission studies (including tracer surveys, satisfaction surveys, gender studies) and/or to recruit short term consultants as need unfolds during the project life.

3 LEGISLATIVE, POLICY AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

3.1 Overview

The Constitution of Pakistan1973 does not recognize Indigenous Peoples – even the word 'indigenous' is not found in the Constitution. Hence, there is no particular law to safeguard indigenous people's rights and privileges. The Constitution mentions "minority" several times, but does not reference indigenous peoples. Instead, the federal government emphasizes minorities within Pakistan as religious minorities – not racial or linguistic minorities, or indigenous peoples. According to United Nation High Commissioner for Refugees the Koochis, Rebari, Bakarwal, Kehal, Jogi, Kabootra, Sanyasi and Kalash are indigenous peoples in Pakistan.

Pakistan has voted in favor of the United Nation Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples in 2007. The Declaration provides for all sorts of rights for the indigenous peoples but does not bind the member states to legislate for the rights of indigenous peoples; hence is of limited value to the Indigenous people as far as practical benefits to them are concerned. This limitation has overshadowed any efforts to provide constitutional and legal protection to these vulnerable communities.

Earlier Pakistan had ratified the International Labor Organization (ILO) Convention on Indigenous and Tribal Populations 1957. However, it was later replaced by the ILO Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention 1989 which Pakistan has not yet ratified. Pakistan has signed and ratified some other international human rights instruments, treaties and conventions which are not directly binding towards indigenous and tribal peoples, but they can serve as practical guidance to the Government and concerned institutions on the subject.

The most important of these conventions is the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1966, which Pakistan has ratified with reservations on its Article 3 (equality of men and women) and Article 25 (election to the public posts), as women do not have equal right of testimony and a non-Muslim cannot become President or Prime Minister according to the Constitution of Pakistan. Pakistan did not ratify its Optional Protocol. This Covenant does not mention the indigenous people *per se* but can be used to provide them relief. Given the lack of legal definition for the indigenous peoples in Pakistan, there have always been varying claims by different societal groups. The term "indigenous peoples" has been used interchangeably with tribal peoples, and ethnic and religious minorities.

3.2   Constitution of Pakistan 1973

The equality of citizens, protection of minority groups and freedom of religion in Pakistan is guaranteed by the Constitution of Pakistan, amended in 2012.The constitutional provision regarding minorities implies religious minorities, but over the years it has extended to ethnic minorities and indigenous people.

Article 2 (a) the Objectives Resolution was passed by the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan in March 1949, and was made a substantive part of the Constitution of Pakistan by the Presidential Order No. 14 of 1985, Art. 2 and Sch. item 2 (with effect from March 2, 1985). It guarantees equality of rights to the minorities stating:

The people of Kalash have traditionally practiced subsistence agriculture focused on grain production and livestock rearing. Their diet of cereals and dairy products is supplemented with fruits and nuts from the forests. Component C will integrate them further into the existing cash economy and increase their income.

- Where in the State shall exercise its powers and authority through the chosen representatives of the people ; Where in the principles of democracy, freedom, equality, tolerance and social justice as enunciated by Islam shall be fully observed;

- Wherein adequate provision shall be made for the minorities to [absent in 1985-2010, re-added in 2010] freely profess and practice their religions and develop their cultures; Wherein the territories now included in or in accession with Pakistan and such other territories as may hereafter be included in or accede to Pakistan shall form a Federation wherein the units will be autonomous with such boundaries and limitations on their powers and authority as may be prescribed;

- Wherein shall be guaranteed fundamental rights including equality of status, of opportunity and before law, social, economic and political justice, and freedom of thought, expression, belief, faith, worship and association, subject to law and public morality; Wherein adequate provisions shall be made to safeguard the legitimate interests of minorities and backward and depressed classes;

The Constitution of Pakistan 1973 states that "all citizens are equal before law and are entitled to equal protection of law" under Article 25 (1) of the Constitution. The Fourth Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan was made that became part of the Constitution of Pakistan on November 21, 1975, which decreed the seats for minorities and non-Muslims representation to the government of Pakistan and the Parliament of Pakistan, to protect the minority rights in the country.

There are other beneficial provisions to safeguard and protect minorities in the constitution:

Article 20. Freedom to profess religion and to manage religious institutions: Subject to law, public order and morality: (a) every citizen shall have the right to profess, practice and propagate his religion; and (b) every religious denomination and every sect thereof shall have the right to establish, maintain and manage its religious institutions.

Article 21. Safeguard against taxation for purposes of any particular religion: No person shall be compelled to pay any special tax the proceeds of which are to be spent on the propagation or maintenance of any religion other than his own.

Article 22. Safeguards as to educational institutions in respect of religion, etc.: (1) No person attending any educational institution shall be required to receive religious instruction, or take part in any religious ceremony, or attend religious worship, if such instruction, ceremony or worship relates to a religion other than his own. (2) In respect of any religious institution, there shall be no discrimination against any community in the granting of exemption or concession in relation to taxation. (3) Subject to law: (a) no religious community or denomination shall be prevented from providing religious instruction for pupils of that community or denomination in any educational institution maintained wholly by that community or denomination; and (b) no citizen shall be denied admission to any educational institution receiving aid from public revenues on the ground only of race, religion, caste or place of birth. (4) Nothing in this Article shall prevent any public authority from making provision for the advancement.

Article 28. Preservation of language, script and culture: Subject to Article 251 any section of citizens having a distinct language, script or culture shall have the right to preserve and promote the same and subject to law, establish institutions for that purpose.

Article 36. Protection of minorities: The State shall safeguard the legitimate rights and interests of minorities, including their due representation in the Federal and Provincial services.

3.3   Executive Order for the Protection of Kalash Communities

Prior to 1970s there was a growing trend in Kalash which allowed outsiders to appropriate or mortgage the prime resources of Kalash, the land and trees at a token price. The federal and provincial government realized the seriousness of this issue and the Government of Pakistan passed an executive order in 1974 to redeem Kalash people's land and tress against mortgages. The Government also provided loans to Kalash communities to recover their assets. Government legally forbade the purchase of land or any new construction by outsiders, forcible conversion of any Kalash and cutting of trees by outsiders.

3.4   Kalash and National Database and Registration Authorities

While the Pakistani Government has yet to recognize the Kalash as indigenous peoples, the government did recognize, after much advocacy from Kalash members, the Kalasha as a separate religion in the National Database and Registration Authority in 2015. Kalash can now be listed on government documents requiring religious identification, such as birth certificates. Despite Pakistan's recognition of Kalash by the National Database and Registration Authority, issues that threaten the Kalash's religious identity as indigenous peoples and practicing paganism---such as forced religious conversions to Islam and religious-based discrimination---remain to this day.

3.5   **United Nations Protection for Kalash Cultural Heritage**

Since 2008 the Kalash People's Development Network, a non-governmental organization, has sought protection by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) for Kalash cultural heritage through its inclusion in the Intangible Cultural Heritage list. The National Institute of Folk and Traditional Heritage in Pakistan have been working since the 1980s to preserve Kalash Culture and sponsored a conference on the issue in 2012. In June 2016, UNESCO Islamabad, through the

Convention for Safeguarding the Intangible Cultural Heritage, proposed to add the Kalash to the list. The Committee meets annually to decide on proposals; as of today it has not yet decided whether to add the Kalash to the list.

3.6   International Labor Organization Conventions 107 and 169

The International Labor Organization (ILO) has been working with indigenous and tribal people since 1920. The ILO adopted Indigenous and Tribal People Convention 107 in 1958 with the support of UN system; it was the first international convention on the subject to address the problems of indigenous and tribal people (ITP), which was ratified by 27 countries. This Convention was revised through adoption of Convention 169 in 1989, ratified by 20 countries. The revised ILO Convention 169 is certainly a prominent example of international standard-setting for ITP. Pakistan ratified ILO Convention 107, which is still in force in Pakistan, but it would automatically be denounced if once it ratifies Convention 169. Pakistan reports on its implementation of Convention 107 every 5 years as per its requirements. The ILO Committee of Experts examined ITP situation in Pakistan and drew attention of the Government of Pakistan towards forced labor, health, human rights abuses and land rights. ILO has been working with the Government of Pakistan and ITP partners for the implementation of Convection 107. Their activities involve awareness raising, training of government and ITP representatives, and capacity building on special needs of ITPs.

3.7   United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People

United Nations General Assembly adopted the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People in 2007 on the recommendation of Human Rights Council resolution of 2006. Pakistan voted in favor of this Declaration along with 143 countries. As a General Assembly Declaration it is not a legally binding instrument under international law, but it does "represent the dynamic development of international legal norms and it reflects the commitment of the UN's member states to move in certain directions."

The Declaration sets out the individual and collective rights of indigenous peoples, as well as their rights to culture, identity, language, employment, health, education and other issues. It also "emphasizes the rights of indigenous peoples to maintain and strengthen their own institutions, cultures and traditions, and to pursue their development in keeping with their own needs and aspirations". It "prohibits discrimination against indigenous peoples", and it "promotes their full and effective participation in all matters that concern them and their right to remain distinct and to pursue their own visions of economic and social development". The goal of the Declaration is to encourage countries to work alongside indigenous peoples to solve global issues, like development, multicultural democracy and decentralization. Article 31 of the Declaration emphasizes that the indigenous peoples will be able to protect their cultural heritage and other aspects of their culture and tradition.

3.8   International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Pakistan ratified the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR)in 2008. Under the Convention, Pakistan recognized the "right of everyone to an adequate standard of living for himself and his family, including adequate food, clothing and housing, and to the continuous improvement of living conditions." The commitments made extend to indigenous peoples of Pakistan. UNDRIP further recognizes that rights enshrined in various treaties apply to indigenous peoples.

General Comment no. 21 of the Covenant expands upon the right to take part in cultural life---enshrined in Article 15 of the Covenant---which is especially important to indigenous peoples. It asserts that "cultural rights are an integral part of human rights and, like other rights, are universal, indivisible and interdependent." Key elements of the right to take part in cultural life include: availability; accessibility; acceptability; adaptability; and appropriateness. The General Comment identities communities that require special protection as women, children, older persons, persons with disabilities, minorities, migrants, persons living in poverty, and indigenous peoples. The Comment also states that "the protection of cultural diversity is an ethical imperative, inseparable from respect for human dignity.

3.9   World Bank Policy on Indigenous Peoples- Operational Policy 4.10

The Bank recognizes that the identities and cultures of indigenous peoples are inextricably linked to the lands on which they live and the natural resources on which they depend. These distinct circumstances expose Indigenous Peoples to different types of risks and levels of impacts from development projects, including loss of identity, culture, and customary livelihoods, as well as exposure to disease. Gender and intergenerational issues among indigenous peoples also are complex. The World Bank Operational Policy 4.10 ensures that the development process fully respects the dignity, human rights, economies, and cultures of Indigenous Peoples. For all projects that are proposed for Bank financing and affect indigenous peoples, the Bank requires the borrower to engage in a process of free, prior, and informed consultation, resulting in broad community support to the project by the affected indigenous peoples. All such Bank-financed projects must include measures to:

(i)   Avoid potentially adverse effects on the Indigenous Peoples' communities; or
(ii)   When avoidance is not feasible, minimize, mitigate, or compensate for such effects.

The projects are also designed to ensure that the Indigenous Peoples receive social and economic benefits that are culturally appropriate and gender and inter-generationally inclusive. The policy requirements for the projects to be financed by the Bank that affects indigenous peoples are:

(i)   Screening by the Bank to identify whether Indigenous Peoples are present in, or have collective attachment to, the project area;
(ii)   If, based on the screening, the Bank concludes that Indigenous Peoples are present in, or have collective attachment to, the project area, the borrower undertakes a social assessment to evaluate the project's potential positive and adverse effects on the Indigenous Peoples, and to examine project alternatives where adverse effects may be significant. The breadth, depth, and type of analysis in the social assessment are proportional to the nature and scale of the proposed project's potential effects on the Indigenous Peoples, whether such effects are positive or adverse;
(iii)   A process of free, prior, and informed consultation with the affected Indigenous Peoples' communities at each stage of the project, and particularly during project preparation, to fully identify their views and ascertain their broad community support for the project;
(iv)   The preparation of an Indigenous Peoples Plan or an Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework; and
(v)   Disclosure of the draft Indigenous Peoples Plan or draft Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework.

The World Bank Operational Policy 4.10 on Indigenous People is triggered when a project/sub-project either positively or negatively and directly or indirectly effects the indigenous people's dignity, human

rights, livelihood systems or culture; or affects the territories, natural or cultural resources that they own, use, occupy or claim as their ancestral domain. While the details of subproject interventions---their sites, scale and nature---are unknown at this stage, sufficient information is available to determine that the Policy is triggered and an Indigenous Peoples Plan will be necessary for some of the subprojects. This Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework was prepared alongside Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF), and information about nature and type of subprojects' impacts has been taken from ESMF.

4 INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLANNING FRAMEWORK AND INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN

4.1 Criteria for Indigenous Peoples

For this framework, the World Bank criteria to identify indigenous peoples has been adapted from the World bank's Operational Policy 4.10 on Indigenous Peoples. The Policy states that it does not seek to define the term, indigenous peoples, "because of the varied and changing contexts in which Indigenous Peoples live and because there is no universally accepted definition of 'Indigenous Peoples.'" It continues:

> *Indigenous Peoples may be referred to in different countries by such terms as "indigenous ethnic minorities," "aboriginals," "hill tribes," "minority nationalities," "scheduled tribes," or "tribal groups." For [the] purposes of this policy, the term "Indigenous Peoples" is used in a generic sense to refer to a distinct, vulnerable, social and cultural group possessing the following characteristics in varying degrees:*
>
> *(a) Self-identification as members of a distinct indigenous cultural group and recognition of this identity by others;*
> *(b) Collective attachment to geographically distinct habitats or ancestral territories in the project area and to the natural resources in these habitats and territories.*
> *(c) Customary cultural, economic, social, or political institutions that are separate from those of the dominant society and culture; and*
> *(d) An indigenous language, often different from the official language of the country or region.*

4.2 Rationale for Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework

The Indigenous Kalash people live in three remote mountain valleys named Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir, which are situated in Ayun Union Council of Chitral District in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province. Kalash people consider themselves indigenous; they have been lived in the area for thousands of years, and their distinct language, folklore, and polytheistic religion differentiate them from the other communities in the area who had migrated to Chitral at a later time. The community still relies mainly on their indigenous sources of livelihood including livestock and small-scale cultivation. However, the community does not have a unique source of livelihood as these traditional occupations are shared with other ethnicities and tribes in the region.

The Kalash people have socioeconomic and cultural characteristics of indigenous people as defined by the World Bank Policy on Indigenous People; they are identified as an indigenous community due to

their distinct tribal customs, religion and a unique language. The World Bank Policy on Indigenous People OP 4.10 requires that the borrower prepares and submits, to the Bank, an Indigenous People Planning Framework (IPPF) consistent with the policy prior to project appraisal. A Framework, instead of a Plan itself is prepared at this time, because the zone of impact is roughly known but precise siting alignments cannot be determined. The Framework will guide formulation of a Plan by stipulating all necessary conditions that it needs to satisfy.

4.3 Objectives of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework

The overall objective of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework is to facilitate the subproject's compliance with the requirements specified in the World Bank Operational Policy 4.10 on Indigenous People and to work within the legal framework of Pakistan. In other words, the framework is for designing and implementing a subproject and its Indigenous Peoples Plan in a way that fosters indigenous peoples' dignity, human rights, and cultural uniqueness; they should receive culturally compatible social and economic benefits and not suffer adverse effects during the development process.

The specific objectives of this Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework are to provide:

(i) Policy and legal framework and procedures to plan and manage subprojects in indigenous peoples' areas, in conformity with the World Bank OP 4.10 on Indigenous People as well as applicable local laws and regulations, international laws ratified by the Government of Pakistan and the Environment and Social Management Framework.

(ii) Guidance to project staff and its line department for subprojects selection, screening, socioeconomic assessment; and free, prior and informed consent; and

(iii) Guidance to project staff and its line department staff on preparation and implementation of Indigenous Peoples Plan (IPP) for a subproject in indigenous peoples' areas.

By fulfilling these objectives, the subproject will ensure:(i) participation in the form of informed decision-making of indigenous peoples who are by subprojects, (ii) culturally compatible social and economic benefits to indigenous peoples; (iii) no adverse effects on indigenous peoples by subproject implementation, (iv) active participation of and lead by indigenous peoples in designing, developing, and implementing subprojects, and (v) provision of feedback to indigenous peoples on project implementation, benefits and risks.

4.4 Scope of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework

The application of this Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework is limited to activities under the Higher Education Development Program (HEDP) in three Kalash Valleys, namely Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir. The scope of this Framework is:

- Potential positive and adverse effects of subprojects on the Kalash people;
- Plan for social assessment for sub-projects areas;
- Guidance on obtaining free, prior, and informed consent of the affected Kalash people at each stage of subproject preparation and implementation;
- Institutional arrangements including capacity building, for screening activities supported by subprojects, evaluating their effects on Kalash people, preparing Indigenous Peoples Plans, and addressing any grievances;
- Guidance on monitoring and reporting arrangements, including mechanisms and benchmarks appropriate to each subproject; and
- Disclosure arrangements for Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework and Indigenous Peoples Plan.

4.5 Rationale for Indigenous Peoples Plan

While an Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework lays the operational principles for an Indigenous Peoples Plan (IPP), the latter constitutes directly implementable actions under a subproject to comply with the World Bank Operational Policy on Indigenous Peoples as well as local legislations and international obligations of Pakistan.

4.6 Objectives of Indigenous Peoples Plan

An Indigenous Peoples Plan (IPP) aims at fulfilling the aspirations, needs, and preferred options of the affected indigenous peoples through mitigation of potentially negative impacts, modification of subproject design and development assistance. An IPP takes into consideration the marginalized status of such communities and offers them development options while respecting their socio-cultural distinctiveness. It also aims to strengthen the existing capacity of the affected indigenous community to participate and benefit from project interventions. An IPP must satisfy the following key conditions:

(i) All development plans for indigenous people are based on full consideration of the options and approaches that best meet the interests of individuals and communities affected by the project;

(ii) Scope and impact of adverse effects are assessed, and appropriate mitigation measures identified;

(iii) Subproject takes into account the social and cultural context of affected peoples, and their skills and knowledge relating to local resource management;

(iv) During subproject preparation, formation and strengthening of indigenous peoples' organizations are promoted as well as communication to facilitate their participation in subproject identification, planning, execution, and evaluation;

(v) Where previous experience and knowledge of working successfully with indigenous peoples is lacking, pilot scale operations are carried out and evaluated prior to the execution of full-scale efforts;

(vi) Experienced community organizations, nongovernment organizations, and consultants are mobilized to collect information and knowledge regarding indigenous peoples for preparation of the Plan;

(vii) A responsible agency or consulting firm formulates IPP implementation schedule, which will be periodically monitored by the project management units as well as an independent or external monitoring agency; and

The responsible agency prepares a budget for IPP implementation and a financing plan to ensure smooth progress.

5 Methodology for Preparation of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework

5.1 Documents Review

The Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework for the proposed project was prepared based on information from the IPPF available for two recently developed projects, namely KP Integrated Tourism Development Project and KP Irrigated Agriculture Improvement Project. This IPPF uses the baselines

established by these two Projects for the Kalash Valley, and the consultations carried out on issues and challenges Kalash people face in the realm of livelihood, culture, community development, and other areas as specified under the UN SDG Framework.

5.2 KP Integrated Tourism Development Project

The WB and the GoKP are collaborating in the province's economic development since year 2010 through the KP/FATA/Balochistan Multi Donor Trust Fund (MDTF). Some resources under the Additional Financing (AF) of Economic Revitalization of KP and FATA (ERKF), have been allocated to support competitiveness of KP's tourism sector. To build upon the initial support to DoT and the sector, the WB and GOKP are developing the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Integrated Tourism Development Project using International Development Association (IDA) resources. In addition, GOKP is investing funds from ADP in several activities for developing the tourism sector. The additional financing will complement those activities by supporting the tourism sector1.

The project involves several activities that aim at development of tourism in project sites and consists of four components which are as follows:

   i.   Tourism Sector & Tourism Value Chains
   ii. Infrastructure Development
   iii. Institution Building for Destination Management and Implementation of Regulatory Reforms
   iv. Project Management

The project may have some interventions in Kalash Valley for tourism enhancement. This may include development of rest area along Ayun-Kalash valley road, infrastructure development and enterprise development, etc. As the development intervention may have some impacts on the Kalash People (which are considered indigenous), therefore, as per World Bank Policies, their rights, identity and culture have to be protected from any negative impacts of the project. To implement the project, two Project Management Units (PMUs) under DoT and Communication and Works (C&W) Department have been created.

5.3 KP Irrigated Agriculture Improvement Project

Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has reached an agreement with the World Bank to develop a broad program for economic development in the province with financial assistance from the World Bank: the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Irrigation Agriculture Improvement Project. It consists of three components: on-farm water management infrastructure; on-farm water management techniques; and agriculture.

The tentative project cost is estimated at approximately USD182 million, of which the World Bank would finance up to USD130 million from the International Development Association. The project will contribute to the development of the agriculture sector through addressing: (i) water management as an important and limiting factor to productivity and overall production; and (ii) training and technology for improving productivity, post-harvest management and value addition. It will support six key priority areas in the government strategy for the sector: (i) improving performance of the delivery system and reducing water wastages; (ii) making water distribution equitable; (iii) increasing financial sustainability of the irrigation system management; (iv) increasing climate resilience; (v) increasing productivity and promoting high value agriculture(production, processing and marketing); and (iv) strengthening the relevant department for improved service delivery and governance. The project has identified Kalash Valleys, where indigenous people called Kalash reside, as some of the possible intervention areas.

---

[1] Project Appraisal Document ERKF

Following sections have been reproduced from the IPPF of the two mentioned Projects above:

6   Socioeconomics and Culture of Kalash

6.1 Overview

Pakistan is a country of varied geography and environment as well as diverse ethnic groups having with particular subcultures. Kalash Valley is situated in the northwestern area of Pakistan, whose mountains, springs, rivers, and snowy hills render it very scenic, are home to more than 2,500 people called Kafirs or Kalashi. They are considered unique due to their culture, language and religion, and are well-known to ethnographers and linguists around the world.

The Kalash people currently live in three valleys of Kalash---Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir---and are an ancient pagan tribe which is recognized as Kafir-Kalash. There are different thoughts about the foundation of Kalash people. Some believe that the soldiers from the Alexander the Great who settled in Chitral are the progenitors of Kalash. Others believe that they are indigenous to Asia and migrated from the Nuristan area of Afghanistan. Yet others believe that their ancestors migrated from a remote region in Afghanistan. According to the third hypothesis, the people came to Chitral from Afghanistan the 2nd century B.C, and ruled over Chitral in the 10th century A.D.

Lately, more and more changes are observed in the life of Kalash due to increasing influences of nearby regions. The Kalash of Birir follow the traditions more faithfully according to their religion, as compared to Kalash of Bumburet and Rumbur. The Kalash have their own religion, which is described by some as a kind of ancient Hinduism combined with animistic beliefs, but many of them have converted to Islam. The Kalash tend to live in the mountainous areas above their agricultural lands, whereas the Muslims tend to live near the rivers or on the agricultural lands. Both groups may live together in the same village, or even as a family.

6.2 Kalash Population

According to the 2017 census report, Ayun Union Council has 27 villages with total population of 28,182 individuals and 3,983 households. The average household size is 7.07. The information specific on Kalash was provided by Ayun and Valleys Development Program of the Local Support Organization (LSO)[2] which completed census in the three valleys in October- November 2018; there are 523 households and 4,178 people in the three valleys (Table6.1).

Table 6-1 Kalash Population Details in Kalash Valleys (Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir)

Name of Valley	Name of Village	Number of Kalash Households	Number of Kalash Persons
Bamburet	Palawanandeh	15	120
	Ahmad Abad	03	24
	Anish	62	496
	Broon/ SarokJall	58	464

---

[2]Local Support Organization (LSO) is an alliance or federation of Village and Women Organizations and other village-based institutions and self-help groups, which are primarily formed at the Union Council level and in some cases at valley or watershed levels in Northern Areas and Chitral.

	Batrik	16	128
	Krakal	60	480
Total		**214**	**1712**
Rumbur	Koldesh	09	72
	Chet Kuru/ Baladesh	15	120
	Groom	41	328
	Bateht	20	160
	Kalash Gram	24	192
	Balang Kuru	65	520
Total		**174**	**1392**
Birir	Sandik	15	120
	Oruli	08	64
	Gurul	18	144
	GrambetGool	42	336
	Asper	19	152
	Beshal	06	42
	Guz Kuru	03	24
	Gree/ XhagharGool	06	48
	Bihal	18	144
Total		**135**	**1074**
Grand Total		**523**	**4178**

Source: Census of Ayun and Valleys Development Programme2018

6.3 Language

The Northern Pakistan, a mountainous area where the Kalash Valleys are located, is characterized by high linguistic diversity. Most languages in the area belong to the Indo-European language family, but to different branches of this family: Dardic, Iranian and Indic languages. The three branches are sometimes dealt with together as Indo-Iranian languages. Like many languages in the southern Himalaya, Kalasha is a Dardic language; the Dardic branch is close to Indic languages in the Indo-Iranian branch and known for considerable differences among its languages. Many Kalasha speakers know Khowar, another Dardic language used in the region in interethnic contacts, and Urdu, a national language of Pakistan, of the Indic branch of Indo-European languages.

There is some discussion of whether Kalasha is historically related to Greek. It is true that both Kalasha and Greek are part of the Indo-European language family, and thus distantly related, having an ancestor language spoken 8,000 years ago. However, Greek and Dardic languages are so distantly related that the mutual intelligibility is close to zero. Kalasha is hardly more closely related to other Indo-European languages---such as, English, Spanish or Russian---than to Greek or Bulgarian. Some of the proposed closer similarities between Greek and Kalasha go back to Proto-Indo European, whereas others do not stand up to the standards of comparative linguistics.

6.4 Kalash Women

No matter in what situation they are the Kalash people greet each other with a friendly smile and kiss on each other's hands, the Kalasha way. Despite the harsh environment and rather Spartan way of living---their only fuel being the wood they have to cut and carry on their back---their life is a constant festival. Apart from the religious celebrations held in all four seasons of the year, there is always a social event for them to celebrate and have a good time: A birth of a baby, a six-year-old child entering the Kalasha

society (*Butt sanbiyek*) or a wedding or even a funeral is an occasion for dancing, singing, playing the drum and drinking wine. In short, they enjoy life.

The primary role in the social and cultural life is played by the Kalasha women. Unlike the male members of the community, a Kalash woman wears her headdress and her costume no matter where she is and whatever she is engaged in. She always looks stylish and clean and extremely meticulous with her appearance. On special occasions, such as the spring festival (*Zhoshi*), for example, she would paint her face with a cream made from burnt goat horn and butter, which also has healing effects. She would also make up her face and eyes with different color paints. A Kalasha woman's dress consists of *cew,* the woven woolen dress, and *piran*, the machine made cotton dress. For hundreds of years the Kalasha women had been wearing a black woolen garment, all woven by hand. The headdresses come in two types: *shushut* and *kupas*. The *shushut* is a ring around the head from which a 'tail' hangs down the back. It is less formal than the *kupas* and is worn every day all day long and it is taken off only when the woman goes to bed or when in mourning. The *pat'I* is a long belt made of woven woolen or cotton for women with borders and long fringes. It is wound around the hips, letting the *piran* hang loose and baggy.

All Kalasha females from puberty up to the end of menstruation are considered unclean, especially during their menstruation period and at childbirth. During those times, they must go and stay in the *bashali*, an isolated house usually outside the village and in some villages near the cemeteries. This seclusion results in many restrictions in their daily life and participation in religious rites and festivals. It may even pose danger to their health and life as is the case with similar customs in Western Nepal.

6.5 Access to Education and Official Documentation

Many Kalash children attend primary school, and some attend secondary school and university. In August 2012, there were nine Kalasha primary schools, funded partly or fully by non-profit organizations, including the Aga Khan Foundation. In Kalasha schools, children are taught in the Kalasha language and learn about their religion and culture. There is not enough space at the private Kalasha schools, however, for all of the Kalasha children of primary school age. Nearby primary schools run by the government of Pakistan are not taught in the Kalash language, but in Urdu and English. For secondary education, only the government-run schools are available in the region; they do not teach in the Kalasha language or about Kalasha religion and culture, and have mandatory Islamic studies as part of the curriculum.

Such situation goes against the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, which Pakistan voted in favor of. According to the Declaration, indigenous peoples have the right to education in their language. They also have the right "to establish and control their educational systems and institutions providing education in their own language, in a manner appropriate to their cultural methods of teaching and learning." Further, indigenous children have the right to all levels of state education.

6.6 Economy

The Kalasha economy is based on agriculture which is mostly women's work, and transhumant animal husbandry, which takes the men and their flocks to the lower pastures for winter and then to high mountain pastures in summer. The crops grown are maize, wheat, and beans on small irrigated fields. Fruits and nuts, such as walnuts, grapes, apples, pears, apricots, mulberry, are also grown in Bumburet and Rumbur Valleys. Together with mushrooms gathered in the forests, they are sold outside the communities for cash income.

Goats are not only the main animal herded, but they are considered as a gift of the gods. Men must not let them become unclean through women or be possessed by demons. Kalasha agriculture, despite its use of the plough, is dependent upon highly labor-intensive techniques of hoeing, weeding and watering by women, as well as regular manuring with goat dung by men.

Previously wealth was measured in livestock and crops, but the Kalash people have recently begun to move towards a cash economy, triggered by the influx of tourists in the area. To cater to these new visitors, small stores and guest houses have been established, providing new luxury for visitors of the valleys. Tourism now makes up a large portion of the economic activities of the Kalash. Other communities in the region have developed more complex economic systems with links to regional markets and are better off than the Kalash. **The Pakistani government levies a toll to persons who enter the Valleys, whose purpose is to collect funds for assisting the Kalash people in preservation of their culture.**

6.6.1   Non-Timber Forest Products

Kalash Valleys are located in the remote southwestern part of Chitral District and are gifted with unique biological diversity. The natural forests of the area mainly consist of chlghozapine (*Pinus gerardiana*), deodar (*Cedrusdeodara*) and broad leaf species like oak (*Quercus incana*). Some of the important non-timber forest products in Bumburet Valley are mushrooms, honey, medicinal plants, pine nuts, silk cocoons and other equally valuable products. The people rely on their indigenous knowledge for collection, packing and drying of these forest products. Most of the local people are dependent on the following products for income generation and also for their own everyday needs.

6.6.1.1. Wild Nuts and Fruits

Pine nuts: Chilgoza (*Pinus gerardianana*) is found in the small patches of southern Chitral at elevation ranging from 1,800 m to 3,500m. It is associated with deodar (*Cedrusdeodara)* and blue pine (*Pinus willichiana*) at higher elevation, and oak (*Qarecus ilex*) at lower elevation. The pine nuts are called nuts, but are biologically seeds. They are collected from the green cones by climbing the trees; sometimes the people remove all the cones from the tree, prohibiting natural regeneration. In past, the nuts were consumed at home or gifted to friends and guests. During the recent years, they have been traded outside the community and have become an important source of cash income to the local population.

Walnuts: Walnut (*Juglans regia*) kernels are a favorite nut in Kalash Valleys. In order to improve the livelihood of Kalash people through walnut production, a project to redempt mortgaged walnut trees was launched in 1984-1995 by the Deputy Commissioner of Chitral. The project aimed at returning the ownership right of Kalash people over their ancestral walnut trees purchased by their Muslim neighbors. A second phase of the project followed in 1997-2003. It gave confidence to the Kalash community in improving their own economy.

Mulberries: Mulberry is a fast growing, deciduous woody perennial plant. The fruits are collected for domestic uses and commercial purposes. Mostly women and children collect the fruits, who often eat on the spot. The dried fruits are sold in the local markets. Mulberry wood is used for making agriculture tools and furniture. The mulberries trees are vanishing from the Valleys due to inattention.

Wild pomegranate: Dried seeds of wild pomegranate (*Punicagranatum*), locally known as *anar dana*, are widely used in cooking to develop a sour taste in dishes. They also have medicinal properties. The

tree grows naturally in sub-mountainous tracts of the country from 900 to 1,800 m. An average tree yields 15 to 25 kilograms of fresh fruit.

Russian olives: Olive trees grow near the water channel and agriculture land. The fruits are collected by children who often eat on the spot. Olives are consumed at home. The community members consider olives profitable products but very rare in the Valleys. If proper assistance is provided, it would be an additional support to their livelihood.

Medicinal Plants: Medicinal plants continue to be extensively used as major source of drugs for the treatment of many health disorders all over the world, and Kalash Valleys are not an exception. Many endemic and economically important medicinal plants are known in the area. Medicinal plants are valuable health products and also an important source of income for the local people.

6.6.1.2   Other Food Products

Honey: Honey collected from traditional bee hives is an important source of nutrition and income for the dwellers of Kalash Valleys. Traditionally, bees are reared in wall hives (*kator*) fixed to house walls. According to Kalash mythology, the honey (*Ushniru)* means cleanliness. The Kalash faith forbids the women from touching the wall hives and their honey, but they may touch and eat honey extracted from wild.

Mushrooms: Variety of edible mushrooms are found in Kalash Valleys: *quchi, brangalu*and *shunti*in the local language. A person who finds mushrooms is often referred to by the local people as "the luckiest person." Local people are secretive of where the mushrooms are found. The Kalash community has their own indigenous knowledge for mushroom collection. Morels are collected in Kalash Valley for sale to the outside communities for income generation, but they are occasionally used as traditional medicine and a flavoring agent. Morel collection is usually a part-time activity besides farming and livestock keeping for poor villagers.

Cumin seeds: Cumin seeds are a perennial herb with thick tuberous roots. It grows wild in dry temperate regions of the country. The plant is known locally as *hojo* and is widely used to flavor bread, biscuits, cakes and cheese. It is also an ingredient of nine pickling spices. In addition, the herb is a stomach soothing medicine, occasionally used for flatulent colic and as an adjutant or corrective for other medicines. The fruit is collected before ripening. The plants are dried and fruits are thrashed, cleaned, and stored in bags.

6.6.2 Animals Products

Silk Cocoons: The Kalash women have largely been involved in rearing of silk worm (*Bombox mori*), since long through traditional means.

6.6.3 Timber Products

Branches of wild almond and willow: The Kalash are very professional in making of *vesku* (a big basket used for carrying fire woods and walnuts as well as for shifting of organic fertilizer) from the young branches of wild almond (*Prunus amygadulus),* locally called *kandu*. Every household keeps one or more *vesku*treein their yards. Willow is also used to prepare various types of products, such as baskets, trays, grain bins and decoration products, which have attracted the attention of tourists. However, they are not commercially available.

Walnut bark: Particularly the women frequently use the stem bark of walnut (*muswak*), as it imparts a pinkish color to the lips. Removal, however, injures the tree. In extreme cases, the trees are killed. Occasionally small amount of *muswak* appear in the local market for sale.

Timber: Obtaining torchwood by hollowing the tree bottom, as observed in Hazara and other part of the province, is not practiced in Chitral. In Kalash Valleys, the entire tree is felled and converted into torchwood. The preferred species for torchwood are Chilgoza (*Pinus gerardianana*), kail(*Pinus wallichiana*) and deodar(*Cedrus deodara*).

6.7 Main Festivals

The Kalash celebrate five festivals in a year. For each one, they prepare food, offer sacrifices on altars to please the gods, and dance in their traditional ways for a week. The religious rituals are executed according to the Kalash mythology, with high regards to supernatural beings. The festivals are as follows:

Chilim-Jusht : *Chilim-Jusht* is one of their biggest festivals, celebrated during May 13 - 16. This spring festival is to ask for the gods' blessing on the herds and crops.

Utchal: *Utchal*is their second festival and is celebrated during August 18 - 21. The festival is meant for enjoying summer and the peak season of dairy products.

Phoo: There is no fixed date for this autumn festival, because it depends on the ripening of the crops and fruits; usually it is in mid-October. This festival also celebrates the return of the livestock herds from the pastures.

Chaumos: *Chaomos* in celebrated between December 8 and December 21: one of the biggest festivals in Kalash culture. The purpose of the festival is to offer sacrifices to the grand Kalash god, *Mahandeo*.

Rot-Not: *Rot-Not* is a festival that takes place during June 21 to August 21.Young women and men meet in special places in the valleys to sing and dance. It culminates at the *Utchal* festival.

6.8 Spiritual Lakes

The following three lakes are considered important for the Kalash.

Lake Bahuk: This Lake is located between Bumburet and Rumbur Valleys and known as a holy lake of the Kalash ancestors. The turquoise hued glacier-lake is located at the altitude of 4,000 meters, surrounded by an amphitheater of rough peaks. The view of Tirich Mir, one of the world's highest mountains, from Lake Bahuk is well known. The Kalash believe that this is the place where their souls reside after their death. The area is famous amongst both the Kalash and the Muslim Kho community as the resting place of fairies.

Lake Awazak: Lake Awazak is situated in the southwest of Bumburet Valley, on the border of Pakistan and Afghanistan, more than 12 hours of trekking from the settlements. It is believed that when an ill-fortuned person looks into the lake, the water will look blood red, a likely bad omen foreboding his or her death. The flora around the lake attracts shepherds for grazing.

Lake Shawal: The Lake is located in the south of Bumburet Valley and between high peaks and glaciers. A path form the lake to Nuristan (Afghanistan) exists.

6.9 Spiritual Places

The Kalash holy places are very much revered by the people. The list below includes places for other purposes determined by the custom.

Malosh: The places where the Kalash people offer sacrifices to their gods are called *malosh*. Holy places are not found in every village. The famous Malosh are in Batrik, Krakal, Birir, Ramboor and Gromun.

Jastakan: *Jastakan* is a large hall bedecked by effigies as well as animal figures. Rituals are performed at a *jastakan* at the time of birth, death, and festival.

Bashali: *Bashali*is a Kalash house for secluded women, which is located close to watercourses in every village. Men are not allowed to enter into these houses.

Madokjal: *Madokjal*is a Kalash burial ground. In the past, a dead body was placed in a wooden box and in the open air. For reasons unknown, they have recently shifted to burying the coffins.

Charsu: One of the places used by young women and men during the *Rot-Not* festival in summer for singing and dancing.

6.10   Identity, Rights and Voice

Kalasha have survived centuries of subtle and elaborate onslaughts on their culture which included recent invasions from Afghanistan. They suffered greatly from the invasion; they were assaulted, and their cattle were forcibly taken away. The Kalash have endured more hardship than other minorities because they are non-Muslims and very few in number; they could never become the core concern of policy makers and political parties dealing with the issues of rights of various communities. The Kalash people embody one of the oldest traditions and cultures in the world, but their socioeconomic and political systems that are not aligned with the modern society make them extremely vulnerable. They do not have enough means to manage and control their fate.

The scenic beauty of the area coupled with the uniqueness of Kalash culture attracts a large number of domestic tourists who are not trained to respect the culture. Such tourism and related market forces can destroy the local culture and their way of living. Even before the development of tourism, non-Kalasha preachers have been trying to change their belief system.

As prevailing legal, social and economic systems are not sensitive to their unique cultural needs, hardly any constitutional safeguards are available to protect them. The national government yet needs to give them security, restore their confidence by treating them as a special case, put safeguards in place to protect their identity and create conditions in which they could practice their culture and living without fear. In order to ensure political representation, the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa designated a separate seat for the Kalash in the Provincial Assembly in 2018.

7   STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATIONS UNDER KP IRRIGATED AGRICULTURE PROJECT (KPIAP)

Three indigenous communities, one each in Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir Valleys, were consulted for preparing of the Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework for KPIAP. Each community is made up of clusters

of households that are ethnically, linguistically, and culturally homogenous. Under the leadership of village chiefs and *Qazi* (traditional/religious leaders whose jurisdictions cover several villages), communities follow their own traditional social hierarchies. Everyone in the three communities speaks the Kalash language, while a few speak Urdu---the official language of Pakistan---and some speak Khowar---the Chitrali language.

Information was gathered from farmers through focus groups discussions, based on the questionnaires in Annex A, on 24 November 2018 in Bumburet and Rumbur Valleys and on 25 November 2018 in Birir Valley. The topics included irrigation, agriculture, livestock, forestry, and culture. The participants were informed of the objectives of the consultation, the project components and the concept of free, prior and informed consent (Annex A). Key informant interviews were conducted with eminent and influential members of the community and non-Kalash people, including government officers on irrigation, on-farm management, agriculture and livestock for the Chitral District.

7.1 Focus Group Discussions in Anish Village - Bumburet Valley

A discussion was held with a mixed group of 16 women and 15 men.

7.1.1 Major Food Items

The major food items grown or collected by the villagers are: wheat, maize, kidney beans, walnuts, grapes, apples, pears, apricots, and mulberries. Maize is sown after April 20, and wheat during September 25- November10. In most cases the fruit and nut trees are scattered on the roadside, in the fields, around the houses and in the foothills. Women also practice kitchen gardening.

Crops grown and fruits and nuts gathered are mostly for home consumption, and excess is sold in the market. Since the majority of the farmers are subsistence farmers, they are hardly able to sell any produce in the market. It was that: "the tourists pick fruit without permission, but due to our hospitable nature we are unable to object to this practice. Only 1% of tourists or less pays us for the fruit they pick."

7.1.2 Irrigation

The main source of irrigation water are the irrigation canals, which have been in use since many generations ago. The canals are fed with snowmelt and spring, with respective contribution of 60% and 40%. Wheat is given water five to six times per season, whereas maize is irrigated seven times. There are huge water losses from the irrigation system, and the water hardly reaches the fields; the available water is insufficient for what they would like to grow.

7.1.3 Forests

The forests are maintained by the government, but the locals are allowed to take the cattle to forests for grazing, and collect morels and fuel wood. These tasks are undertaken by men. The government discourages cutting small plants and trees.

Morels fetch a price of PKR 12,000 per Pao. (1 Pao is equal to 250 grams); the last 5 years have been bad for morel business. Cedar, chestnut and pine trees are used as fuel wood, and cedar is used for construction. The price of cedar in market is: PKR 450-500 per square feet.

7.1.4 Irrigation

Livestock plays an important role in the economy of the people of Bumburet valley. It provides livelihood and income generating opportunities to the majority of the local population, although sale of animals and their parts is limited. They assume that they will have to become hire hands if traditional ways of livestock keeping becomes impossible for some reason.

The animals kept are: bulls, sheep, goats and cows. Separate grazing areas are identified for every village, and goats and sheep are taken to high altitude for grazing. Livestock is source of milk, meat, ghee, butter and cheese for their daily consumption. Horns and skin are also utilized. The male members of the community are responsible for animals' grazing, while women are responsible for milking. Cows and goats are considered potential items that could increase their income through sale of cheese, butter, milk and ghee, but hindered by diseases, lack of vaccination facility, unavailability of fodder (especially in snow period) and government assistance.

People are not aware of the link between animal diseases and sickness among people. Water availability affects livestock keeping, because pastures are dependent on water. Excessive snowfall negatively affects water availability and accessibility.

Goat meat and cheese are usually used also for funerals, marriage ceremonies and in other festivals. The community members help each other by contributing animals for funerals. Goats are considered a gift from the gods, and hence sacred. Only men are allowed to go to the place where goat is sacrificed and offer prayers. After the prayers they come back home with the meat. One of the famous festivals involve bull fights.

7.2 Focus Group Discussions with Women in Anish Village - Bumburet Valley

A group of 14 women in Anish Village were asked about field irrigation, crop cultivation and livestock rearing. The discussions revealed that women are heavily involved in agriculture and livestock activities. From sowing to harvesting and storage, the Kalasha women play a key role in growing staple crops including maize, kidney beans, and wheat. It is predominantly the women's responsibility to manually prepare the soil during the sowing season as well as perform weeding and pest management activities. Similarly, with the exception of grazing the livestock in the forests, a task mostly reserved for men in the Kalasha culture, women are the primary custodians of livestock keeping activities including, housing, rearing, and feeding.

The major concerns of the women were as follows. Most households have a small piece of land; any assistance from the government or an NGO to level the land will result in higher yields. A great quantity of fruits is wasted, because no processing or storage facility exists. The government should take action against the shortage of fodder during winter.

Women think that trainings on skill development outside the fields of agriculture and livestock can create more economic opportunities. They lament the paucity of opportunities to sell their handicrafts and dresses.

They also reported that no health facilities exist, although they are needed. Tourists' behavior toward Kalash women is not appropriate, and security measures are required. Women are also being forced to convert to another faith.

7.3 Focus Group Discussions in Groom Village - Rumbur Valley

A discussion was held with a group of 9 men; no women were present.

7.3.1 Major Food Items

The major food items grown or gathered by the villagers are: wheat, maize, kidney beans, pine nuts, walnuts, grapes, apples, pears, apricots, and mulberries. Wheat and maize are grown on a rotation basis. Maize is sown during April 25-May 25 and wheat during September 25- November 10.Women also practice kitchen gardening and grow potatoes, tomatoes, and onions.

Pine nuts are a big source of income, as most of them are sold. Other crops and fruits are grown or gathered mostly for home consumption. The majority of the farmers are subsistence farmers; they have hardly any produce to sell in the market other than the pine nuts, which have a big market demand. Pine nuts are harvested in October and fetch PKR 2,200-2,400/kg, while the price of a sac containing the pine cones is PKR 14,000/80kg.

7.3.2 Irrigation

The main source of irrigation water is the irrigation canals which have been in use since many generations ago. The main source of canal water is snowmelt (20%) and spring (80%).Various NGOs have helped the villagers in the past to maintain the irrigation system: Agha Khan Rural Support Program, Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund and Community Driven Local Development Program (funded by the European Union). The situation is similar with the village in Bumburet Valley: water leaks from the system and insufficient water on the field.

7.3.3 Forests

Men take the cattle to forests for grazing, and also collect morels, honey, and fuel wood. Morels and honey are collected in March and April. Since it is troublesome to harvest pine nuts and honey, the farmers chop down the entire branches, which is highly damaging to the trees. According to the local belief, a thunder in the sky is a sign of morels bursting in the forest. Forests are major sources of the local livelihood, but the Forest Department is involved in the illegal trade of timber, which must be stopped.

7.3.4 Livestock

Just as in Bumbret Valley, the Kalash in Rumbur Valley think that their culture would not survive if traditional livestock keeping becomes impossible, as they are important in their socioeconomic life. One of the famous festivals also involve bull fights. The villagers will need to seek employment elsewhere for their living. The animals are kept for milk, animal parts (meat, skin, horns) as well as for use with carriages. Goats, sheep, cows, bull, horses and asses are raised, and about half of animal-related production is sold. Income increase is possible by selling cheese, milk, butter and ghee from goats, sheep and cattle, but is limited by lack of water, fodder, vaccination and government assistance.

Pastures are about 10-12 km away from the village. The available grazing area is limited in size, but well defined. Skin diseases can be transmitted from livestock to people. Water scarcity affects livestock, as fodder and pasture are diminished.

7.4 Focus Group Discussions in GrambetGool Village - Birir Valley

A discussion was held with a group of 15 men; no women were present.

7.4.1 Major Food Items

The major food items grown and gathered in the area are: wheat, maize, kidney beans, barley, vegetables, pine nuts, walnuts, grapes, apples, pears, apricots, and mulberries. Women also practice kitchen gardening and grow potatoes, tomatoes, and onions, just as in Rumbur Valley. The beans and maize are sown in June, wheat in November, and vegetables in April and May. The main source of sustenance is cultivated crops. While fruits and nuts from the trees---walnuts, grapes, apples, mulberry and pears---help them survive throughout the year.

7.4.2 Irrigation

The main source of irrigation water is the irrigation canals, which carry snowmelt like other in two valleys. Several NGOs helped in the past to maintain the irrigation system: Agha Khan Rural Support Program, Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund and *Community-Driven Local Development Program* (funded by the European Union). The situation with the irrigation system is exactly like in other valleys: water losses from the infrastructure, and consequently insufficient water for the crops.

7.4.3 Forest

The forests are maintained by the government, but the locals are allowed to take the cattle to forests for grazing and collect morels and fuel wood. These tasks are for men.

7.4.4 Livestock

The livestock are so important to the Kalash in Birir Valley, just like in other two valleys that they will have to seek new livelihood, such as working as hired hands or start a small business, if traditional livestock keeping becomes impossible. Bulls, cows, goats, sheep and donkeys are kept for milk, meat, horns and skin. Sale of these items is very limited, but income increase may be possible if cheese, milk, butter and ghee from cows and goats could be sold. The obstacles to such scheme are: diseases; lack of vaccination facility; lack of fodder, especially in snowy season; and lack of government assistance.

Goats and sheep are taken to the forest for grazing. Separate grazing areas are identified for every village and in some cases for individuals. Government forests are considered communal grazing grounds. People have observed that skin diseases are transmitted from livestock to people, especially children. When water is not available sufficiently, it affects livestock through unsatisfactory growth of rangeland grasses.

7.5 Focus Group Discussions in the Three Valleys - Methods of Agriculture

At the time of land preparation, women dig holes in the field and fill it with ash to strengthen the soil. The current practice is to use local fertilizer such as animal waste. Some households do not own any cattle, and hence, do not have access to such fertilizer.

When maize is 5-6 inches high, women manually dig the field to soften the soil and remove the weed around the crop for better yield. This is quite a laborious process as it takes 3-4 women a month to treat

1 jareeb of land(1 jareeb is equivalent to 0.08 kanal, and 1 kanal to 510 m^2). Wheat and maize are grown on crop rotation basis in Bumburet and Bibir Valleys.

People who can afford pesticides also try to avoid them, but it controls pests and bring better yields. When maize is 3-4 feet high, pest attacks are frequent. On such occasions, instead of using pesticide which most of the locals cannot afford, women smoke the fields by burning goat horns, herbs, plastic, animal waste, and worn out shoes, etc. to repel insects. The farmers in Rumbur believe that smoking the fields is more effective than pesticides.

7.6 Focus Group Discussions in the Three Valleys – Division of Labor and Mobility of Women

Some tasks are assigned to either women or men, but many are undertaken by both. In the past, agriculture activities were women's responsibilities, but more men are participating of late.

Men are responsible for taking animals to the forests or to grazing areas. It is mostly men's responsibility to fetch fodder from the forests, but assistance is given by women. Women collect woods from locations close to the villages, and men do so from locations further away.

Both women and men collect fruits, mushrooms and nuts from the forests and their own fields. Their storage and maintenance are the responsibility of women. The women are involved in rearing of silk worm. Cooking, sewing, knitting, and child rearing is the sole responsibility of the women. They also create from willow trees various types of crafts, such as baskets, trays, grain bins and items for decoration. Women engage in weaving and embroidery as well.

When going outside the valleys, women have to be accompanied by male relatives. They can move in groups within the valleys. It is known that all Kalasha women must stay in the *bashali*, an isolated house usually outside the village and in some villages near the cemeteries, during menstruation and childbirth when they are considered particularly unclean. This seclusion results in many restrictions in their daily life.

7.7 Focus Group Discussions in the Three Valleys –Social Cohesion

Some Kalash people have converted to Islam, but they live in communal and social harmony. With the exception of a few ceremonies, which the Muslims do not attend due to religious beliefs, Kalash celebrations are attended by all.

7.8 Key Informant Interviews

Key informant interviews were held with the eminent and influential members of the community as well as non-Kalash persons. The concerns expressed by one informant were also shared by others, and their demands with respect to the project also formed a unified view. They requested that the government pay attention to the Kalash community and provide assistance to them in crop agriculture and livestock. Intrusions across the international borders and tourists are great nuisance to them. They also want protection of their graveyards and other sacred sites. It was recommended that land acquisition be avoided, as the land available for agriculture is already too small. Deforestation was another major concern.

Other requests not directly related to the project were**: provision of educational, health, and water and sanitation facilities; construction of access road; provision of protection measures against interference**

from the Muslim community regarding conversion; construction of new worship places. The details of the interviews are given in Annex B of KPIAP IPPF.

8 STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATIONS UNDER KP INTEGRATED TOURISM DEVELOPMENT (KITE) PROJECT

Key informant interviews and number of informal consultations were held with the Kalash communities and other stakeholders in Bamburet, Rumbur and Birir valleys, for updating the IPPF for the KITE Project. No Objection Certificate (NOC) was obtained from Deputy Commissioner (DC) for conducting consultation with the Kalash community**.**

8.1 FGDs in Krakal, Bamburet, Kalash

A FGD was held with community members of Krakal Village in July 2017. Men of different age groups were present and all the participants were mature enough to share their views. Objectives of the consultation and project components were shared with the participants. Following are the major concerns, demands and apprehensions of the participants:

- Kalash are left with very small pieces of land;
- Resettlement should be avoided for widening of roads;
- Kalash Qazis should be in schools to preserve Kalash culture and religion;
- Kalash literature should be part of course books;
- Privacy of Kalash people is breached by the tourists;
- Tourists take photographs of Kalash girls without consent;
- Kalash have no proper infrastructure facilities;
- Purchase of land by non-Kalash in Kalash villages; and
- Participants were keen to get education and their allocated quota for jobs.

8.2 Meetings with Key Informants and their Concerns

Key informant interviews were held with the eminent and influencing members of the community and other non-Kalash. They were enquired about the existing issues and needs of community. Following are views of some of the key informants:

Sr. #	Key Informants	Views
1.	Mr. X, Bamburet	He is manager of a private hotel and belongs to Kalash community. He informed the basics of Kalash culture to the survey team. He also briefed the customs and traditions of his community. The major issue identified by him was the conversion of Kalash community to Muslims.
2.	Mr. Y, Bamburet	He is a Kalash living in Bamburet valley. He was enquired about his views for the increased tourist influx due to implementation of project activities. Following are some of major apprehensions:

		▪ The local Muslims disturb Kalash people;
		▪ Tourists convert Kalash girls to Muslims;
		▪ Government should ban conversion of Kalash to Muslims;
		▪ Afghans fight with Kalash at borders and steal the livestock; and
		▪ Army should stay at the borders.
3.	M. Rafi (Chairman of VC)	He identified the key issues and problems of Kalash people. The major concerns of M. Rafi are listed below: ▪ Kalash have communication issues; ▪ Kalash have infrastructure issues; ▪ Water supply has been damaged after flood, a couple of years back; ▪ There is no solid waste management system; ▪ There are no irrigation channels; ▪ Weakest point of Kalash is conversion to Islam but there is no forced conversion of Kalash people; ▪ There is no doctor in BHU; ▪ There is no proper schooling; ▪ There is no college in the area; ▪ The local fruits are not exported and get wasted; ▪ There are privacy issues as tourist enter the houses; ▪ Photographs without consent is the major issue; ▪ Kalash people are mostly poor; ▪ Kalash have better literacy rate; ▪ Kalash don't own arms; ▪ There are no local crimes; ▪ The crimes are due to open Afghan Border; ▪ Livestock, agriculture and tourism are the major sources of earning; ▪ Kalash people do not sell their animals; ▪ A death event for Kalash causes expenses of Rs. 1.5 – 2,0 million which put them under financial burden; and

		▪ Government should consider constructing the tunnel through Bamburet valley instead of widening of existing road.
4.	Akram Hussain (Curator of Kalasha Dur Museum at Bamburet)	He described the history and culture of Kalash people in detail. He explained the evolution and decline of Kalash in Chitral. After a brief description of history. He showed following concerns: ▪ There should be controlled tourism with information centers and guides; ▪ Since the Kalash houses have no boundary walls, the tourists enter the houses without permission; ▪ Tourists must not disturb privacy of the people; ▪ Professional and trained guides are required for tourists; ▪ More tourists than Kalash are present in the festivals; ▪ Kalash need safe areas for festivals; ▪ ROW of approach road should be more than 20 feet; ▪ Only enterprises get benefited from the tourism; ▪ There should be pass system for controlled tourism; ▪ There should be a tourist counting system; ▪ Since the major reason of conversion of Kalash people is mixed education, therefore the education system should be separate at least up to secondary level; ▪ Security forces should stay away from residential areas; and ▪ Afghan border should be fenced.

The key informants identified almost common issues and they have similar demands. These mainly relate to a need to control unsustainable tourism, encourage more culturally sensitive behavior amongst tourists, ensuring Kalash benefit economically from tourism, and the need for more basic facilities in the valleys such as water supply and sanitation services. In general the key informants were positive about the potential of tourism in the area as a mean of promoting their culture and economy.

8.3 Consultation with Women in Kalash Valley

Women were consulted in different villages of Kalash valleys to identify their issues and concerns. The women were asked about their concerns over increased tourists' influx and their suggestions were noted. Most of the women had following major concerns:

▪ Most of the tourists enter their houses without permission;

▪ Tourists take photographs of women and girls without their consent;

▪ Most of the tourist do not respect culture and traditions of Kalash; and

▪ There are more tourists in festivals than local Kalash, thus affecting the celebrations.

However, women were not against the influx of tourists provided that the privacy of women is not breached.

8.4 Informal Consultations

A number of informal consultations were held with different people including men and women, Muslims and Kalash, locals and tourists in different villages of three (03) Kalash valleys. Following are the major findings of informal consultations:

▪ Kalash people need hospitals and better schooling;

▪ Access and internal roads are required;

▪ Need a proper water supply scheme;

▪ Need proper sanitation facilities;

▪ Privacy of Kalash people should be protected;

▪ Photos must not be taken without consent;

▪ A handicraft center is required to improve the skills;

▪ Safety of community should be ensured;

▪ Land for graveyard should be allocated;

▪ Afghan border to be sealed;

▪ Tourists should come and they are good for economy;

▪ A quick access to hospitals in emergency is required; and

▪ Safeguard the interests of Kalash people.

8.5 Issues and Recommendations of Stakeholders

The community did not report any barrier in its participation in planning and/or implementation of the project. The future assessment should also be planned and undertaken in a way that all stakeholders, especially women, marginalized and children, are consulted in a free environment, and are informed of the consultative and assessment process well in advance. **Table 5.1** describe the key issues and recommendations of Kalash people.

Table 5.1: Key Issues and Recommendations from Stakeholders

Key Issues	Recommendations
Protection of traditional graveyard	Proper fencing and protection is needed as surrounding communities have disturbed the Kalash burial practice by stealing belongings of the deceased.
Lack of academic institutions and compulsory Islamic syllabus in text books at primary, middle and secondary education system.	Either separate educational institutions or exclusion of all material which has conversion messages from the primary, middle and secondary level books for Kalash school going children. At least one high school should be available for

Key Issues	Recommendations
	only Kalash students where Kalash culture/religion may be taught instead of Islamic syllabus.
Lack of health facilities in the Kalash valleys.	Establishment of proper dispensaries equipped with health staff and medicines. For any emergency, an ambulance should also be there.
Conversion to Islam due to economic vulnerability and limited income generation opportunities	Government should allocate quota and reserved seats for Kalash people to increase livelihood opportunities in public and private sector.
Rehabilitation of flood-damaged infrastructure including protective bunds, road and access tracks	The emergency preparedness plan (for Kalash) should be developed on public or private level to estimate the damages and losses of 2015 floods as it has damaged the infrastructure including roads and protective bunds to agriculture lands.
Open defecation around water bodies	Government should provide funds and launch a combined project on health & hygiene involving Kalash men and women rather than external staff.
Lack of economic opportunities for Kalash in towns/cities of KP	Grassroots level interventions, e.g. asset transfers for Kalash people, are needed to boost their economic development.
Demarcation of Kalash pastures boundaries	Encroachment of external and dominant groups should be barred from using Kalash pastures by demarcating these areas for livestock rearing and forest reserves.
Degradation of forest through illegal fuel wood extraction and killing of wildlife	Community based conservation activities (such as trophy hunting) should be introduced to create more and more livelihood opportunities by developing watch and ward system for wild fauna and flora, and provision of new opportunities for communities.
Cultural diversity at risk	Project/incentives for preservation of culture and heritage should be introduced through private sector or NGOs.
Lack of information on development sectors among community members	Prior consultation and consent should be sought among all members of community before any project intervention.

9 ELABORATION OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN

9.1 Free, Prior and Informed Consent

The World Bank Operational Policy on Indigenous Peoples requires a process of free, prior and informed consent (FPIC) throughout the project; the process is to lead to broad community support from indigenous peoples benefiting from, or affected by the subproject. The requirement is in recognition of the indigenous peoples' inherent and prior rights to their lands, territories and resources and respects their legitimate authority. The FPIC process allows and supports meaningful choices by the indigenous peoples about their lives. The borrower needs to use participatory consultative methods that are appropriate to the social and cultural values of the affected indigenous communities and their local conditions and, in designing these methods, give special attention to the concerns of indigenous women, youth, children and other vulnerable groups and their access to opportunities and benefits.

Free, prior, informed, culturally appropriate and socially inclusive consultations will take place with the indigenous communities at all stages of the subproject from planning to implementation. Consent of the indigenous peoples is to be sought sufficiently in advance of any authorization or commencement of activities in accordance with time requirements of indigenous consultation and consensus processes. The elements of free, prior and informed consent are summarized in Table 2.

Table 9-1 Prior and Informed Consent

Free	Prior	Informed	Consent
No manipulation	None of the following should be undertaken before consent of the indigenous peoples concerned: • Authorization or commencement of project activity; • Finalization of development plans; and • Specific time requirements of the consultation and consensus process should be set.	Information to be provided should be accurate and conveyed in a form and manner that is understood by the indigenous peoples concerned and in keeping with their traditions.	Consent may be oral or written, but will always involve consultation and participation. It must be recorded by the Project Management Unit with sufficient evidence.
No intimidation or coercion		Use appropriate language without perception of threats or coercion It must be in a form that is understandable and in line with the traditions of the community.	Consent should be obtained through a participatory process.

No incentives		Share with the concerned communities all information available on social, economic, environmental and cultural impacts as well as reasons for proposed activities, duration, affected locality, proposed benefits sharing and legal arrangements and people likely to be involved.	Decision-making should not exclude or marginalize individuals due to gender, ethnicity or other factors.

Source: Indigenous People Planning Framework of Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund

9.2 Screening for Indigenous Peoples Plan

During the screening stage, the officials of the Project Management Unit (PMU) responsible for implementation of the subproject will visit all indigenous peoples' communities and villages in the area where subproject may cause impacts.

The PMU will arrange public meetings in selected communities at a pre-announced place and date to provide information on the project and subprojects; the communities will be chosen so that all people who may be impacted by the project will be able to attend a meeting. The very first visit will be accompanied by a screening exercise, which will be undertaken by the PMU with the help of indigenous people community leader to document the following:

- Presence and names of indigenous people community groups in the area;
- Cultural and religious distinction of the indigenous groups vis-à-vis other communities;
- Laws, regulations and customs related to indigenous people groups;
- Total number of indigenous people and indigenous communities as well as percentage of indigenous people population to total population in the area;
- Number and percentage of indigenous people households likely to be affected by the subproject; and
- Vulnerability of the indigenous people, such as socioeconomic conditions that may further deteriorate due to project impact.

During the visits, community leaders and other participants will present their views on the merits, benefits, and envisaged constraints of the project and subproject components.

9.3 Due Diligence Report

A due diligence report is to be prepared if no impact on the indigenous people is identified. If unexpected and significant impacts become likely during project implementation, the Indigenous Peoples Plan will be

updated in accordance with this Framework. The Plan must be implemented before commencement of the activity that could cause significant impacts.

9.4 Social Impact Assessment

If the results of the preliminary screening show that there are indigenous households in the proposed subproject area, a social impact assessment will be conducted to capture issues specific to the indigenous peoples. If vulnerable groups among the indigenous people are identified within the project area, they warrant attention so that their sociocultural identity and baseline economic standards would be improved by the project.

An analysis will be conducted to identify subprojects' stakeholders, particularly the positively or negatively affected and persons vulnerable to the subproject. Social impact assessment will be conducted in consultation with the indigenous communities, in particular with persons who will be affected by the project, through focus group discussions, interviews of key informants, women only meetings and other informal gatherings to record their views and recommendations for the subproject preparation. The process will adhere to the principles of free, prior and informed consent.

The assessment will ensure that all potential positive and adverse effects of the subproject on the indigenous people are fully understood and accounted for in the subproject design, in accordance with the Framework guidelines to avoid any adverse effects, or if not possible, then minimize, mitigate or compensate for such effects. It will also ensure that the indigenous communities receive culturally appropriate benefits of the subproject. Annex D shows a checklist that may be used for this purpose.

Specific consultations will be carried out with the persons who are likely to be negatively affected to identify their needs and preferences for compensation and rehabilitation measures; the affected persons will be thoroughly informed on the results of the census and impact assessment. This process will include the following actions:

- Inform affected indigenous communities about subproject objectives and activities;
- Discuss and assess possible adverse impacts and ways to avoid or mitigate them;
- Discuss and assess potential project benefits and how these can be enhanced;
- Discuss and assess land and natural resource use and how management of these resources may be enhanced;
- Identify customary rights to land and natural resource use and possible ways of enhancing them;
- Identify and discuss potential conflicts with other communities and how these might be avoided;
- Elicit and incorporate indigenous knowledge into subproject design;
- Ascertain the affected communities' broad support for the project; and
- Develop a strategy for indigenous people's participation and consultation during project implementation, including monitoring and evaluation.

The interests, needs and priorities of vulnerable segments of indigenous communities---especially women, the elderly, the youth, and the handicapped---may vary, and they may be affected differently from others. It is important to have in-depth consultations with such vulnerable groups to assess their

needs, priorities and nature of their interests in the subproject. In particular, the economic gap between the vulnerable and the rest of the community should not be widened by the project, but narrowed. The consultation process will ensure their participation in decision making at all stages of the subproject, explicitly or implicitly. If explicit participation of vulnerable groups through their inclusion in consultation meetings with other stakeholders does not prove effective, other participatory techniques---such as separate meetings for each vulnerable group, household level discussions, structured or unstructured interviews---will be used. Gender and Social Protection Checklist (Annex E) can help the process.

The processes and mechanisms ensuring the active involvement of affected persons and other stakeholders will be detailed in the Indigenous Peoples Plan, which will include an Appendix with a list of participants, location, date and minutes of consultation meetings. The consultations at later stages of the subproject will be documented and reported in the Quarterly Progress Reports.

The level of detail and comprehensiveness of the assessment will correspond to the complexity and severity of the impacts. The assessment will contain: a baseline socioeconomic profile of the indigenous peoples in the subproject area; the nature and degree of environmental and socioeconomic impacts to the indigenous peoples by the subproject; suggestions on enhancement of positive impacts and elimination or mitigation of negative impacts and feasibility of implementing an Indigenous Peoples Plan. Feasibility should be assessed based on the following issues:

- Resolution of grievances, especially those that could not be resolved at the local level and require resolution at the higher levels as in the Environmental and Social Management Framework;
- Documentation of subproject resettlement and compensation, if applicable, including temporary losses;
- Evaluation of the quality of compensation or other relevant mitigation measures, including impacts on livelihoods; and
- Mitigation measures when strategic interventions are required---for example, if the vulnerable groups are not receiving sufficient support from the subproject.

9.5 Benefit Sharing and Mitigation Measures

Where impacts on indigenous households are potentially positive, measures will be undertaken to ensure that benefits are equally shared. To this end, indigenous peoples must be firmly involved as stakeholders at all stages of the subproject. Where impacts are potentially negative, all such affected indigenous households will be provided with assistance to improve their living standards without risking community disintegration. Indigenous people as a whole are vulnerable and are entitled to receive special assistance not only to restore and improve their income and livelihood, but also to maintain their distinct cultural identity.

Indigenous peoples are likely to have traditional land rights; these will be honored, and the absence of land titles will not disqualify them for receiving compensation. Their compensation entitlements will be the same as those listed in the Resettlement Plan Framework (RPF) of the project, which recognizes the indigenous people as vulnerable people.

9.6 Establishment of Indigenous Peoples Plan

9.6.1   Overview

An Indigenous Peoples Plan will establish the measures through which the borrower will ensure that: (i) indigenous people affected by the subproject receive culturally appropriate social and economic benefits; and (ii) when potential adverse effects on indigenous people are identified, the adverse effects are avoided, minimized, mitigated, or compensated for. The Plan should be prepared in a flexible and pragmatic manner, and its level of detail will vary depending on the subproject and the nature of effects to be addressed. Its contents should include:

- Project description and summary description of issues relating to indigenous peoples;
- Summary of legal and institutional framework applicable to indigenous peoples;
- Summary of social impact assessment, including baseline information on demographics, social, cultural, and political characteristics of the affected indigenous peoples, land and territories that they have traditionally owned or customarily used or occupied, and natural resources on which they depend;
- Summary of the process leading to free, prior and informed consent;
- Framework to ensure consultations with the affected indigenous peoples during subproject implementation in line with the principles of free, prior and informed consent;
- Measures to ensure that the affected indigenous people receive social and economic benefits that are culturally appropriate;
- Description of institutional arrangements for the implementation of the Plan;
- Measures to avoid, minimize, mitigate, or compensate for adverse effects;
- Cost estimates and financing plan for the Plan;
- Grievance redress mechanisms accessible to the affected indigenous peoples, and
- Monitoring, evaluating and reporting on the implementation of the Plan, along with specific monitoring indicators disaggregated by communities, gender and age.

Annex A shows an indicative annotated outline of an Indigenous Peoples Plan.

The Project Coordination Unit (PCU) is required to prepare an Indigenous Peoples Plan for each of the subprojects, prior to implementation. Given the substantial presence of Muslim community in some villages of the Kalash valley, a Mixed Community Development Plan[3] can also be prepared if required. The implementing PCU will submit the Plan to the World Bank for review and approval prior to the finalization of the subproject formulation. The measures in the Plan must comply with World Bank Operational Policy 4.10, and the Plan must be integrated into subproject design.

---

[3]A mixed community development plan assesses project impacts, devise mitigation measures and compensation for indigenous and non-indigenous people who belong to the same geographical community and have social ties with each other.

9.6.2 Consultation

Consultations are necessary to ensure that needs, priorities, and preferences of indigenous peoples are adequately dealt with; the principal strategy of Indigenous Peoples Plan would be to promote participation of the indigenous peoples. Thorough consultation and broad community support will be sought prior to undertaking any project activities that affect the communities, and the affected indigenous people will be informed and consulted in preparing the Plan.

The participation of affected indigenous peoples in planning will enable them to benefit the most from the project and to protect them from any potential adverse impacts of the subproject. The implementing Project Management Unit will ensure that adequate funds are available for consultation and facilitation. Indigenous peoples may be particularly vulnerable when project activities include: (i) commercial development of their cultural resources and knowledge; (ii) physical displacement from traditional or customary lands; and (iii) commercial development of natural resources within customary lands under use that would impact livelihoods or cultural, ceremonial, or spiritual uses that define the identity and community of indigenous people. In deciding whether to proceed with a project involving such activities, the borrower will seek the consent of affected indigenous people communities.

9.6.3 Disclosure

In the subproject initiation phase, the Project Coordination Unit will be responsible for the issue of public notice to acquire particular land or property for the subproject, along with dissemination of information on the subproject. The notice will be published twice in local newspapers, with a week's interval. In addition, the PMU, along with local revenue officials and officials from the district collector's office, will conduct meetings to ensure that the information reaches all indigenous people affected by the subproject.

The documents to be elaborated by the PMU for disclosure on the World Bank's website are:

(i) Draft Indigenous Peoples Plan and Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework, including social impact assessment;
(ii) Final IPP; and
(iii) New or updated IPP and a corrective action plan prepared during implementation, if any.

For the benefit of the local community, indigenous people in particular, summary of this Framework and each Plan will be made available in local languages during public meetings at the community level and will be disclosed in public places prior to subproject appraisal, allowing stakeholders to provide inputs on the subproject in a timely manner.

Each subproject IPP will be disclosed to the affected indigenous people communities by the implementing HEC, including measurement of losses, detailed asset valuations, entitlements and special provisions, grievance procedures, timing of payments, and displacement schedule. Information sharing will be through public consultations. The key information in the IPP---such as entitlements and implementation

arrangements---will be made available as brochures, leaflets, or booklets, using the language most understood by the indigenous people in question. Posters designed to disseminate the most important elements of the IPP will be distributed indifferent localities to generate mass awareness.

As soon as the Plan is finalized, hard copies of the IPP in the local indigenous language will also be made available at: (i) offices of the implementing Project Management Unit; (ii) Deputy/Assistant Commissioner's office; (iii) Union Council office; and (iv) any other local level public offices. For non-literate people, other communication methods will be used; a report of this disclosure with dates and locations will be shared with the World Bank. The PCU under HEC will ensure that adequate funds are available for consultation and facilitation.

Efforts should be made to put electronic version of the Framework and the Plan on the official website of the HEC, provincial government, and World Bank after approval and endorsement of the documents by them.

10 IMPLEMENTATION OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN

10.1 Project Coordination Unit

HEC will set up a Project Coordination Unit (PCU) for taking care of the day-to-day operations and the PCU along with the respective division in HEC responsible for the subproject will be re overall responsible for functions related to indigenous people, including preparation, implementation, financing and supervision of all subproject activities and interagency coordination.

An Environmental and Social Cell (ESC) shall operate under PCU which shall take care of the environmental and social safeguard requirements of the project components. The ESC shall be comprised of environmental and social specialists. The ESC shall have the liberty to outsource environmental and social compliance requirements to different consultants and specialists. The consultants shall facilitate ESC in preparing environmental and social assessment, monitoring and compliance documents. The ESC have to ensure the compliance of ESMF including:

- The review of environmental and social assessments or documents that analyze the environmental and social impacts of the grants.

- Field supervision of social and environmental aspects of the proposals; any proposal related to Kalash Valley will be subject to World Bank review and approval, before any futher steps are taken.

- Ensure compliance of mitigation measure and request the suspension of disbursements to beneficiaries until the necessary remedial action are implemented.

- When necessary, consult with other national and provincial entities with competencies in environmental and social management.

- Preparation of internal reports.

- Maintain the Grievance Redress Mechanism.

10.2   Monitoring and Evaluation

The project will monitor and evaluate the activities with a focus on possible negative impacts. As required by the Environmental and Social Management Framework, monthly, quarterly and semi-annual monitoring reports will be prepared in order to:

(i)   Improve environmental and social management practices;
(ii) Ensure the efficiency and quality of the environmental and social assessment processes;
(iii) Establish evidence- and results-based environmental and social assessment for the sub-projects; and
(iv) Provide an opportunity to report the results of safeguards, impacts and proposed mitigation measures' implementation.

HEC with PCU support will conduct internal monitoring activities during the design of the subproject to determine the extent to which mitigation measures are successfully implemented: compliance monitoring, which verifies that the Environmental and Social Management Framework is effectively implemented.

Once the subproject is under implementation, impacts will be monitored, instead of compliance. The environmental and social safeguards documents will be shared with the contractor, and HEC with support from PCU will monitor to ensure that works are proceeding in accordance with the agreed mitigation measures. The safeguard specialists will conduct internal quarterly monitoring activities, whose report will be submitted to HEC, the relevant departments and the World Bank for review.

Evaluation is an assessment of the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, performance and sustainability of a project. Evaluation requires an in-depth review at specific points in the life of a project, usually at the mid-point and at the end, to verify whether project objectives have been achieved or not. It is a management tool which will assist in evidence-based decision making and provides valuable lessons to the provincial government.

Monitoring and evaluation of the social impacts concern:

- Impacts on the standard of living of affected indigenous people at individual, household and community levels – the standard must be the same or better after project implementation;
- Gender and age differentiated impacts – the negative impacts must be avoided or minimized;
- Post project socioeconomic status of affected communities – the status must be better after project implementation;
- Management of disputes or conflicts – disputes and conflicts must have been resolved to the satisfaction of all parties involved.

In order to measure these impacts, the PCU must:

- Identify specific indicators to be monitored with gender and age disaggregated data;
- Define how indicators will be measured on a regular basis; and
- Identify key monitoring milestones.

In order to ensure that indigenous people are engaged in the monitoring and evaluation process, a monitoring committee will be established for each beneficiary community. The composition of this committee will be subject to a process of free, prior and informed consent and will build on the decision-making structures of each indigenous community, as well as requirements for inclusion of vulnerable groups. The monitoring committees will be involved in elaboration of monitoring reports. The village elders and *Qazi* (areligious leader) will be consulted on the subproject activities within village boundaries to confirm whether construction, contracting arrangements, and other aspects have been implemented appropriately.

10.3   Budget

The budget for implementing the Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework and Indigenous Peoples Plan will be part of the project budget. It will be used to cover project staff allowances and costs to collect data and prepare various documents: compliance reports, supervising and monitoring reports, and an Indigenous Peoples Plan. The Plan will indicate detailed costs of mitigation measures and other rehabilitation entitlements for indigenous peoples in the affected areas as well as administrative and monitoring costs of the Plan.

Annex A: Indicative Annotated Outline of Indigenous Peoples Plan

1. Preliminaries
   a. Table of Contents
   b. List of Acronyms and Abbreviations
   c. Executive Summary

2. Introduction and Context
   a. Introduction of the proposed project and/or activities
   b. Rationale for IPP

3. Legal and Institutional Framework
   Which national and provincial laws are applicable in regard to the Indigenous Peoples under consideration?

4. Baseline Socioeconomic Information
   Socioeconomic information about the Indigenous Peoples collected through primary and secondary resources
   a. Socio-cultural setup
   b. Economic infrastructure (resources) and activities
   c. Summary of the Social Assessment

5. Free, Prior and Informed Consent
   a. Summary of the process to obtain free, prior and informed consent with indigenous community during project preparation
   b. Framework for ensuring free, prior and informed consultation with affected Indigenous community during project implementation

6. Action Plan
   a. Measures to ensure that IP community receives culturally appropriate socioeconomic benefits from project
   b. Measures to avoid, minimize, mitigate, or compensate for any adverse effects arising from the project

7. Financing Indigenous Peoples Plan
   Cost Estimates and Financing Plan for the IP

8. Grievance Redressal
   Procedures to address grievances by the affected indigenous community arising from the project implementation

9. Monitoring, Evaluating and Reporting

   Mechanisms and benchmarks for monitoring, evaluating and reporting on the implementation of the Indigenous Peoples Plan

10. Annexes
    a. List of proposed activities in the indigenous communities
    b. List of participants to the consultations
    c. Any other information deemed necessary to be included in the Plan