The World Bank Loan Project

The World Bank Loan Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project
Social Assessment Report on Construction of
Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot in Jingtai County

Gansu Huigu Science & Technology Consulting Co. Ltd.
April 2020
Social Assessment Report for Sub-project of Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot in Jingtai County

Report Editing Team

Ding Wenguang
Professor, Tutor for Doctor Degree, College of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Lanzhou University
Expert of Think Tank, Gansu Huigu Science & Technology Consulting Co. Ltd.

Jiang Xuehua
General Manager, Gansu Huigu Science & Technology Consulting Co. Ltd.

Gao Xuelan
Technician, Gansu Huigu Science & Technology Consulting Co. Ltd.

Yang Xiaoai
Technician, Gansu Huigu Science & Technology Consulting Co. Ltd.

Tang Yaping
Technician, Gansu Huigu Science & Technology Consulting Co. Ltd.

Yang Ting
Technician, Gansu Huigu Science & Technology Consulting Co. Ltd.

Li Weili
Technician, Gansu Huigu Science & Technology Consulting Co. Ltd.

Li Tiantian
Technician, Gansu Huigu Science & Technology Consulting Co. Ltd.

Mu Yangjie
Technician, Gansu Huigu Science & Technology Consulting Co. Ltd.
# Contents

Abstract .............................................................................................................................................. 1
Positive Social Impacts of the Project ............................................................................................. 1
Negative Social Impacts of the Project ............................................................................................. 2
Potential Social Risks of the Project ............................................................................................... 3
Suggestions and Mitigation Measures ............................................................................................ 4

**Chapter I. Project Background** .................................................................................................... 7

1.1 Project Profile ............................................................................................................................ 7
1.2 Project Significance .................................................................................................................... 7
1.3 Task of Social Assessment ......................................................................................................... 9
1.4 Purposes of Social Assessment .................................................................................................. 9
1.5 The Main Factors Affecting the Achievement of Project Objectives .................................... 10
1.6 Methods of Social Assessment ................................................................................................. 10
   1.6.1 Direct Observation ............................................................................................................. 11
   1.6.2 Villager (Community) Meeting ......................................................................................... 11
   1.6.3 Semi-structured Interview ............................................................................................... 12
   1.6.4 Key Person Interview ....................................................................................................... 12
   1.6.5 Social Gender Perspective ............................................................................................... 13
   1.6.6 Participatory Mapping ..................................................................................................... 13
   1.6.7 Questionnaire Survey ...................................................................................................... 14
   1.6.8 Logical Framework .......................................................................................................... 14
1.7 Data Source ................................................................................................................................ 15
   1.7.1 First-hand Data ................................................................................................................. 15
   1.7.2 Second-hand Data ............................................................................................................ 15

**Chapter II. Brief Introduction to Project County** ........................................................................ 17

2.1 Profile of Project Area ................................................................................................................ 17
2.2 Overview of Tourism Development in the Project Area ......................................................... 18
2.3 Poverty Situation in the Project Area ....................................................................................... 20
Chapter III. Demographic Analysis of the Project Area

Chapter IV. Current Situation of Cultural and Natural Heritage in Project Area

4.1 Current Status of Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection of Project County

4.1.1 Protection Policies of Jingtai County

4.1.2 Protection Plan of Project Scenic Spot

4.2 Tourism Development Status of Cultural and Natural Heritage in the Project Area

4.2.1 Tourism Development Policies of Jingtai County

4.2.2 Development Plan of Project Scenic Spot

4.2.3 Comment on the Policy and Planning of Heritage Tourism Development

4.3 Analysis of the Management Status on Cultural and Natural heritage in the project area

4.3.1 Basic Conditions of Infrastructure and Tourism Development of the Project Scenic Spot

4.3.2 Management Organization of Heritage-based Tourist Scenic Spots

4.3.3 Other Government Departments that May Involved in the Project

Chapter V. Analysis of Stakeholders in the Project Area

5.1 Identification of Stakeholder Groups

5.2 Needs Assessment of Stakeholder Groups

5.3 Ways and Measures for Stakeholder Groups to Participate in the Project

Chapter VI. Project Suitability Analysis

6.1 Participation of Different Stakeholders

6.2 Participation of Various Organizations

6.3 Local Social Environment and Landscape Features

6.3.1 Local social environment

6.3.2 Landscape features

Chapter VII. Project Social Risk Analysis
7.1 Identification of Social Risks .......................................................... 43
7.2 Project Social Risk Control ............................................................... 44

Chapter VIII. Project Social Impact Analysis ........................................... 47
8.1 Analysis of Project Impacts on different interest groups ...................... 47
8.2 Positive Impact of the Project: .......................................................... 49
8.3 Negative Impact of the project: ......................................................... 50

Chapter IX. Community Participation ..................................................... 51
9.1 The Role of Community Participation ................................................. 51
9.2 Mechanism of Community Participation .......................................... 52

Chapter X. Conclusions and Suggestions ................................................. 54
10.1 Conclusions .................................................................................. 54
10.2 Suggestions and Mitigation Measures: ............................................. 54

Annex : Questionnaires .......................................................................... 57

Questionnaire 1: Questionnaire for Local Officials in World Bank Loaned Gansu
Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project ............. 57

Questionnaire 2: Questionnaire for Community Affected People in Scenic Spots in
World Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and
Development II Project ............................................................................. 59

Questionnaire 3: Questionnaire for Business Operators in Scenic Spots in World
Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II
Project .................................................................................................. 62

Questionnaire 4: Questionnaire for Tourists in World Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural
and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project ......................... 64
Abstract

The World Bank Loan Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project involved six project areas, namely Songminyan Scenic Spot in Hezheng County, Guanegou Scenic Spot in Tanchang County, Baili Grotto Scenic Spot in Jingchuan County, Yangba Scenic Spot in Kang County, Kongtong Mountain Scenic Spot in Kongtong District, Yunya Temple Scenic Spot in Zhuanglang County. Due to the adjustment of project areas, the Kongtong Mountain Scenic Spot and Yunya Temple Scenic Spot were removed from the project. The Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot of Jingtai County stove for a total amount of RMB 282,804,900 to carry out the cultural heritage protection, development and promotion activities.

The SA team conducted the field investigation in the project areas since the end of March, 2019. Totally 297 questionnaires were collected, including 147 of villagers, 66 of business operators, 34 of government officials and 50 of visitors. After collecting and analyzing the basic data and information, the SA team completed this SA report. The SA applied literature review and PRA methods, which combine direct observation, questionnaires, group meetings, semi-structured interviews, key person interviews, and gender elements were considered to understand the problems that need to be addressed in the development of the scenic spot, and the ideas and opinions of the villagers and other stakeholders were absorbed and reflected in this report.

Positive Impacts of the Project:
1. The concept of the “New Silk Road Economic Belt” with “One Belt and One Road” Construction as its core measure has become the new idea of national development under the new situation of the China’s opening up policy. Baiyin City, as an important city along the Silk Road Economic Belt, needs to be further integrated into the development of the Gansu section of the “Silk Road Economic Belt”. The Yellow River Stone Forest Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development Project relies on the “One Belt and One Road” construction strategy, utilizes the development opportunities of World Bank loans and cultural and tourism construction, and protects the natural and cultural heritage of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot by virtue of its good location advantages, resource advantages and cultural advantages. The implementation of tourism resource development activities can promote the development of communities such as Longwan Village of Yellow River Stone Forest and improve the living standards of surrounding villagers.

2. The project implementation will enhance the protection and development of cultural and natural heritage in Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot. Due to imperfect policies and constraints on economic conditions, the status of protection, management
and sustainable use of cultural and natural heritage in Jingtai Historical and Cultural Area is worrying. It is imperative to implement scientific planning and top-level strategic design development for cultural heritage protection and sustainable tourism development. Therefore, the implementation of the World Bank Loaned Cultural and Natural Heritage Project is conducive to the sustainable development and natural heritage protection in Jingtai County.

3. The poor population of Longwan Village, Zhongquan Township in Jingtai County was involved in the project. The project implementation can provide the employment opportunities for the poor people in Longwan Village of Zhongquan Township and even the whole Jingtai County, increase the income and living standard of poor population as well as promote the economic development of Longwan Village and Jingtai County.

4. The project implementation is conducive to enhancing community participation. The community villagers are able to participate the infrastructure construction of the project. The project set a talking platform between farmer households and governments to alleviate the contradiction and seek for common development directions and goals. Through the project implementation, 2 community organizations will be established in the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot, and more farmers will participate in the development of the scenic spot. It is estimated that the number of direct beneficiaries will reach 100 people and the indirect beneficiaries will reach 400 people.

5. The project implementation will improve the infrastructures and ancillary facilities of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot and increase the employment opportunities during the construction period and after completion. The project will also enhance the tourism management capacity of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot, improve the abilities of the tourism industry employees, and enhance the awareness of the cultural heritage protection of the local community villagers.

**Negative Impact of the Project:**
1. This subproject will acquire a small amount of 64 mu (around 4 ha) of rural land acquisition which affect 45 households with 186 persons and 117 sqm of house demolition affecting 4 households with 11 persons in Longwan Village of Zhongchuan Town, Jingtai County.

2. The environmental impacts generated during project construction may lead to impacts on local people’s health and safety. The dumping of dust, noise and garbage generated during the project construction will temporarily and adversely affect the cleanliness of the project area, and will bring short-term inconvenience, which will have a negative impact on the daily life of local villagers (villagers). Meanwhile, engineering trucks, waste, waste soil, waste water and other issues may pose security threat to the
Potential Social Risks of the Project:

1. The change of the operation mode of the donkey cart may intensify the contradiction between the scenic spot management committee and the farmers.

The existing donkey cart service in the scenic spot has been independently operated with its own management system. Due to the management need, the scenic spot management committee will remodel the donkey cart and establish a special farmer cooperative for donkey cart service. After the establishment of the cooperative, all the donkey carts will be unified managed and the farmers who involved in the cooperative will receive the dividends. However, due to the fact that there was a cooperative registered by the village committee before, which did not operate according to the its regulations and the legal representative was not local people. The original cooperative raised 2 million yuan and the funds management had lots of problems, the farmer did not receive any dividends and their shares could not be recovered. That may cause the farmers have no confidence in the mode of cooperative. At same time, part of farmers reported that the compensation standard in the land acquisition of early stage were not recognized by the farmers, resulting in lower trust of the farmers. Consequently, the failure cooperative operation model and the mutual distrust between the government and the farmers are the main risks of the implementation of the project.

2. Low community participation. The area where the project area is located lacks the community organization established by the farmers themselves. The registered community organizations such as cooperatives are not operated according to the wishes of the farmers but just dominated by a few people and lack the participation of farmers.

3. The risk of moral degradation of farmers in commercial tourism service provision. With the development of scenic spot, more tourists come to the scenic spot. However, the tourists feedback that some vendors in the scenic spot have deliberately raised the price of goods and sell goods by force that causes the lots of dissatisfaction among tourists. The price cheating and jacking reflects the distortion of values and moral degradation of some vendors in the scenic spot.

4. Risk of gender inequality in women’s lagging behind. Due to the imbalanced social and economic development, more villagers in the project are out of village for migrant work, resulting in an imbalance in the structure of the community's labor force. Majority women, elder people and children are left behind at home. Moreover, women are far less educated than men and lack the right to participate, express, decide and be heard in the community affairs. It is suggested that the project should pay more attention to women’ participation in the subsequent construction.

5. Risks of land acquisition, house demolition and resettlement. According to early-stage investigation, the proposed construction of sheep raft Intangible culture heritage protection and display area and road engineering concern the land acquisition, which
located in the Longwan Village, Zhongquan Township of Jingtai. This land acquisition contains permanent acquisition, simple house demolition and ground attachment demolition. The project will acquire 64 mu of permanent land, which affected totally 45 households with 186 people; of which remove 117 m² simple house, which affected 4 households with 11 people; remove or cut 18.61 mu ground attachments, 3540 cash trees, and timber trees, 50m² donkey sheds and 12.2 m² fishpond. If the rights and interests of affected households cannot be guaranteed, there will be risks to the project implementation.

6. During the project construction, a large number of migrant workers will come to local areas, which may cause some social security issues, such as gender discrimination or sexual harassment.

7. The spread of COVID-19 virus may lead to large-scale infection of migrant workers or increase the opportunities of infection. It affects the local emergency and medical services, and may have impacts on the progress of project construction.

Suggestions and Mitigation Measures:
1. **Engage an incubator to cultivate the farmer-driven community organizations.** After the project is launched, it is recommended that the qualified third-party consulting agency should be hired to cultivate the farmer-leading community organizations. The consulting agency will assist the farmers to establish the organization, help them improve the management system, management structure and supervision mechanism so as to enhance the function of community organization, inspire the participation enthusiasm of local villagers and ease the dissatisfaction between scenic spot management committee and farmers. At the same time, the equal communication mechanism and platform between scenic spot management committee and farmers will be establish to discuss about the common benefit, defuse the contradiction between the government and community and make common development directions and goals.

2. **Improve community participation.** It is suggested that the management committee of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot improves management and listen to the opinions and suggestions of community villagers in major decision-making, project implementation and tourism management, and establishes a community participation mechanism to ensure the community's right to know and participate in the management of scenic spot as well as the right of decision-making.

3. **Establish a standardized management system, discipline the behavior of farmers by means of institutional force and traditional ethics.** It is suggested that the scenic spot management committee, community organizations and farmers establish together through the participatory discussion the management regulation, reception standard, price agreement, reward and punishment mechanisms. Improving the moral attainment
of farmers and restrain farmers’ behavior via the institutional management and moral tradition.

4. **Promote social gender equality and empower women.** The survey team recommends that the proportion of female members is clearly required to be no less than 30%, and women participation is also required in the management of community organizations when establishing a community organization. Women should also be encouraged to participate in various meetings and training organized by community organizations and scenic management committees, and to participate in the service industry such as catering, tea art, handicraft, embroidery and other business.

5. **The PMO of Jingtai County subproject is responsible for the management of this subproject implementation.** The PMO will arrange for staff to be responsible for land acquisition and resettlement. The progress of land acquisition and house demolition and resettlement shall be carried out according to the progress of the construction plan of the project. The resettlement plan is prepared in accordance with the actual situation of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot in Jingtai County to ensure the openness, fairness and transparency of the project land acquisition implementation process. Project community villagers’ participation is designed and included in project social action and resettlement plans. Grievance redress mechanism, and internal and external monitoring and evaluation process for the entire project are also set in the resettlement plan, so that the legitimate rights and interests of affected people can be ensured, and the risks that may arise during the project implementation process are reduced and mitigation measures are also considered for actions.

6. Women should be equally treated as same as men during the recruitment. In addition, the responsible person should strengthen the staff management and increase the night patrol to avoid the security accidents.

7. Prevention measures for COVID-19:
   ① Gansu local regulations and requirements for prevention and control of COVID-19 and the World Bank ESF/Safeguards Interim Note: COVID-19 considerations in construction/civil works projects shall be observed and also applied to contractors/subcontractors.
      Entry/exit to the work site should be controlled and documented for both workers and other parties, including support staff and suppliers.
   ② Training workers and staff on site on the signs and symptoms of COVID-19, how it is spread, how to protect themselves (including regular handwashing and social distancing) and what to do if they or other people have symptoms.
   ③ Ensuring handwashing facilities supplied with soap, disposable paper towels and closed waste bins exist at key places throughout site, including at entrances/exits to work areas; where there is a toilet, canteen or food distribution, or provision of drinking
Where handwashing facilities do not exist or are not adequate, arrangements should be made to set them up. Alcohol based sanitizer (if available, 60-95% alcohol) can also be used.

4) Conduct regular and thorough cleaning of all site facilities, including offices, accommodation, canteens, common spaces. Review cleaning protocols for key construction equipment (particularly if it is being operated by different workers).

5) Training cleaners in proper hygiene (including handwashing) prior to, during and after conducting cleaning activities; how to safely use PPE (where required); in waste control (including for used PPE and cleaning materials).

6) Where it is anticipated that cleaners will be required to clean areas that have been or are suspected to have been contaminated with COVID-19, providing them with appropriate PPE: gowns or aprons, gloves, eye protection (masks, goggles or face screens) and boots or closed work shoes. If appropriate PPE is not available, cleaners should be provided with best available alternatives.

7) Consider changes to work processes and timings to reduce or minimize contact between workers, recognizing that this is likely to impact the project schedule.

8) For further information see WHO COVID-19 advice for the public and ILO Standards).
Chapter I. Project Background

1.1 Project Overview

The total investment of the Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot of Cultural Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project is RMB282.8049 million. The project contents consist of three parts: firstly, is the cultural heritage protection activities, which include collecting, collating and studying the intangible cultural heritage; protecting the endangered geological heritage and cultural relics; renovating the surrounding environment of heritage relics; secondly, is the cultural heritage development activities, which include repairing the road and house, building the infrastructure, such as the visitor service center to meet the visitors’ need; supporting the construction of water supply and drainage, electric power, communication, sanitation, tourism guidance as well as information system in the Yellow River Stone Forest scenic spot to promote the sustainable development of scenic spot; supporting the surrounding communities to participated in the development of Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot so that improve the basic condition of community villagers’ livelihood, build the public service facilities and create a favorable environment for tourism development; Training towards the management personnel of project offices and project units of Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot at all levels to improve the management ability and level; strengthening training of technical personnel specialized in heritage protection, inheritance, project management and implementation, and improve the level of heritage protection and construction management capabilities; also training villagers and tourism practitioners in the communities around the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot, and popularizing knowledge related to heritage protection and sustainable development; focusing on the development of women in communities and improve their sustainable livelihood; thirdly, is the cultural heritage promotion activities, which include building an intangible cultural heritage exhibition center and display the intangible cultural heritage; conducting the related research on folk culture and use the research results to guide the sustainable development and improvement of culture natural heritage.

Jingtai County YRSFTCI Subproject consists of construction of a 1,800 m$^2$ museum, a 1,272 m$^2$ cultural heritage demonstration platform, a 1.60 km long x 30 m wide road, a 4,850 m$^2$ tourist service center, a 5,000 m$^2$ family entertaining yard, 1,000 m$^2$ of local agricultural products display and sales, 117,020 m$^2$ of eco-parking lots and ancillary works; rehabilitation of 3,000 m$^2$ tourist rest corridors, and wastewater pollution control facilities. It will also finance a village tourism association and provide tourist service related to skill training to enable the community to be well integrated in local tourism development.

1.2 Project Significance

1. The project implementation is conducive to the construction of the “One Belt and One Road” economic belt. Jingtai County is located in the central part of Gansu
Province, which is at the junction of the three provinces (prefectures) of Gansu Province, and Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region and Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region, is the main artery of Silk Road. The name of Jingtai County has meaning of economic prosperity, national peace and people’s safety. The project will give full play to actively develop tourism, implement a precise poverty alleviation strategy, and foster and expand tourism-focused service industry based on the advantages of long history, rich resources, cultural accumulation, trade circulation and policy superposition of Jingtai County. The project plays an important role in the construction of new Silk Road economic belt of protecting cultural and natural heritage.

2. The project helps to promote the sustainable development of cultural and natural heritage in Jingtai area. The status of protection, management and sustainable use of cultural and natural heritage in Jingtai historical and cultural area is worrying due to imperfect policies and constraints of economic conditions. It is imperative to implement scientific planning and top-level strategic design for cultural heritage protection and sustainable tourism development. Therefore, the implementation of the World Bank Loaned Cultural and Natural Heritage Project is conducive to the sustainable development and protection of cultural and natural heritage in Jingtai County.

3. The project helps to achieve the goal of win-win of regional industrial development and poverty alleviation. Jingtai County is located in the southern margin of the Tengger Desert. The climate is dry, windy and sandy. The problem of water shortage and soil salinization in this area is prominent. The task of poverty alleviation and economic development is arduous. In 2011, Jingtai County was listed in the national poverty-stricken key county of Liupan Mount District and is one of 58 the poorest counties in Gansu Province. The implementation of the cultural and natural heritage project will help to explore the solutions to the reasonable integration between the development of regional heritage protection and poverty alleviation by tourism. The implementation of the cultural and natural heritage project will also fully carry out the “participatory” poverty alleviation, improve the regional environment for future development, and promote the rapid development of regional commerce and trade, transportation, accommodation, catering, culture, tourism and other industries, thus foster the country's famous demonstration zone of poverty alleviation via heritage tourism, hence realize the World Bank's dual goals of “alleviating poverty and prosperity”.

4. Through the project implementation, it will promote the inheritance, protection and display of cultural and natural heritage, the protection of geological heritage and local ecological construction, etc. In addition, the training and special research
are conducive to the introduction of advanced heritage protection technology measures to enhance the concept of heritage protection, the sustainable development of tourism in the project area and bring the tourists wonderful experience and enjoyment. The project will adopt the community participation methods to encourage community villagers making a plan and developing local characteristic handicrafts and native products so that to realize the protection, inheritance and innovation of the intangible cultural heritage in the project-related area, accelerate the development of the community and increase the income of villagers simultaneously.

1.3 Task of Social Assessment

The survey team has obtained the basic data and information for the preparation of social assessment report through the field research, participatory monitoring & evaluation, and document literature research under the leadership of PMO of World Bank Loaned Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project in Gansu Province. The social assessment conforms to the requirements of World Bank and China’s Ministry of Finance on the Operational Guidelines for Performance Evaluation of International Financial Organization Loaned Projects.

1.4 Purposes of Social Assessment

The main purposes of social assessment include:

(1) To understand the basic socio-economic development situation of the project area, to analyze the major social factors that influence the achievement of project objectives.

(2) To identify the key stakeholder groups, carry out project activities for key stakeholder groups, analyze their needs and influences, especially the poor and ethnic minorities.

(3) To assess the potential positive and negative impacts of project, to analyze the social risks the project may bring.

(4) To take the related social factors attached with the achievement of the project’s objectives to the project design, to propose measures to avoid or minimize the negative social impacts.

(5) Identify suitable measures to mitigate negative impacts. Engage the communities through participation in the project and recommend actions to address social risks and impacts.
1.5 The Main Factors Affecting the Achievement of Project Objectives

During the social assessment phase, the main social factors include the behavior patterns of affected people, community participation and consultation, institutional arrangements, poverty, civil land, local environment, policy systems and so on.

Factors that may be encountered in the implementation phase include the socio-economic conditions, income levels and lifestyles, customs of affected population. In particular, the poverty problems of the distributions, extents and causes of poverty, the local public compensation and job placement are the main demands of the project.

Land Acquisition and Resettlement Impacts: The proposed sub-project may involve the land acquisition and resettlement. According to the requirements of the World Bank's land acquisition and resettlement policy OP4.12, the social assessment should further clarify the needs for land acquisition in the project. If it is confirmed that the project will acquire new land, then a resettlement action plan needs to be prepared.

Social Gender: Due to the change in the structure of the rural labor force, women, old people and children are left behind and has become the main population of the rural community. Young adult men have went out for migrant work. All of these reasons change the structure of the rural labor force significantly, which lead to a significant impact on social gender and traditional labor structure. Thus, social gender is an important factor to be taken into consideration in the project.

Community Participation: World Bank project emphasis on community participation. Through the implementation of the project, it is our aim to create and nurture community organization, to increase the right to know, voice and manage in the community, to promote the participation of community and vulnerable groups, and so as to lay the foundation for community sustainable development. If there is no community participation in the project area, lack of community organization nurture, the community will face the situation that interest demands can not be expressed, passive acceptance of local tourism development and low public support rate, which will affect the effective implementation of the project. Therefore, the project should pay attention to the public participation in the project area, and do our best to help the community villagers benefit from the local cultural and natural heritage protection and tourism development project, thus contributing to achieve the project objectives and sustainable development.

1.6 Methods of Social Assessment

The SA team conducted the field investigation in the project areas in March, 2019. Totally 297 questionnaires were collected, including 147 of villagers, 66 of business operators, 34 of government officials and 50 of visitors. After collecting and analyzing the basic data and information, the SA team completed this SA report.
The methods of social assessment adopted by the SA team mainly are participatory rural appraisal method (PRA). The social assessment was conducted combing with the questionnaires, direct observation, stakeholders interviews (including relevant government departments of management committee of scenic spot, Culture and Tourism Bureau, Poverty Alleviation Bureau and Women Federation, surrounding villagers, business operators and visitors), the villagers (community) meeting, SSI, interviews with key figures, the social gender perspective, participatory mapping and other methods of social assessment. The SA team made a detailed itinerary planning, contacted the local Development and Reform Commission in advance to obtain government information via the interviews conducted with local government departments; Then entered the scenic spot to get first-hand information via the interviews, visits, or SSI with surrounding villagers, business operators and tourists on the way or at home.

1.6.1 Direct Observation
After reaching the assessment area, the SA team members observed the surroundings first, such as road conditions (paths or highways), forests, agricultural land, houses, locals dress, appearance and mental state. These observations can provide information about local economic conditions, so that team members can have a direct perception about the workplace. In doing participatory investigation and assessment, the SA team members observed the situation of geography, agriculture, forestry, and vegetation. The observation can be done alone or with villagers, which will help to conduct in-depth investigation on certain issues and lay the foundation for the further interview.

1.6.2 Villager (Community) Meeting
Village (community) meeting is an important mean for overall community members to communicate and assist community to reach consensus and make decision. The PRA assessment should start from villager meeting, whose work should be informed to each family so as to get coordination of villagers, and encourage villagers to participate in and motivate activeness of all related persons. Successively, there will be some meetings allowing the collaborators to feedback information to community, and different groups of people can share results of investigation analysis for convenience of correction and supplement about collected information, community thus can reach consensus in aspects of basic situation, essential problems, reasons and solutions etc., finally make the decision.
1.6.3 Semi-structured Interview

Semi-structured interview is a kind of mode to acquire information directly with interviewees. It is a rapid learning process, which can be used in both individual interview and group interview. According to purpose and theme of investigation, analyze possible related factors, form secondary theme and take use of secondary theme to discuss problems in the interview. Semi-structured interview is made with some secondary themes formed in the interview process, thus endowing PRA team members with greater flexibility to further explore some problems and better understand local situation. In overall interview process, after PRA team members acquired more knowledge from theme of interview, can change secondary themes at any time and propose questions widely for convenience of reinforce further understanding about some problems they are interested in. Semi-structured interview is important channel to acquire information from illiterate and semi-literate group, which can not be replaced by structured or questionnaire interview. In the investigation process, team needs to make questionnaire investigation over villagers inside and around the scenic spots. However, due to the low educational level of the majority and deficiency in understanding the world bank project, difficulty in understanding the questionnaire. As a result, the interview must be conducted successively by degrees in order to acquire information in need.

1.6.4 Key Person Interview
Key person interview refers to interview with representative people related to the project. Due to specialty of Key staff’s profession and identity, more detailed local information and materials are needed. Interview with essential people can acquire more materials related to social impacts evaluation about project and explore internal information. In the investigation process over counties which the project scenic spots lie in, interview with key staff involved in social impacts evaluation about the project, and collect materials through meeting, relevant post petition, family visit etc. Key staff includes traditional community leaders (stockade village elder, leader in clansman, imam and lama etc.), teachers, doctors, village heads like village secretary, government officials, administrator and project officer in cultural and natural heritage scenic spots and so on. Social assessment mainly focuses on minority nationality, affected people, the poor, women, children, the old and disabled people.

The scope of the people whose social evaluation focuses on is as follows:

A. Ethnic minorities
B. Affected people of involuntary resettlement
C. Poor population
D. Women, children, the elderly and the disabled people
E. Employed persons in the scenic spot

1.6.5 Social Gender Perspective

Women are special group easily neglected whose status needs special attention. Among community development projects, women participation and cooperation is more needed. Women occupy more than 50% of the rural labor force. Their status and effects on resource use and protection is related to community development and sustainable use of resource. In order to realize the World Bank Twin Goals “Relieve Poverty and Share Prosperity”, the project specially focuses on the participation of vulnerable groups in project, as well as the influence after project implementation. In overall investigation process, collect materials like income, work and so on related to women from local women federation. While making individual interview, family interview, participatory observation and group discussion, pay special attention to participation and gender problem of women.

1.6.6 Participatory Mapping

One of important experiences of PRA is that farmers can do much that the outside world thinks impossible. In practice, farmers indicate their ability in drawing, modeling, sequencing, grading, evaluation, making chart and analysis with better performance than expected, which is also more practical compared with that is done by outsiders. The measuring instruments used by local people usually include: ground, stone, sand, seed, fruit (for grading, classification and counting), sticks and so on. Uneducated people can draw on paper. If possible, copies of aviation pictures can be used. Drawing is not the only purpose. In the process of participating in drawing, allow local people to
consider about their residential environment and develop discussion. In the process of drawing, there are often many people joining in discussing for everyone understands what to say. Participatory drawing can help understand attention and demands of the communities.

1.6.7 Questionnaire Survey

In order to gain detailed information to make social influence evaluation, the survey team formulated the investigation questionnaire, which targeting at community public in project area, local officials, tourists in the scenic spot, management personnel of scenic spot. The survey team get to know attitudes of different stakeholders to projects, and their different interests appeal through questionnaire, which will be important reference for altering the project plan, design and social evaluation of successive projects. The questionnaire survey satisfies the following requirements: cover all project-related areas (including poverty counties); the sampling proportion is determined according to the number of farmers affected by the project, ranging from 15-50%, and the minimum sample size is no less than 15% of the affected population, no less than 20% of poor households and no less than 30% of women's representatives.

1.6.8 Logical Framework
1.7 Data Source

1.7.1 First-hand Data
The SA team went to Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot from March 21 to April 2 in 2019, carried out the research and evaluation and obtained first-hand data through the methods of field observation, PRA of different stakeholder groups and questionnaire interviews.

1.7.2 Second-hand Data
Second-hand data is also an important source to understand local conditions. In the preparation phase, the team developed a detailed data collection list, which was distributed to the appropriate government departments to ensure the integrity and timeliness of all collection data. The government departments include Poverty Alleviation Office, Tourism Bureau, management committee of Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot. The data list is shown in Table 1-1:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Local Government Department</th>
<th>Document</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>People’s Government</td>
<td>1. The 13th Five-Year Development Plan of Jingtai County</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Project Area Development Plan of Jingtai County</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Protected Area System of Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot in Jingtai County</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Cultural relics protection units at all levels in Jingtai County and their protection scope and control area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Culture and Tourism Bureau</strong></td>
<td>5. Government work report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Description of the Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Project for the Second Phase of Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development Project in Gansu Province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. The 13th Five-Year Plan for the Development of Tourism Industry in Jingtai County</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Basic situation of tourism industry in Jingtai County</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poverty Alleviation Bureau</strong></td>
<td>1. Poverty situation in the project area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Management Committee of Scenic Spot</strong></td>
<td>1. Notice on the establishment of internal organs and personnel for the main duties of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Management Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Protection and development of cultural and natural heritage in Scenic Spot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Management System of Scenic Spot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Employees Roster of Scenic Spot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Tourism income in the Scenic Spot for the past five years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Marketing plan of scenic spot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Government of Longwan Township</strong></td>
<td>1. Self-evaluation report of rural tourism demonstration sites in Longwan Village, Jingtai County</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Basic situation of Zhongquan Township</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Brief introduction of Longwan Village in Zhongquan Township</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter II. Brief Introduction to Project County

2.1 Profile of Project Area

Jingtai County, located in the central part of Gansu Province, the upper reaches of the Yellow River, the southern margin of the Tengger Desert, and is at the junction of the three provinces (regions)- Gansu, Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region and Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region, is bordered by Baiyin City and Lanzhou City in the south, Tianshu Tibetan Autonomous County in the west and Alashan Alxa Left Banner in Nei Monggol Autonomous Region and Zhongwei City of Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region in the north.

Jingtai County has a total area of 5,483 km², administers 3 townships, 8 towns, 135 administrative villages and 8 communities with a total population of 240,000 people. Jingtai County has a long history and splendid culture with obvious location advantage-180 km away from Lanzhou (the provincial capital city), 100 km away from Zhongchuan Airport and 100 km away from Shapotou (a national 5A level scenic spot). It once was a post along the ancient Silk Road, a gateway at the eastern end of the Hexi Corridor, and a key-and-lock place to the provincial capital Lanzhou. Baotou-Lanzhou Railway, Gantang-Wuwei Railway, Provincial Highway Line 201 and Line 308 cross through the Jingtai County. Yingshuang Expressway, Jingtian Highway, the secondary roads of Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot has been completed and put into use. National Highway Line 338, Provincial Highway Line 217 and Line 317 pass through the Guicheng in Yongtai, Shoulu Mountain and Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot, a County-town-centered transportation network that can reach Baiyin and Lanzhou City in the south, Zhongwei and Yinchuan City in the North, Wuwei City and the Hexi Corridor in the west has gradually informed.

The terrain of Jingtai County is high in the southwest and is low in the northeast. The hills range accounts for about 3/4 of the county's area. The highest altitude is 3321 meters and the lowest one is 1276 meters. The climate of Jingtai County belongs to temperate arid continental type having 147.8 kcal/cm² annual solar radiation, 191 days frost-free period, average 2652 sunshine hours annually making the sunshine percentage as high as 60%.

Jingtai County achieved a total production value of 5.024 billion Yuans in 2017, a decrease of 1.1% from comparative price compared with 2016. Among them: the primary industry realized an added value of 1.22 billion Yuan, a year-on-year increase of 5%; the secondary industry realized an added value of 967 million Yuan, 12.4% year-on-year decline; the tertiary industry realized an added value of 2.835 billion Yuan, a
year-on-year increase of 2.8%. In 2017, Jingtai County completed a fixed asset investment of 5.115 billion Yuan with a decrease of 7.86% from the previous year. Among the fixed assets investment in cities and towns, the primary industry completed an investment of 535.61 million Yuan; the secondary industry completed 717.69 million Yuan; and the tertiary industry completed an investment of 3.20495 billion Yuan.

2.2 Overview of Tourism Development in the Project Area

Jingtai County has a national geological park named “Chinese Natural Wonders” and 4A-level Yellow River Stone Forest scenic spot, 3A-level Shoulu Mountain National Forest Park known as “In-Desert Green Island”, 3A-level Tianshan Farm known as film shooting base. Jingtai County has successively built 3 provincial film and TV series shooting bases-Great Dunhuang Film and TV series City, Yellow River Stone Forest Film and TV series City and Yongtai Ancient City. More than 70 famous films or TV series were shot here, such as “Quenching into Steel”, “Great Dunhuang” and “Myth”. The rural tourism of Jingtai County has its unique feature, a rural tourism development model has been formed based on Longwan Village called the land of idyllic beauty and Wufo township famous for red dates as the leading ones, integrating Tiaoshan Agricultural Reclamation Group tourism demonstrative site, the National gold medal winner of Happy Farmhouse called “Tiaoshan Farm Village”, beach club at Mount Bailin in the Wufo Village and other tourist resources. The revolution history sites such as Shuanglong Temple, the West-Road Army Battle Site, the West-Road Army Martyrs Cemetery, the Military Factory at Zhaojiashui, the Wufo Anti-Japanese Democracy Promotion Association and the Jingtai Power Engineering Memorial Park provide an important support for the revolutionary history tourism and patriotism education of Jingtai County.

The unique and monopolistic natural resources of Yellow River Stone Forest have been evaluated by domestic and foreign experts as: "Unique in China and rarely seen in the world, and can be called "Chinese natural wonders. "The Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot has become the shooting base of western films and TV programs with huge development potential after many films and TV dramas had been shot in the scenic area. The brand of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot has gradually been promoted, rated as “Gansu Province Patriotism Education Base”, “Gansu Provincial Film and Television Shooting Base”, “Gansu Provincial Photography Base” and selected as the a social training base for college students by many universities in Gansu province. The unique tourist resources and the magical cultural environment have made the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot gradually becomes a bright pearl in west China, one of the preferred destinations for sightseeing, leisure and vacation, scientific expedition and film shooting.

At present, there are 12 scenic spot operation entities in Jingtai County, including 33A-level scenic spots, 3 star-rated hotels, 11 tourist souvenirs production enterprises, 10
travel agencies, and 2 national-level rural tourism demonstration sites. There are 3 rural
tourism demonstration sites, more than 5,000 tourism practitioners, more than 6,000
beds in the county can be provided, and 7,800 dining places. From 2001 to the end of
June 2018, it has received a total of 14.109 million (times) domestic and foreign tourists,
achieving a comprehensive tourism income of 7.184 billion yuan, an average annual
increase of more than 20%.

Through the vigorous development of the tourism industry, brand creation has achieved
remarkable results. Longwan Village of Zhongquan Township was rated as “China's
Top Ten Most Beautiful Villages” by the Ministry of Agriculture and the National
Tourism Administration in 2013, was awarded the title “China's Beautiful Leisure
Village” by the Ministry of Agriculture in 2016. The Tiaoshan Farm Village was
awarded the first batch of “National Rural Tourism Gold Medal” and the pear flower
landscape of Tiaoshan Farm Village was recognized by the Ministry of Agriculture as
one of the “China’s 10 Pear Landscapes”; the Hongshaxian Agricultural Ecological Park
was recognized as the “National Leisure Agriculture and Rural Tourism Demonstration
Site” by the Ministry of Agriculture and the National Tourism Administration; The
Bailin Mountain Villa was rated as “China Rural Tourism Model Household” by the
National Tourism Administration; the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot won the
“Most Valuable Scenic Spot Brand” in the Top Ten Tourism Scenic Spot namely Top
Ten Charm Township Selection Activities called “Beautiful Gansu”; Jingdian Water
Conservancy Scenic Spot was rated as "National Water Conservancy Scenic Spot" by
the Ministry of Water Resources, and Shuigou Wetland Scenic Spot was rated as
"Provincial Water Conservancy Scenic Spot" by Gansu Provincial Water Conservancy
Department adding Highlights to the tourism brand construction of Jingtai County;
Longwan Village in Zhongquan Township, Xiyuan Village in Wufo Township, Xihe
Village in Caowo Beach are listed as “Gansu Provincial Rural Tourism Demonstration
Village”; Shuigou Wetland Park in Jingtai County, Berlin Mountain Villa, Fengle
Mountain Villa, the Yellow-River Tower were named as "Gold Medal Happy
Farmhouse of Gansu Province " by Gansu Province Tourism Commission. In 2018,
Hongshaxian Ecological Park in Jingtai County, Stone Forest Househould Farmhouse
and Xiangrui MountainVilla and other farmhouses were bestowed the “Rural
Tourism Demonstration Award” by Gansu Provincial Tourism Commission; Gansu
Tiaoshan Farm Village Limited Liability Company and Yellow River Stone Forest
International Campsite of Jingtai County was awarded the “Tourism Integration
Innovation Award” by Gansu Provincial Tourism Commission; Bailin Mountain Villa
of Jingtai County was awarded “Village Inn Award” by Gansu Provincial Tourism
Commission.

In October 2016, Jingtai County was listed by the National Tourism Administration as
the second batch of “National Global Tourism Demonstration Zone”. In 2018, the
scenic spot received 52,570 tourists-times and the income was 6,308,400 yuan. By the
end of 2018, the Scenic Spot had received 1,838,700 person-times, and the accumulated tourism income was 478,682,400 yuan. Among them, there were 0 overnight visitors in 2018 and 52.57 million one-day tourists; the cumulative number of overnight visitors was 550,900 and the number of one-day visitors was 912,270/times. In 2018, Jingtai county received a total of 2,991,300 tourists-times, a year-on-year increase of 23.87%, and achieved a comprehensive tourism income of 1.909 billion yuan, an increase of 30.06% than previous year. Among them, rural tourism received a total of 1,669,200 tourists, achieving a comprehensive tourism income of 338,103,200 yuan, an increase of 29.25%.

2.3 Poverty Situation in the Project Area

Understanding the poverty situation in the project area, systematically designing and improving the project implementation contents, and explore the operational modes and approaches of “alleviating poverty and sharing prosperity”, which has epoch-making significance.

Jingtai County was listed in the national poverty-stricken key county of Liupanshan District in 2011, and it was one of 58 the most poverty-stricken counties in Gansu Province. From 2014 to 2018, 11,057 households with 42,337 people have been withdrawn from poverty. In the past five years, the per capita disposable income of the poverty-stricken households in the county was respectively 2,764 yuan, 3,201 yuan, 4,338 yuan, 5,061 yuan, and 7,240 yuan, reaching the standard of out of poverty.

The county has accumulatively exited 51 poverty-stricken villages, with the lowest incidence rate of poverty of 0.08% and the highest rate of 2.64%.

Longwan Village, where the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot is located, administers 5 villager groups, 665 households with 2,396 people. In 2018, there were 4 households with 9 persons lifted out of poverty (an increase of 3 people naturally, 3 of them have been lifted out of poverty, and naturally reduced by 7 people, 5 of whom have been lifted out of poverty, and 2 of whom are out of poverty in 2018). There are 9 households with 11 people who were not out poverty. The incidence of poverty was 0.46%.
Chapter III. Demographic analysis of project area

Jingtai County governs 8 towns, 3 townships, 135 administrative villages and 7 communities. Jingtai County has a population of 239,000 people, of which the 237,362 Han peoples account for 99.31% and 1,638 ethnic minorities account of 0.68% total population. The ethnic minorities include 860 Hui people, 375 Dongxiang people, 232 Tibetans, 78 Zhuang people, 68 Man people, 15 Uygur people and 10 Tu people. Longwan Village of Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot governs 5 administrative villager groups and has a population of 665 households with 2,396 people that are all Han people.

According to the term of World Bank for indigenous people in project, the assessment of the ethnic minorities in this project area shows that there is no IP people present. The total population of 5 project villager groups of Longwan Village consists of 665 households with 2,396 people, all of them are Han people who is the majority population in China. Therefore, the SA concludes that the OP4.10 policy of indigenous people is not applicable to this subproject and there is no need to prepare an Ethnic Minority Development Plan (EMDP).
Chapter IV. Current Situation of Cultural and Natural Heritage in Project Area

4.1 Current Status of Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection of Project County

The Yellow River Stone Forest in Jingtai County has rich cultural and natural heritage and intangible cultural heritage resources according to the investigation. Jingtai County also attaches great importance to the protection of cultural and natural cultural heritage and intangible cultural heritage, and has successively issued a series of protection programs which are mainly dominated by local government and implemented by special heritage protection team.

Jingtai County focuses on the improvement and governance of the natural heritage environment, the restoration and reconstruction of cultural heritage although active heritage protection actions have been taken, and the protection and inheritance of the intangible culture of local ethnic groups, folk customs and religions was not enough. Nationality, folklore and religious culture are the embodiment of the spiritual life of local people, thus the intangible cultural heritage protection has great significance for the protection of national culture and the inheritance of traditional morality.

4.1.1 Protection Policies of Jingtai County

The departments at all levels of Jingtai County are strictly in accordance with follow policies:

1. People's Republic of China on Nature Reserves Regulations
2. Regulations on the Management of Natural Reserves in Gansu Province
4. Regulations on the Protection of Cultural Relics in Gansu Province
5. Notice on Publicizing the 8th Batch of Construction Control Zone List of Provincial Cultural Relics Project Unit issued by Gansu Provincial Cultural Relics Bureau and Provincial House and Urban-rural Development Department [2017]No.12
6. Notice on Publicizing the 8th Batch of Protection Scope of Provincial Cultural Relics Units issued by the government of Gansu Province [2017]No.84
7. Notice on Publicizing the 1st Batch of Construction Control Zone List of Baiyin Cultural Relics Project Unit issued by the Baiyin Government [2019]No.39
8. Notice on Publicizing the 3rd Batch of County Cultural Relics Protection Units issued by Jingtai County
4.1.2 Protection Plan of Project Scenic Spot
In order to strengthen the protection and management of the natural environment and natural resources of Yellow River Stone Forest Nature Reserve (hereinafter referred to as the “protected area”), the “Regulations for the Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Provincial Nature Reserve in Gansu Province” was formulated combing with the “Regulations on the Nature Reserve of the People’s Republic of China” and the “Regulations on the Management of Natural Reserves in Gansu Province” and related laws and regulations. The Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Geological Heritage Nature Reserve Management Station (hereinafter referred to as the Management Station) is the administrative body of the protected area. It is responsible for the specific management of the protected area. The management station is affiliated to the Jingtai County Natural Resource Bureau and accepts the leadership of the Jingtai County Natural Resource Bureau.

4.2 Tourism Development Status of Cultural and Natural Heritage in the Project Area

4.2.1 Tourism Development Policies of Jingtai County
The 13th Five-Year Plan for Tourism Industry Development of Jingtai County (2016-2020) proposes the positioning and goals of tourism development in Jingtai County:

① Development positioning. Through the improvement of tourism industry development and leisure service functions, it will focus on improving the overall tourism image and brand of Jingtai County, comprehensively improve the service function system, and strive to make Jingtai County a famous tourism county and national tourism demonstration zone.

② Development goals. The establishment of the national tourism demonstration zone has passed the inspection, the tourism attraction has made substantial progress in attracting investment, the tourism industry has increased investment, the infrastructures have been continuously improved, the quality of the scenic spot has been continuously improved, the service level has been significantly enhanced, the tourism poverty alleviation effect has been remarkable, and the popularity of Jingtai tourism has been greatly improved. The industrial economic development has achieved new breakthroughs. There are a national 5A-level tourist scenic spot, a 4A-level tourist scenic spot, four 3A-level tourist scenic spot, 10 tourism professional villages, 8 rural tourism demonstration sites, and 150 standardized farmhouses were built. Jingtai County will strive to reach 4 million tourists in 2020, with a comprehensive tourism income of over 2 billion yuan, an increase of more than 20%.

The "Opinions on Accelerating the Construction of a Strong Tourism City" issued by Baiyin Development Committee ([2018] No. 30) clearly defines the status of the
construction of the leading scenic spot in the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot, and requires the strengthening of the Scenic Spot infrastructure and tourism supporting facilities, and strives to make the Yellow River Stone Forest become a leading scenic spot. Jingtai County issued the “Implementation Plan for Accelerating the Construction of Famous Tourism Counties”, which clarified the needs to strengthen the construction of scenic spots infrastructure and tourism supporting facilities, and ensure that the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot will be built into a national 5A-level scenic spot and a global geological park in 2020. The project is implemented under this background that can introduce advance experience and concepts, accelerate the development and transforming of culture, agriculture, forestry and every resources and enhance the development motive force of tourism. The Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot has contributed to the work of Gansu Provincial tourism industry. At the same time, it promotes the economic restructuring of Jingtai County, promotes the sustainable development of the county economy, and drives the surrounding people to become rich.

4.2.2 Development Plan of Project Scenic Spot

The overall goal of the development plan of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot is to develop the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot into a national tourist attraction. The guiding ideology is to objectively grasp the characteristics of tourism development and market demand, comprehensively coordinate the development of tourism industry with the construction of new countryside and the integration of large industries; the plan is guided with the sustainable development concept and humanism ideology, makes series of tourism products, tourism brand and improves service environment, constructing a tourism development model with practical operational significance, and promoting the comprehensive healthy and sustainable development of the Yellow River Stone Forest Tourist Area.

The brand's goal is to build the Yellow River Stone Forest into an internationally influential tourist resort. The details are as follows:

1. **China's most beautiful county.** In combination with the construction of the new countryside, the village environment will be rectified in Longwan Village, enriching the tourist landscape and tourism essays. On the basis of maintaining the original ecological environment of rural tourism, the public facilities such as tourist toilets will be upgraded to build a beautiful village with a folk customs in the northwest.

2. **China's most quality holiday resort.** In accordance with the requirements of national tourist resorts, the management committee has elaborately designed the landscape of rural tourism resorts on the basis of consideration of art show, health, leisure and religious worship and plans to make the scenic spot become a quality tourism and holiday base.
3. **National 5A level scenic spot and World Geopark.** In accordance with the declaration standards of national 5A level scenic spot and the World Geopark, the scenic spot prepares the improvement plan on infrastructures and brand marketing referring to the protection requirements of public service facility and geopark. After that, the scenic spot will declare the national scenic spot with 5A level.

4. **World Natural Heritage.** On the basis of strict protection of geological resources, in accordance with the declaration standards of the World Natural Heritage Sites, the scenic spot plans to entered the list of World Natural Heritage Site Preparation List under the coordination of National Cultural Relics Bureau of Gansu Province as soon as possible. And the scenic spot will declare the brand alone or in conjunction with similar geological landscapes under appropriate conditions, strive to be listed in the World Natural Heritage Site Preparation List at the end of the planning period and make a preliminary basis for the finalization of the World Natural Heritage.

5. **Western Film and TV series Shooting Base.** Based on the unique natural and humanistic environment in the western region, the film and TV series shooting base constantly expand and enrich the shooting scenes and contents, and actively build the industrial chain of shooting, filming creation and producing that make the Yellow River Stone Forest become a well-known western film and TV series shooting base.

4.2.3 **Comment on the Policy and Planning of Heritage Tourism Development**

Through the analysis of the tourism development of the Yellow River Stone Forest Project Area in Jingtai County, Jingtai County pays more attention to the development of tourism in the region, especially the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot as the top priority of tourism development, and regards the development of tourism as a driving force. An important aspect of economic development has been tailored to local tourism development. Summarizing the above tourism development planning and development plans of the scenic spot, it is discovered that all tourism planning is government-led, is lack of community participation, and the planning does not fully analyze and proof the needs of stakeholders in the Scenic Spot. The claims of vulnerable groups are less considered.

In order to promote the sustainable development of the scenic spot, the SA team puts forward the following suggestions:

1. The development of community organizations is a necessary condition for the success of the construction of the project area. Longwan Village is located in the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot, where the development and construction of the scenic spot is closely related to the interests of the local villagers. Due to the previous work, the local government and the farmers are not trusting each other. Therefore, it is
urgent to establish local community organizations. Through community organizations, the project build a dialogue platform for the government and local villagers to find common interests, play the role of the community organization, thus promote project construction and development.

2. Transportation is an important aspect for tourists to choose their destinations. The development of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot must first consider improving the traffic environment and not making the traffic problem a bottleneck for local tourism development.

3. The tourism development plan formulated by the local government spot should reach an agreement with the development plan of the scenic that ensure the smooth development of tourism in the project scenic spot;

4. The local planning and construction is mostly the development of natural landscapes and cultural relics, and pays less attention to the development of intangible cultural heritage, such as folk custom. In the future work, the development of community cultural industries should be stressed.

5. At present, various scenic spots mainly focus on tourism and leisure experiences, and lack of advanced “idyllic complex” tourism projects such as vacation and eco-tourism. And the tourists stay less time in the scenic spot and spend less time that relatively leads the low income for the scenic spot.

6. The development of tourism in various scenic spots is obviously insufficient relying on itself and local government. It is necessary to strengthen regional cooperation by linking every administrative area and actively integrated into overall regional economic and social development.

7. The government has low fiscal revenue. It is difficult to raise sufficient funds to protect and develop various types of heritage resources in the short term. Although local governments have formulated detailed tourism development plans, the implementation of plan can not be guaranteed due to less funds. Therefore, there is an urgent need for sufficient external financial support.
4.3 Analysis of the Management Status on Cultural and Natural heritage in the project area

4.3.1 Basic Conditions of Infrastructure and Tourism Development of the Project Scenic Spot

Due to the limited financial resources of the municipal finance and county-level finance, it is unable to meet the construction needs of the scenic spot. In addition, the development and construction of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot is slow to start and the progress is also slow. The current scenic infrastructure, cultural heritage inheritance and natural heritage protection, improvement of community villagers' skills training and community environment improvement have large shortcomings and are lagging behind that lead the low income of scenic spot. The newly formed Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Cultural Tourism Development Co., Ltd. has less registered funds and less fixed assets. The construction of scenic spot are serious lacking funds due to the difficult financing loan.

4.3.2 Management Organization of Heritage –based Tourist Scenic Spots

The "Notice on the Establishment of Internal Organs and Personnel for the Main Duties of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Management Committee" ([2017] No. 10 ) describes the main duties, internal institutions, staffing and leadership positions of the Scenic Spot management committee's arrangement in detail. The "Notice of the Jingtai County People's Government Office on the Establishing of Project Leadership Group of the World Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural Natural Heritage Protection and Development Phase II Project Jingtai County Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot" is issued to further improve the infrastructure construction of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot and ensure the smooth implementation of the project.

4.3.3 Other Government Departments that May Involved in the Project

The implementation of the World Bank-loaned Gansu Natural and Cultural Heritage Protection and Development Project requires the cooperation of various local government departments. The relevant government departments involved include the Scenic Spot Management Committee, the Development and Reform Bureau (Committee), the Culture, Sports, Radio and Tourism Bureau, Transportation Bureau, Construction Bureau, Finance Bureau, Water Conservation Bureau, Agricultural and Rural Bureau, Forestry and Grassland Bureau, Education Bureau, Natural Resources Bureau, Environmental Protection Bureau, Human Resource Bureau, Labor and Social Security Bureau, Immigration Bureau, Poverty Alleviation Office, Commodity Price Bureau and Law Enforcement Bureau.

The government departments involved in the project are in charge of:

**Scenic Spot Management Committee**: is responsible for the World Bank project implementation, coordination with other government departments and management,
planning and development of scenic spot.

**Transportation Bureau**: is in charge of transportation planning and construction in the project area.

**Finance Bureau**: is responsible for the project budget and funds allocation of cultural heritage development in the project area.

**Water Conservation Bureau**: is responsible for water conservation in the project area.

**Agricultural and Rural Bureau**: is responsible for guiding the farmers on animal breeding and plant cultivating.

**Forestry and Grassland Bureau**: is responsible for animal and plant conservation and returning the farming land to forest.

**Education Bureau**: is responsible for children going to school and the capacity improvement of management staff.

Natural Resources Bureau: is responsible for land use issues during the construction.

**Nature Resource Bureau**: is responsible for environmental protection during the construction.

**Human Resource Bureau**: is responsible for disputes and appeals of villagers' interests that may arise during project implementation.

**Labor and Social Security Bureau**: is responsible for the villagers’ employment offered by the scenic spot.

**Poverty Alleviation Office**: is responsible for supporting the poor farmer out of poverty and share the interest brought by economic development.

**Commodity Price Bureau**: is responsible for pricing control of gate ticket, entertainment, meals, accommodation and goods.

**Law Enforcement Bureau**: is responsible for ensuring the smooth implementation of every planning and policies, supervising the illegal behaviour and cheating behaviour may occur in the scenic spot.
Chapter V. Analysis of Stakeholders in the Project Area

5.1 Identification of Stakeholder Groups

The SA team identified the following stakeholder groups through the research:

1. Local community villagers: Jingtai County Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot and its surrounding areas involve Longwan Village of Zhongquan Township, which has 5 villager groups under its jurisdiction, and the existing population is 665 households with 2,396 people.

2. Affected people of Land acquisition and house demolition: According to the previous investigation, the project involves land acquisition affecting Longwan Village, an administrative village in Zhongquan Township, Jingtai County. The impact of land acquisition and house demolition of this project includes the permanent requisition of various types of land, the demolition of simple houses, and the removal of attachments on the ground. Total 45 households of 186 people affected by the project, among them, permanent land acquisition is planned to acquire 64 mu of arable land, the total area of simple houses to be demolished is 117 m², affecting 4 households with 11 persons in Longwan Village.

3. Poor people: Longwan Village has 5 villager groups, 665 households with 2,396 people. As of June 2019, there were 9 households with 11 persons still poor. The incidence of poverty was 0.46%.

4. Women: Questionnaire surveys were conducted around the scenic spot, including 147 questionnaires for villagers, 66 business operators, 34 officials and 50 tourists from scenic spots, totaled 297 questionnaires. Among them, there are 59 women in the questionnaire, 22 women in business operators, only 3 women in the officials, and 24 women in the scenic spot. Among the respondents, female officials accounted for 21.4%, female villagers accounted for 40.1%, and female operators accounted for 33.3%.

5. Local government: The government departments involved in the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot in Jingtai County mainly include the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Management Committee, Jingtai County Cultural and Sports Radio and Tourism Bureau, and Jingtai County Poverty Alleviation Office. The project mainly led by the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Management Committee. Other departments assist.

6. Business operators and construction parties: Business operators in scenic spot refer to the merchants that carry out commercial activities in the scenic spot. These merchants have gained certain benefits in the development and construction of scenic
spots, and also played a role in promoting the multi-functional construction of scenic spots. Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot involve 60 family farmhouses, 30 recreational karts, 351 animal-powered vehicles and 300 donkey carts. The construction party refers to the project construction implementer, including the infrastructure construction unit, the pastoral complex construction unit, etc., They undertake project construction through the bidding.

7. **Tourists in the scenic spot**: As the direct consumers, the tourists have the most intuitive understanding and experience of the construction achievements of the scenic spot. They are the beneficiaries and observers. Their opinions and suggestions can reflect the development of the scenic spot. By the end of 2018, the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot had received a total of 1,838,700 tourists/times since the launch, and in 2018, the number of tourists received was 52,570 tourists/times.

**5.2 Needs Assessment of Stakeholder Groups**

1. **Local community villagers**: The scenic spot invests in improving infrastructure and amusement facilities, attracting tourists, increasing tourism income in scenic spot; increasing villager training, providing more jobs that attracting young people work in the scenic spot; the farmers express that the loan amount for farmer is less, and they wish their fruit orchard in the scenic spot can be insured; the opinions can be adopted by the scenic spot with the multi-negotiation; the villagers hope the scenic spot can share the partial of interests for surrounding villagers; the appeal shall be deal with in time and their basic life standard shall be guaranteed. The farmers are willing to establish the community organizations which meet their needs. The farmers can participate in the construction of scenic spot through the community organizations and benefit from the development of scenic spot.

2. **Affected people of land acquisition and house demolition**: The affected people of land acquisition and house demolition of the project hope that the process will be open, fair and transparent. The land acquisition process should allow the community villagers to participate, and has a corresponding grievance redress mechanism to ensure the legal rights and interests of the affected households, and obtain land acquisition compensation and corresponding resettlement plan in line with the policy standards.

3. **Poor population**: The poor population hopes to participate in the construction of the project and obtains a stable source of income. After the project completion, they can participate in the tourism service of scenic spot and gain profits and income through the development of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot.

4. **Women**: Among the respondents, women accounted for 40%, of which 47.5% were aged over 55 years old. Most of them are mainly farmers, and there are more women participating in the project such as the donkey cart, sheepskin raft, karting business and etc. In the survey, they hope that the scenic spot will develop better and attract more
5. **Local government**: the local government is willing to speed up the construction progress of the project, improve the planning, put the project into use as soon as possible. More local villagers participate in the tourism operation and service, and the villagers’ abilities staff’s management ability shall be enhanced. The planning is scientific and reasonable, and is in line with the development and construction master plan of Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot; improve the infrastructure construction of the scenic spot, enhance the core competitiveness of the scenic spot, and build the tourism brand of Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest.

6. **Business operators and construction entity**: the construction entity will adjust tourists' routes, allowing tourists to enter commercial streets to increase merchants' income; the scenic spot management committee will conduct unified management of various merchants, strengthen tourism service capacity building, enhance tourism reception capacity, and improve tourism services; the scenic spot management party will unified manage the donkey carts, complete the house renovation as soon as possible, and improve the commercial management of the Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Central Commercial Street. During the construction process, the construction party hopes to obtain the cooperation of the local government and community villagers; after the completion of the project, it can withdraw funds as soon as possible.

7. **Tourists in scenic spots**: the scenic spot shall strengthen the standardized management of scenic spots, unify the charging standards, reduce the price cheating; improve the spot marking, infrastructure construction, entertainment facilities, etc.; increase the tourism service facilities such as catering and accommodation in scenic spots to obtain better travel and sightseeing experience.

5.3 **Ways and Measures for Stakeholders to Participate in the Project**

1. **Local community villagers**: Local governments should create opportunities and channels for local public participation, encourage them to pay attention to the implementation and progress of World Bank projects, and build community organizations to involve community villagers in project construction. By organizing various forms of symposiums (such as governmental forums of government officials and public representatives, symposiums of Scenic Spot managers and community organizations), interviews with tourists, network research, and community organization exchange activities, a convenient channel for public participation in the project.

2. **Affected people of land acquisition and house demolition**: ① **consultation**: Negotiate with the community villagers, especially the affected people and project
3. **Poor population**: During the project development, the scenic spot managers provide public welfare jobs for the poor people, and ensure the poor people can participate in the construction of the project. After the project is completed, they will participate in the scenic tourism service and obtain a stable source of income.

4. **Women**: Women's participation in Scenic Spot mainly is operating farmhouse restaurants, shops, roadside stalls and donkey carts, sheepskin rafts, go-karts and other scenic entertainment projects. At the same time, the establishment of community organizations should be attended by a certain percentage of women, monitoring the implementation process of the project and enhancing women's capacity building.

5. **Local government**: Local governments include Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Management Committee, Jingtai County Culture, Sports, Radio and Tourism Bureau and other tourism resources authorities and tourism market authorities formulate the plans and opinions which are conducive to the development of local tourism; Market supervision, standardize tourism management of scenic spots; it is suggested that expand the tourism market, and use the official media to increase the promotion of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot.

6. **Business operators and construction entity**: There are a large number of commercial and private institutions in and around the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot, most of which are opened by local villagers, mainly are shops, farmhouses restaurants and farm hotels. During the project implementation, the tourism business capacity building of scenic spots should be upgraded, tourism services should be standardized, tourism service brands should be established, brand management should be carried out, the influence of scenic spots should be expanded that increase the income and attract more tourists. During the construction process, the project construction party should actively maintain the cooperative relationship with the local villagers and the government, and let the villagers understand the construction content and obtain support through villagers' discussions.

7. **Tourists in scenic spots**: The construction and development of scenic spots is mainly to better serve tourists and attract more tourists is an important target for the
development of scenic spots. The government should increase the propaganda of scenic spots, regulate the management of tourism services, and promote local tourism consumption; in the tourist season, control the flow of tourists, ease the pressure on scenic spots, and improve the quality of services.
Chapter VI. Project Suitability Analysis

The SA team conducted a field survey in the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot to analyze whether the project can be accepted by the local social environment and human conditions, the extent to which the local government and villagers support the project, as well as examine the mutual adaptation relationship between the project and the local social environment. The team analyzed and predicts the attitudes and participation of different stakeholders directly on project construction and operation, the attitudes of different organizations in the project area to project construction and operation and also analyze whether the social environment and cultural status of the project area can adapt to the project construction and development needs.

Different stakeholder groups have different requirements and expectations for the project. Maximally meet the requirements and expectations of stakeholders, and maximizing project value and minimizing cooperation costs have become the key to successful project implementation. In order to better analyze the project's Adaptability, the stakeholder groups are divided into local villagers, local business operators (street vendors, hotels and farmhouses), government officials, tourists and so on.

6.1 Participation of Different Stakeholders

1. Local community villagers

The main survey for the villagers around the scenic spot was a questionnaire survey, and 150 questionnaires were distributed, with a 100% recovery rate. Among them, male villagers accounted for 58.7%, female villagers accounted for 41.3%, and no ethnic minorities. According to the statistics of the questionnaire, 72.7% of the villagers pay attention to and support the development and construction of the scenic spot, 27.3% of the villagers do not pay attention to the development and construction of the scenic spot; 88% of the villagers think that the family has benefited from the local tourism development, and 12% of the villagers think that the family does not get the benefits from it.

81.3% of the villagers lived in the scenic spot, only 18.7% of the villagers lived in the scenic spot; 79.3% of the villagers who participated in the scenic spot work in the amusement project; 10% of the villagers engaged in the retail of small commodities, and others participated in the scenic spot with farmhouse operation, touring introduction and other work; 2% of the villagers are engaged in Scenic Spot 0management, cleaning, facility construction and maintenance. 69.4% of the villagers participated in the scenic spot work through private participation, and 12.9% participated in the scenic spot work through government support. After participating in the scenic spot work, 57.3% of the households’ income increased significantly before the work; 35.5% of the households’ income increased before, but the increase was not
much. The households participating in the survey earned an average of 13,800 yuan per year from the work of the scenic spot.

62.7% of the villagers believe that the development of local tourism has not damaged the local ecological environment, 22% of the villagers believe that the development of local tourism has slightly damaged the ecological environment, and 9.3% of the villagers believe that the local tourism industry has made the local natural environment better. 6% of villagers believe that the development of tourism has seriously damaged the local ecological environment.

92% of the villagers welcome tourists to the local area, and 8% of the villagers do not pay attention. Most villagers believe that the influx of tourists will bring local income, so they have a positive attitude.

On the whole, most of the villagers around the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot supported the implementation of this project, and participated in the development of the scenic spot, with a high degree of participation. Most of the community villagers opened small shops, donkey carts, farmhouse restaurants, etc. in the Scenic Spot. The development of the scenic spot is highly concerned by the community villagers, and the community villagers hope to further promote the local economic development through tourism development.

2. Land requisitioned households
The SA team held 3 seminars with 107 land acquisition affected households in Longwan Village, Zhongquan Township, and distributed 150 questionnaires, including 62 women, accounting for 41.3%; 88 males, accounting for 58.7%; there is 11 people in poverty, accounting for 7.3%. During the investigation, 90% of the families expressed their support for the scenic spot management committee to invest in the construction of scenic spots. Especially for the construction of riverside roads in road projects, the villagers of Longwan Village showed quite high enthusiasm. And hope the relevant departments can start construction as soon as possible in order to quickly and effectively solve the transportation problem of tourists and villagers. At the same time, 85% of families feel that the construction of this project can effectively improve the traffic conditions and attract more tourists, which is conducive to promoting the economic development of Longwan Village, increasing employment opportunities and improving villagers' income and living standards.

3. Local government officials
In this survey, the way to interact with local government officials was mainly to hold symposiums and issue questionnaires. The SA team interviewed with three functional departments, including the scenic area management committee, poverty alleviation office, cultural and sports broadcasting and tourism bureau. A total of 34 questionnaires were distributed to government officials with a 100% recovery rate. Among them, male officials accounted for 78.6%, and female officials accounted for 21.4%. According to
the questionnaire analysis, 42.8% of the officials believe that the implementation of the World Bank project is facing difficulties for local villagers to cooperate; 21.4% of the officials believe that the main difficulty in implementing the World Bank project is poor local traffic conditions; 14.2% of officials believe that the difficulties encountered in implementation are that information is not smooth, 7.2% believe that policy support is insufficient, 7.2% think local officials are not motivated, and 7.2% choose others. For the negative impact of the World Bank on the local area, 7.2% of officials believe that it will occupy residential areas and fields, 14.4% of officials believe that it will increase the cost of Scenic Spot management, and 78.4% of officials believe that there will be no negative impact.

Regarding the sub-projects that the World Bank project should focus on in the future, 100% of the officials believe that it is the infrastructure construction of the local scenic spot; 78.6% of the officials believe that the training of scenic spot management should be strengthened; 71.5% of the officials believe that the protection of cultural heritage should be emphasized; 71.5% of officials believe that attention should be paid to the development of farmhouses around the scenic spot; 42.8% of officials believe that ecological environment management; 42.8% of officials believe that it should strengthen the promotion of scenic spots. Regarding the main direction of future development of the scenic spot, 92.8% of officials prefer cultural tourism and sightseeing; 85.7% of officials prefer ecotourism; 85.7% of officials prefer adventure tourism.

4. Local business operators (street vendors, hotels and farmhouses)
The main survey for business operators in the scenic spot was a questionnaire survey, which issued a total of 66 questionnaires with a 100% recovery rate. Among them, male villagers accounted for 66.7%; female villagers accounted for 33.3%; no minority business operators.

86.4% of business operators made a living by farming and working before engaging into business; 57.6% of business operators participated in the business of the scenic spot, the income has been increased, but not much; 33.3% of business operators participated in the scenic spot business, There has been a significant increase in the family income; the other 9.1% of business operators have no change in income. The average business operators of the scenic spot surveyed were engaged in business for 7 years, and the average net income earned by each family from the scenic business was 8,300 yuan/year.

On the whole, the business operators in the scenic spots have a high degree of participation. They participate in the development of scenic spots through commercial management and job training, and have gained benefits from the development of the scenic spot.
5. Tourists n the scenic spot
Tourists in the scenic spot mainly was investigated with the form of questionnaire survey, and issued 50 questionnaires with 100% recovery rate. 52% of them are male tourists and 48% are female tourists.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 6-1 Tourist Satisfactory Questionnaire in the Scenic Spot</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service Quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment of Scenic Spot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value of Scenic Spot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price Standard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic Condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guiding Sign</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accommodation Condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recreational Facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ticket of Scenic Spot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive Comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sourced from questionnaires

Tourists who come to the scenic spot spend the most time on transportation, mainly because the scenic spot is far from Jingtai County and there is no public transportation. Visitors need to take the bus or drive to the scenic spot, so the transportation cost is high. Tourists from the scenic spots are mainly from neighboring provinces such as Gansu, Sichuan, and Shanxi. 74% of tourists have plans to visit again, indicating that the scenic spots are more attractive to tourists. 40% of the tourists are introduced by friends, 30% of the tourists know the scenic spot through the network, 30% of the tourists know the scenic spot through the newspapers, advertisements, travel brochures, etc., indicating the promotion of the scenic spot is good, most visitors can learn about the scenic spot through advertising.
### 6.2 Participation of Various Organizations

#### 1. Relevant government functional departments
The main competent department of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot is the Management Committee, which has 48 staff and leader positions. The project has set up a leading group office, which is located in the management committee consisting of a comprehensive coordination group (PMO), project approval group, financial security group, land security group, and formalities approval group and the agriculture-related implementation group.

**Comprehensive coordination group (PMO):** The Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Management Committee is responsible for the specific daily work. It is mainly responsible for the project staff composition, project feasibility study report, project planning and design, social stability evaluation, environmental assessment and other preparation work, project bidding, supervision, payment and other works in the project implementation as well as the project audit, final accounting, acceptance and other project completion work.

**The Project approval group:** the county development and reform bureau takes the lead, the Yellow River Stone Forest Management Committee and the County Cultural Tourism Bureau cooperate to coordinate the preliminary feasibility study and initial establishment of the project, and coordinate the provincial and municipal development and reform bureau, and the cultural and tourism departments.

**Financial security group:** The county finance bureau takes the lead, which is responsible for the financial repayment commitments; the implementation of local supporting funds; coordination of provincial and municipal financial departments and other related work.

**Land security group:** The county natural resources bureau takes the lead and Zhongquan Township cooperates, and the group is responsible for land procedures, planning procedures and project land supply.

**Formalities approval group:** Yellow River Stone Forest Management Committee takes the lead, Jingtai Branch of Baiyin City Ecological Environment Bureau, County Water Affairs Bureau, County Housing and Urban and Rural Construction Bureau cooperate. The group mainly is responsible for project environmental assessment procedures approval, soil and water conservation program approval and river procedures approval; construction Licensing and other procedures.

**Agriculture-related implementation group:** The County Agricultural and Rural Bureau takes the lead, and Zhongquan Township cooperates to assist “three changes” agricultural revolution and the implementation of the rural complex.
2. Community organizations
There are no tourism-related community organizations in and around the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot. However, in order to promote the development of community organizations, community participation and community organizations have been designed under the World Bank project. The establishment, incubation and cultivation of community organizations will increase local public participation, enhance the participation of villagers in scenic spots, enhance the capacity building of villagers' tourism services, inject vitality into the development of the project, foster community organization talents, and promote the building of villagers' own capabilities by participating in the development of scenic spots and improve the income level of villagers.

6.3 Local Social Environment and Landscape Features
6.3.1 Local Social Environment
1. Policy support
During the 13th Five-Year Plan period, the Yellow River Stone Forest was listed as the key development tourist attraction in Jingtai County. The tourism industry in Jingtai County is firmly in accordance with the scientific development concept, and placed the tourism planning work in an important position to complete the “Jingtai County Tourism Industry Development Master Plan” and 11 scenic spot planning. The related policies were issued: "Jingtai County Tourism Industry Development 13th Five-Year Plan (2016-2020)", "Yellow River Stone Forest Tourism Area Master Plan" (Revision), "Detailed Rules for the Construction of Important Nodes in the Yellow River Stone Forest Tourism Area", "Planning for the Yellow River Stone Forest Pastoral Characteristic Picking Garden Project", "2019 Yellow River Stone Forest Winter Marketing Promotion Plan". In order to strengthen the protection and management of the natural environment of the Yellow River Stone Forest Nature Reserve, according to the Regulations of the People's Republic of China on Nature Reserves, the Regulations on the Management of Natural Reserves in Gansu Province, and related laws and regulations, combined with local conditions, Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Geological Relics Nature Reserve Management Station and the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Land and Resources Institute have formulated the “Regulations for the Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Provincial Nature Reserve in Gansu Province” and the “Regulations on the Protection of Geological Relics”.

The Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot is now national geographic park, national 4A-level scenic spot and one of 11 provincial key scenic spots. By 2020, three A level scenic spot has newly added or updated in the Jingtai County. The Yellow River Stone Forest has successfully applied for the title of World Geopark and the national 5A level tourist attraction.

In order to learn the "Opinions on Accelerating the Construction of a Strong Tourism Province" issued by the Provincial Party Committee and the Provincial Government in
February 2018 and the "Opinions on Accelerating the Construction of a Strong Tourism City" issued by the Municipal Party Committee, the Municipal Party Committee ([2018]No. 30), to strengthen the infrastructure of the scenic spot and the construction of tourism supporting facilities, to made efforts to build the Yellow River Stone Forest into a leading scenic spot and advantageous brand, Jingtai County facilitates the infrastructure construction, improve the service quality, expand the tourism market, enrich the activities in the scenic spot and make advantageous brand of Yellow River Stone River adhering to the principle of “high-grade planning, high-quality construction and high-level management” and focusing on infrastructure construction and tourism.

2. Economic Development
In 2020, the total production value of Jingtai County will reach 7.078 billion yuan, with an average annual growth rate of 8%, and the per capita GDP will reach 28,810 yuan; the fixed assets investment of the whole society will reach 8.4 billion yuan, with an average annual growth rate of 12%; local public finance budget revenue has reached 300 million yuan, with an average annual growth rate of 8%; the total retail sales of social consumer goods has reached 1.7 billion yuan, an average annual increase of 8%; the annual per capita disposable income of urban villagers has reached 26,800 yuan, an average annual increase of 8%, and the per capita disposable income of rural villagers has reached 12,300 yuan, an average annual increase of 10%. By 2020, the goal of achieving a GDP and the per capita disposable income of urban and rural villagers will be doubled in 2010.

By December 2018, Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot had received 1,838,700 visitor and tourism income received 478,682,400 yuan; of which the number of tourists received was 52,570 people in 2018, and the tourism income received 6,308,400 yuan.

6.3.2 Landscape Features
The Yellow River Stone Forest was formed in the Cenozoic Quaternary Early Pleistocene of 2.1 million years ago. Due to the geological effects of crustal movement, weathering, and rain erosion, the geological features of the stone forests are mainly composed of yellow glutenite. The Jingtai County, where the Yellow River Stone Forest is located, has a long history and profound cultural heritage. The ancient cultural relics such as the ancient city of Wuwei, Wufo Temple and Ming Great Wall, as well as Shoulu Mountain, Changling Mountain, Heishan Gorge and the Jingtai-Haiyuan Fault Zone Relics formed the earthquakes are important support for the Yellow River Stone Forest National Geological Park. These factors have precipitated a rich cultural connotation for the Yellow River Stone Forest.

As a stone forest landscape that entered the public's sight in 1990, the distribution area is 50 square kilometers. Compared with the famous Yunnan Stone Forest formed by
limestone dissolution, the Yellow River stone forest features are obviously different, besides the contiguous stone forest, there also have eclipse grooves and stone buds, as well as peaks, peaks, window sills, canyons and other shapes. Because of the late discovery, the geological heritage remains relatively intact.

Since the 1990s, many domestic geological and tourism experts have visited the Yellow River Stone Forest. It is believed that the Yellow River Stone Forest is a great example of China's geological features. It is rare in China and unique in the Northwest. It is called “Chinese Natural Wonders”. A complete cliff with a height of 80-100 meters, a deep geological valley and a continuous rock wall, stone columns, pinnacles, stalagmites formed by temperature changes, thermal expansion and contraction, freezing and melting, rain erosion, wind erosion, etc. The style is unique and the style is different. Some rock and stone anthropomorphic objects, such as the "Mulan expedition", are like the ancient Chinese female characteristics “Mulan”; the "Zhubajie tease Chang'e" is like a bastard in teasing in the famous ancient novel; "the ape is looking", the mountain petrified into a ape image is vivid, just like the legend Sun Wukong. These natural landscapes have been rendered and processed to form myths and legends, folktales, celebrity anecdotes, etc. with public foundations, and gradually evolved into an organic part of tourism landscape culture, which is the creativity of individuals or groups under different cultural backgrounds. The connotation makes the tourist landscape more interesting and vivid, which makes the tourists “see the beautiful scenery and listen to the legend” and leave a deeper impression.

In addition to the stone forest in the core scenic spot of Jingtai Yellow River, the Yellow River passes through the Hongshan Gorge to form the “S” shaped meander, where is located in the Longwan Oasis on the Yellow River meandering step. The sand is blown away by the wind to expose the beach dam formed by the surface. There are may features like crescent-shaped dunes formed by sand grains, all combine to form the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Area. In addition, the construction of the Qingliang Temple, Fire Tower, Panlong Temple and other cultural landscapes, museums, landscape corridors and other facilities, 22nd bend sightseeing bus, the Yellow River drifting sheepskin raft, donkey cart of Yinma Grand Canyon in the scenic spot. When you are in the scenic spot, you may hear the tune echoed of northwestern style occasionally and fell simple folk customs of the local people, blending into the rough cultural atmosphere of the northwest. Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest scientifically and rationally develops and utilizes resources, attaches importance to the natural landscapes left by these time and space, which constitutes the components of the Yellow River Scenic Area, and attaches to the culture of the landscape and the harmony with the surrounding natural environment, fully reflecting the unique cultural characteristics of the Yellow River Stone Scenic Area. And give the Yellow River Stone Forest a higher level of cultural connotation.

The rare “Chinese Natural Wonders” of Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest brings visitors a unique experience. During the investigation, visitors talked about the special
geological features of the Yellow River Stone Forest, which makes people feel an unprecedented sense of absurdity. As if isolated from the world, there is no breath of life. At the same time, the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Area Management Committee has created the Yellow River's characteristic sightseeing “donkey cart” and sheepskin rafts and other sightseeing tours, allowing visitors to experience the ancient and traditional Yellow River travel while in the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Area. The special natural landscape and the traditional Yellow River culture bring different and wonderful experiences to tourists.
Chapter VII. Project Social Risk Analysis

Social risk analysis identifies and ranks various social factors that may affect the project, selects social factors that have large impacts, long duration, and easily lead to large contradictions, and proposes corresponding control measures for risks. Through the questionnaire surveys, interviews with community villagers, scenic workers, scenic spot operators and local officials, combining with some data and second-hand materials, the social assessment team summarized 6 social risks affecting project implementation and proposed corresponding mitigation measure, those including the impacts of community villagers' land acquisition and resettlement, the conflicts between scenic spot management committees and farmers, the support of vulnerable groups, heritage destruction, the values and moral degradation, the changes in rural community labor structure as well as gender and urbanization.

7.1 Identification of Social Risks

1. Risk of contradiction between scenic spot and farmers

The change of the operation mode of the donkey cart may intensify the contradiction between the scenic spot management committee and the farmers. The existing donkey cart service in the scenic spot has been independently operated and managed by farmers and has formed a management system. Due to the management need, the scenic spot management committee will remodel the donkey cart and establish a special farmer cooperative of donkey cart service. After the establishment of the cooperative, the donkey cart will be unified managed and the farmers who involved in the cooperative will receive dividends. However, due to the fact that there was a cooperative registered in the village committee before. The cooperative did not operate according to the its regulations and the legal representative was not local people. The cooperative raised 2 million yuan and the funds management had lots of problem, the farmer did not receive any dividends and their shares could not be recovered. That may cause the farmers have no confidence in the mode of cooperative. At same time, part of farmers reported that the compensation standard in the land acquisition of early stage were not recognized by the farmers, resulting in lower trust of the farmers. Consequently, the failure cooperative operation model and the mutual distrust between the government and the farmers are the main risks of the implementation of the project.

2. Risk of Low community participation

The area where the project area is located lacks the community organization established by the farmers themselves. The registered community organizations such as cooperatives are not operated according to the wishes of the farmers. They are dominated by a few people and lack the participation of farmers.

With the development of scenic spots, more tourists come to the scenic spot. However, the tourists report that some vendors in the scenic spot have deliberately raised the price of goods and sell goods by force that cause the dissatisfaction among tourists. The price cheating and jacking reflects

4. Risk of gender inequality

Due to the imbalanced social and economic development, more villagers in the project are out of village for migrant work, resulting in an imbalance in the structure of the community's labor force. Majority women, elder people and children are left behind at home. Moreover, women are far less educated than men and lack the right to participate, express, decide and be heard in the community affairs. It is suggested that the project should pay more attention to women’ participation in the subsequent construction.

5. Risks of land acquisition, house demolition and resettlement

According to previous investigation, the proposed construction of Sheep Raft Intangible Culture Heritage Protection and Display Area, road engineering involves the land acquisition, which located in the Longwan Village, Zhongquan Township of Jingtai. This land acquisition contains permanent acquisition, simple house demolition and ground attachment demolition. The project will levy 64 mu of permanent land, which affected 186 people of 45 households; remove 117 m$^2$ simple house, which affected 11 people of 4 households; remove or cut 18.61 mu ground attachments, 3540 economic trees, 50m$^2$ donkey sheds and 12 m$^2$ fishpond. If the rights and interests of the affected households cannot be guaranteed, there will be risks to the project implementation.

7.2 Project Social Risk Management

1. Risk of contradiction between scenic spot and farmers

Engage the third consulting agency to cultivate the farmer-leading community organizations. After the project is launched, it is recommended that the qualified third-party consulting agency should be hired to cultivate the farmer-leading community organizations. The consulting agency will assistant the farmers to establish the organization, help them improve the management system, management structure and supervision mechanism that enhance the function of community organizations, inspire the participation enthusiasm of local villagers and ease the dissatisfaction between scenic spot management committee and farmers. At the same time, the equal
communication mechanism and platform between scenic spot management committee and farmers will be establish to discuss about the common benefit, defuse the contradiction and make common development directions and goals.

2. Risk of Low community participation

Improve the community participation. It is suggested that the management committee of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot listen to and adopt suitable opinions and suggestions of community villagers in major decision-making, project implementation and tourism management, and establish a community participation mechanism to ensure the community's right to know and participate in the management of scenic spots as well as the right of decision-making.

3. Risk of moral degradation of farmers

Establish a standardized management system and use institutional and traditional ethics to discipline the behavior of farmers. It is suggested that the Scenic Spot management committee, community organizations and farmers establish together make the management regulation, reception standard, price standard, reward and punishment mechanisms through the participatory discussion. The institutional management and traditional ethical management are conducive to improving the moral literacy of farmers.

4. Risk of gender inequality

Promote the gender equality and empower women. The SA team recommends that when establishing a community organization, the proportion of female members is clearly required to be no less than 30%, and women participation is also required in the management of community organizations. The project encourages women to participate in various meetings and trainings organized by community organizations and scenic management committees, and encourage them first to participate in the service industry such as catering, tea, handicraft, embroidery and other business.

5. Risks of land acquisition, house demolition and resettlement

The WB Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Project Office in Jingtai County was established to be responsible for the management and project implementation. And the Land Use & Protection Group under the PMO is responsible for land acquisition and resettlement. The progress of land acquisition and house demolition and resettlement implementation shall be carried out according to the progress of the construction plan of the project. In accordance with the actual situation of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot in Jingtai County, the resettlement plan will be formulated to ensure the
openness, fairness and transparency of the project land acquisition implementation process. The assessment team should design community villagers' participation, grievance redress mechanism, and internal and external monitoring and evaluation process for the entire project in the resettlement plan, so that the legitimate rights and interests of the affected households can be guaranteed, and the risks that may arise during the project implementation process are reduced. Finally, the dual goals of “alleviating absolute poverty and sharing economic prosperity” can be achieved.
Chapter VIII. Project Social Impact Analysis

8.1 Analysis of Project Impacts on different interest groups

The stakeholder groups of the Yellow River Stone Forest Project Area include: government departments (Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Management Committee, Jingtai County Development and Reform Bureau, Jingtai County Culture and Sports and Tourism Bureau, Jingtai County Poverty Alleviation Office, Jingtai County Finance Bureau, Jingtai County Natural Resources Bureau, Jingtai County Agricultural and Rural Bureau, etc.), local community villagers, commercial operators, tourists, etc.

1. Analysis of the impact on local villagers

Through the survey of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot and surrounding villagers, 72.7% of the villagers were very concerned about and supported the development of the project, and the participation was very positive. However, the current development of scenic spots is relatively slow, which has led to limited income-increasing of villagers, and the education level of villagers in the area is generally low. The income from participating in scenic tourist services is low and there is still a big gap with the expectations of villagers. According to the survey, 85% of the villagers believe that the development of the scenic spot will not damage the local environment, and 12.5% of the villagers believe that the development of the scenic spot will make the local environment better. 100% of the villagers expressed their welcome to the arrival of tourists, and also hoped to publicize the tourism resources of their hometown, and promote the construction of surrounding infrastructure, so that the fruits of tourism development can be shared by local villagers.

2. Impact on government departments

The survey of government officials showed that local officials were optimistic about the project and said that the project could generate greater revenue for the local government and improve government performance. The main impact of the project on relevant government officials is training a group of cadres who are familiar with the World Bank project management and promoting the cadre team to understand the management rules of international projects such as the World Bank, and improving the overall management capabilities and vision of government officials.

3. Impact on business operators

Through the survey of 20 commercial operators around the scenic spot, the government has given fewer preferential policies to the merchants. The income gap of individual
and commercial households operating in and around the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot is relatively large, and the income of small commodity operators has been indistinctly increase after the participating in the scenic spot. The income of the farmhouse restaurant operators has been obviously increased after the participating in the scenic spot. After the implementation of this project, it will further promote the development of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot, bring more development opportunities and income increasing opportunities for commercial operators, and enable commercial operators to obtain more benefits from the development of the scenic spot.

4. Impact on tourists in the scenic spot

According to the survey of tourists in the scenic spot, the tourists are satisfied with the service quality, environmental quality and sanitation of the scenic spot. 36% of the tourists said that they are not satisfied with the restaurants and 42% of the tourists said that they are not satisfied with the accommodation conditions. After the implementation of this project, the infrastructure construction of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot will be strengthened, and the various facilities and service will be effectively strengthened, which will help to improve the construction of service facilities in the scenic spot, will increase the satisfaction of tourists on the service quality and environment of the scenic spot, and will attract more tourists come to visit.

5. Impact on local enterprises and cooperatives

The existing agricultural cooperatives in the project area lacks the systematic capacity building. Due to single operating mode, lack of management standardization, low creation awareness and be insensitivity about the change of external economic environment, the cooperative can not change the operating mode in time according to the current situation. After the implementation of the project, 2 farmer-leading community organizations will be incubated in the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot that provide special skills training, pay attention to women development and increasing the participation in the community activity, fully play the role of local community organization and drive the income of local villagers. After the community organization is in good operation, it will enhance the participation of local community villagers. More villagers can directly participate in the development and construction of scenic spots through the community organization, gain benefits through the development of scenic spots, increase their incomes, and improve their living standards. Thus the goal of prosperity and development of the scenic spot and the community is achieved.

6. Impact on women

Local women do not have a stable source of income. Except for some of them who go
out to work, most of them participate in scenic spots to drive karting or do farming activities. The implementation of the project will promote the development of scenic spot that which will increase the income of women and the status of women in the family. With the development of local tourism, female practitioners will pay more attention to the improvement of their own education. They can also avoid prejudice against women in traditional thinking, and help their children receive good education while improving their own quality.

8.2 Positive Impacts of the Project:

1. The concept of the “New Silk Road Economic Belt” is the core measure of the China’s opening up and becomes the new idea of development under the new situation. As an important city along the Silk Road Economic Belt, Baiyin City needs to be further integrated into the development of the Gansu section of the “Silk Road Economic Belt”. The Yellow River Stone Forest Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development Project relies on the “One Belt and One Road” construction strategy, utilizes the development opportunities of World Bank loans and cultural tourism, and protects the natural and cultural heritage of the Yellow River Stone Forest by virtue of its good location advantages, resource advantages and cultural advantages. The implementation of tourism resource development activities can promote the development of communities such as Longwan Village of Yellow River Stone Forest and improve the living standards of surrounding villagers.

2. The project will enhance the protection and development of cultural and natural heritage in Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot. Due to imperfect policies and constraints on economic conditions, the status of protection, management and sustainable use of cultural and natural heritage in Jingtai Historical and Cultural Area is worrying. It is imperative to implement scientific planning and top-level strategic development for cultural heritage protection and sustainable tourism development. Therefore, the implementation of the WB Cultural and Natural Heritage Project is conducive to the sustainable development and natural heritage protection in Jingtai County.

3. The poor population of Longwan Village, Zhongquan Township in Jingtai County was involved in the project. The implementation of the project can provide the employment and business opportunities for the poor people in Longwan Village of Zhongquan Township and even the whole Jingtai County, increase their incomes and improve their living standard as well as promote the economic development of Longwan Village and Jingtai County.
4. The project implementation is conducive to enhancing community participation. The community villagers were involved in the scenic spot by the establishment of community organizations. The project set a talking platform between farm households and governments to alleviate the contradiction and seek for common development directions and goals. Through the implementation of the project, 2 community organizations will be established in the Yellow River Stone Forest, and more farmers will participate in the development of the scenic spots. It is estimated that the number of direct beneficiaries will reach 100 people and the indirect beneficiaries will reach 400 people.

5. The project implementation will improve the infrastructure of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot, improve the tourism supporting facilities, and increase the employment positions during the construction period and after completion. The project will also improve the tourism management capacity of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot, improve the abilities of the tourism industry employees, and enhance the awareness of the cultural heritage protection of the local community villagers.

8.3 Negative Impacts of the project:

1. This subproject will acquire an amount of 64 mu (around 4 ha) of rural land acquisition which affect 45 households with 186 persons and 117 sqm of house demolition affecting 4 households with 11 persons in Longwan Village of Zhongchuan Town, Jingtaí County.

2. The environmental impacts generated during project construction may lead to impacts on local people’s health and safety. Temporary dumping of dust, noise and garbage generated during the project construction will temporarily adversely affect the cleanliness of the project area, and will bring short-term travel inconvenience, which will have a negative impact on the daily life of local villagers (villagers). Meanwhile, engineering trucks, waste, waste soil, waste water and other issues may pose safety threat to the local community (village) villagers, especially the elderly, children, pregnant women and other person;

3. The environmental impacts will be caused by an increase in the number of tourists. After the completion of the project, the environmental pollution will be generated by the increasing the tourists, such as solid waste, noise pollution, sewage discharge, dust, automobile exhaust and etc..
Chapter IX. Community Participation

9.1 The Role of Community Participation

1. The participation of community organizations can alleviate the contradiction between the local government and the farmers. In the investigation of the Yellow River Stone Forest, it is understood that the change of the operation mode of the donkey cart may intensify the contradiction between the management committee of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot and the farmers. The farmer-leading community organization will be incubated to establish and improve management system, management structure and supervision mechanism, inspire the participation enthusiasm of local villagers and ease the dissatisfaction of farmers. Meanwhile, an equal communication platform will be established through the community organization to discuss the common demands and different, mitigate the contradiction between government and community and make the common development directions and goals.

2. Participation of community organizations can build a platform for community participation in the protection and development of cultural natural heritage, which improves the community's ability to share project achievements and stimulates community cultural awareness and ownership of the project, enhances the sense of obtaining of local villagers, internalize the protection and development of cultural natural heritage at all levels of community life and promote the achievement of goal of community development and natural heritage protection.

3. Community involvement can make up for the lack of government work. In the investigation process, it was learned that the management institution of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot is the management committee, which is responsible for the protection and inheritance of the material and cultural heritage and intangible cultural heritage of the scenic spot. However, government agencies are busy with a focus on infrastructure construction and scenic development. Therefore, community participation can effectively compensate for the lack of work in the micro level of government departments.

4. Community involvement gives the cultural heritage a chance to reproduce and invigorate. Under the humanistic background of self-identification of local unique cultures, the establishment of corresponding grassroots protection organizations will stimulate the local public's cultural consciousness and internalize the protection and development of cultural natural heritage into all aspects of their lives. Through this natural performance, the inheritance mechanism of cultural heritage will be protected in a sustainable way.
9.2 Mechanism of Community Participation

The main mechanisms for community participation in the World Bank projects include two aspects: one is the community organizations, and the other is to enable communities to gain the right to know, participate, and complain.

1. Establish community organizations
As an important part of heritage protection, community organizations have an indispensable and important role compared to the government's heritage protection work. The rural community organizations in the World Bank-financed Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development Project can be divided into for-profit and non-profit based on attributes. For-profit community organizations include various agricultural product processing and sales, industrial development, tourism and cultural products processing and sales; non-profit community organizations include cultural heritage and development, tourism services and other associations and cooperatives.

The main objectives of incubating and establishing community organizations are: combining with rural “three changes” reform strategies (land changes to equity, asset changes to shares, farmers change to shareholders), and to improve the system and mechanism of rural community organization; to establish and improve the supervision of community organizations incubated that the organization carries out the work under the supervision of village committee, representatives of community and supervisor and ensure the organization in a good operation.; to promote the community organization pay attention to the vulnerable groups in the rural community, including the women, elderly, children and disabled persons; to increase the income of community organization with an annual growth rate of 6% to achieve sustainable development.

2. Three Basic Rights for Community participation
First of all, the right to know. The government department of Yellow River Stone Forest should open up a special government network to inform community villagers about the protection of the heritage, such what are there the natural, cultural and material heritage in the local areas? What are the ongoing projects on heritage protection in government departments? In addition, in response to the reality that most community villagers will not access the Internet, a symposium will be held to inform the masses through face-to-face communication.

Secondly, the right to participate. Before the implementation of the Yellow River Stone Forest Natural and Cultural Heritage Protection Project, the government should organize community villagers to discuss the project and record the opinions. In the planning process, the community villagers should also be widely consulted and organized to discuss. During the implementation phase of the project, community villagers are organized for training, such as employment skills training and language exchange training in order to ensure the villager can be competent for the job, such as selling local specialty products or handicrafts. For a long time after project
implementation, the form of community participation is to establish a community organization to protect the heritage and supervise the work of the relevant management departments. Villagers can spontaneously set up a “Community Natural Heritage Protection and Development Community Group” to supervise the work of the government departments and make recommendations. It can be seen from the above that the participation rights of community villagers in community participation run through the entire heritage protection project, including the pre-project design, implementation period and long-term operation.

**Thirdly, the right to complain and appeal.** Community participation is implemented by the third party and does not have the compulsory and authoritative nature of government departments in the heritage protection. Therefore, it is inevitable that there will be setbacks in the process of driving participation rights and there is a need to complain. The government department of the Yellow River Stone Forest has a special petition bureau. If the community villagers have any opinions and complaints in the heritage protection, they can reiterate their opinions through the petition office after appealing failure in the government.
Chapter X. Conclusions and Suggestions

10.1 Conclusions

Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Construction Project of World Bank Loan Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development Phase II Project will provide significant social and economic benefits after the implementation. The project significant positive impacts on local people can be foreseeable in more economic opportunities, skill development and capacity building. It has a high suitability for various stakeholder groups and projects area development. The social positive impacts of the project will be significant and the social risks are limited and controllable with a range of mitigation measures in place. The main stakeholder groups of the project including local government departments concerned, especially the Management Committee of Jingtai Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot is the implementing agency of the project with support of a range of other departments. Other key stakeholders include community villagers, commercial operators, tourism service providers, tourists, women and the poor people in project areas. The SA team assessed the situation of population in the project area and concluded that there is no ethnic minority in the project according to the Bank Indigenous People term definition under its OP4.10 policy. Therefore the SA concludes that the Bank OP4.10 policy of indigenous people is not applicable to the project affected areas. The OP4.10 policy is not triggered in this subproject. The social assessment also confirms that the subproject will acquire a small amount of 64 mu (around 4 ha) of rural land acquisition which affect 45 households with 186 persons and 117 sqm of house demolition affecting 4 households with 11 persons in Longwan Village of Zhongchuan Town, Jingtai County.

10.2 Mitigation Measures for social risks and impacts:

1. Engage the third consulting agency to cultivate the farmer-leading community organizations. After the project is launched, it is recommended that the qualified third-party consulting agency should be hired to cultivate the farmer-leading community organizations. The consulting agency will assistant the farmers to establish the organization, help them improve the management system, management structure and supervision mechanism that enhance the function of community organizations, inspire the participation enthusiasm of local villagers and ease the dissatisfaction between scenic spot management committee and farmers. At the same time, the equal communication mechanism and platform between scenic spot management committee and farmers will be establish to discuss about the common benefit, defuse the contradiction and make common development directions and goals.
2. Mitigation measures for environmental impacts. The project EMP has set detailed measures to mitigate negative impacts from environmental perspectives.

3. Mitigation measures for environmental pollution. The project environmental management plan will be implemented to solve the environmental impact. During the construction of the project, the project construction unit should clean up the engineering garbage in a timely manner, arrange the construction time reasonably, and avoid the construction at night. At the same time, the construction should avoid transporting engineering materials during peak tourist periods or in the densely populated areas.

4. Improve the community participation. It is suggested that the management committee of the Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot change its management philosophy and fully listen to and adopt the opinions and suggestions of community villagers in major decision-making, project implementation and tourism management, and establish a community participation mechanism to ensure the community's right to know and participate in the management of scenic spots as well as the right of decision-making.

5. Establish a standardized management system and use institutional and traditional ethics to discipline the behavior of farmers. It is suggested that the Scenic Spot management committee, community organizations and farmers establish together make the management regulation, reception standard, price standard, reward and punishment mechanisms through the participatory discussion. The institutional management and traditional ethical management are conducive to improving the moral literacy of farmers.

6. Focus on gender sensitivity. The SA team recommends that when establishing a community organization, the proportion of female members is clearly required to be no less than 30%, and women participation is also required in the management of community organizations. The project encourages women to participate in various meetings and trainings organized by community organizations and scenic management committees, and encourage them first to participate in the service industry such as catering, tea, handicraft, embroidery and other business.

7. A resettlement action plan is prepared to guide and ensure proper land acquisition and resettlement under this subproject. This RAP should be strictly followed and implemented during the project implementation. The WB Yellow River Stone Forest Scenic Spot Project Office in Jingta County was established to be responsible for the management and project implementation. And the Land Use Protection Group under the PMO is responsible for land acquisition and resettlement. The progress of land acquisition and house demolition and resettlement implementation shall be carried out according to the progress of the construction plan of the project. The RAP is to ensure openness, fairness and transparency of the project land acquisition implementation process. The project will promote community villagers' participation, ensure grievance redress mechanism in place, and arrange for internal and external monitoring and evaluation for the entire project in the resettlement plan.
8. Women should be equally treated as same as men during the recruitment. In addition, the responsible person should strengthen the staff management and increase the night patrol to avoid the security accidents.

9. Prevention measures for COVID-19:
   ① Entry/exit to the work site should be controlled and documented for both workers and other parties, including support staff and suppliers.
   ② Training workers and staff on site on the signs and symptoms of COVID-19, how it is spread, how to protect themselves (including regular handwashing and social distancing) and what to do if they or other people have symptoms.
   ③ Ensuring handwashing facilities supplied with soap, disposable paper towels and closed waste bins exist at key places throughout site, including at entrances/exits to work areas; where there is a toilet, canteen or food distribution, or provision of drinking water; in worker accommodation; at waste stations; at stores; and in common spaces. Where handwashing facilities do not exist or are not adequate, arrangements should be made to set them up. Alcohol based sanitizer (if available, 60-95% alcohol) can also be used.
   ④ Conduct regular and thorough cleaning of all site facilities, including offices, accommodation, canteens, common spaces. Review cleaning protocols for key construction equipment (particularly if it is being operated by different workers).
   ⑤ Training cleaners in proper hygiene (including handwashing) prior to, during and after conducting cleaning activities; how to safely use PPE (where required); in waste control (including for used PPE and cleaning materials).
   ⑥ Where it is anticipated that cleaners will be required to clean areas that have been or are suspected to have been contaminated with COVID-19, providing them with appropriate PPE: gowns or aprons, gloves, eye protection (masks, goggles or face screens) and boots or closed work shoes. If appropriate PPE is not available, cleaners should be provided with best available alternatives.
   ⑦ Consider changes to work processes and timings to reduce or minimize contact between workers, recognizing that this is likely to impact the project schedule.
   ⑧ For further information see WHO COVID-19 advice for the public and ILO Standards.
Annex : Questionnaires

Questionnaire 1: Questionnaire for Local Officials in World Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project

Hello!

World Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project is involved with five sub-projects in four cities (Prefectures) of Baiyin, Pingliang, Longnan, Linxia (Baili Grotto in Jiangchuan County, Guan’egou in Tanchang County, Yangba in Kang County, Songmingyan Hua’er and Ancient Animal Fossil Museum in Hezheng County), with a total investment of 820 million yuan, of which $100 million coming from the World Bank loan, which is an integrated project of historic preservation, tourism, construction, roads, landscape and other many industries. The target of the project is to achieve “Alleviating Absolute Poverty and Sharing Economic Prosperity”. This questionnaire invites the County’s (Prefecture) officials to evaluate the scenic spots in this area involved in the World Bank Project using the way of secret ballot, and please fill the contents not mentioned which you think is necessary. Thank you for your cooperation and support!

1. Basic Information
Your gender: □Male  □Female   Age: years old   Current post and rank:

2. Are you a native? □Yes  □No

3. How many times have you been to Kongtong area?
□None □Once □Twice □Three times □Many times

4. Which do you think is the most valuable part of the local scenic spots? (Multiple choice)
□Aesthetic value □Scientific value □History and culture value □Entertainment Value
□Religious worship Value □Health care and medical treatment □Other values

5. Which is the development direction that should be emphasized in the local scenic tourism? (Multiple choice)
□Ecotourism □Adventure Tourism □Other □Sightseeing □Vacation
□Entertainment □Religious worship □Folk Experience Tourism □Shopping Tourism
□Cultural Tourism

6. What do you think of the feasibility of the World Bank Project (abbreviation of World Bank Financed Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development Project Phrase II)?
□Very good □Good □Just so so □Not good □Unclear

7. Which difficulties and obstacles do you think will be faced for the implementation of the World Bank Project? (Multiple choice)
□Inadequate policy support □Noncooperation of local villagers □Poor traffic conditions
□Information congestion □Enthusiasm absence of local officials
□other
8. Which aspects do you think will the World Bank Project bring benefits to the local? (Multiple choices)
□Promoting employment □Reducing poverty □Improving the ecological environment
□Promoting cultural and natural heritage protection □Enhancing tourism development
□Increasing popularity of the scenic spots □Improving traffic conditions □Other

9. Which negative impacts do you think will the World Bank Project bring to the local? Which are they? (Multiple choice)
□None □Unclear □Damaging the environment □Disturbing villagers □Occupying land
□Increasing management cost □Other

10. How do you think of the local conservation status of the cultural and natural heritage?
□ Very good □ Good □ Just so so □ Poor □ Very poor

11. Which aspect do you think should the World Bank Project invest in with emphasis on the scenic? (Multiple choices)
□Infrastructure construction □Cultural heritage protection □Ecological environment governance □Scenic management training □Development and construction of agritainment in peripheral zone of resorts □Strengthening resorts propaganda □Other

12. How do you think of the villagers' willingness to participate in tourism operation or service?
□With very high willingness □With high willingness □With general willingness □Will low willingness to □ unclear

13. What's your advice for the World Bank Project combing the local reality?

Thank you for your support! Wish you a happy life!
Questionnaire 2: Questionnaire for Community Affected People in Scenic Spots in World Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project

Hello!

World Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project is involved with five sub-projects in four cities (Prefectures) of Baiyin, Pingliang, Longnan, Linxia (Baili Grotto in Jiangchuan County, Guan’egou in Tanchang County, Yangba in Kang County, Songmingyan Hua’er and Ancient Animal Fossil Museum in Hezheng County), with a total investment of 820 million yuan, of which $100 million coming from the World Bank loan, which is an integrated project of historic preservation, tourism, construction, roads, landscape and other many industries. The target of the project is to achieve “Alleviating Absolute Poverty and Sharing Economic Prosperity”. Thanks for your cooperation in the questionnaire. The questionnaire will conduct in the way of secret ballot and the results will only be used in academic research, without bring any negative impact on your life and work. Please let us know your true thoughts and fill in what fits your situation or use “✓”. Thank you for your assistance and support!

1. Basic information of the interviewee
   Gender: □Male □Female  Age:  Nationality:  
   Education level:  □Junior High school and the below  □Senior high school  
   □Technical secondary school or junior college □Bachelor □graduate or the higher level  
   The number of family member:  family annual income:yuan

2. The distance from home to scenic spot:

3. Your religious:  
   □Islam □Catholicism □Buddhim □Taoism □Other religion □haveno religious belief

4. Do you think whether the local tourism has had negative effect on local ecological environment?  
   □Yes, serious destruction □Yes, slight destruction □No □Tourism makes the local natural environment better

5. Do you think whether the development of scenic spot has affected you and your family?  
   □Yes, has been compensated  □Yes, the compensation is few  
   □Yes, but without any compensation □No

6. What about your attitude about lots of tourists?  
   □Dislike  □Welcome  □Not care

7. Do you think your family benefited from tourism development? □Yes □No

8. Do you think it is possible to increase family income by working in scenic spot?
9. How much do you know about local cultural and natural heritage (non-material cultural heritage)?
   □A lot □some □a few □few □don’t know at all

10. Do you pay attention to the development and construction of local scenic spot?
    □Yes □No

11. Do you think it is reasonable to have the local villagers benefit from the exploration of local scenic spot? □Yes □No □Don’t care

12. Do you think whether the surrounding villagers have the responsibility to participate in the protection of local cultural and natural heritage and non-material cultural heritage? □Yes □don’t care □have no business with yourself

13. Is there any family member works in the local scenic spot? □Yes □No

   &these questions are only for the surrounding villagers who did not work in the scenic spot (Q14-16)

14. If you have not participated in business operations in scenic spot, do you have the intention to participate or not? □Yes □No

15. Do you have channel to work in scenic spot? □Yes □No

16. What is your job? □farming □working □individual business owner □others

   & this question is only for nearby villagers who have participated in scenic spot’s working (17-21)

17. If you have already participated in tourism service, what is your work now?
    □managers in scenic spot □cleaners in scenic spot □staffs in amusement sports □restaurant □accommodation □small ware retailing □Agricola □private vendor □others

18. what did you do before participating in tourism work? □farming □working □individual business owner □others

19. How did you participate in working of scenic spot?
    □recruitment of scenic spot □with the help of acquaintance □government support □registration operation of individual household □private □others

20. what is the income from working in scenic spot?    yuan

21. After working in scenic spot, did the family income increase?
    □yes, a lot □yes, but not so much □no change in income □less
22. If the planning construction of scenic spot affect you and it can not be solved, do you know how to appeal? If yes, please write it out.
□yes □no

23. What opinion do you have on the poverty alleviation and become rich for nearby villagers and on increasing income?

Thank you for your support! Have a nice life!
Hello!

World Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project is involved with five sub-projects in four cities (Prefectures) of Baiyin, Pingliang, Longnan, Linxia (Baili Grotto in Jiangchuan County, Guan’egou in Tanchang County, Yangba in Kang County, Songmingyan Hua’er and Ancient Animal Fossil Museum in Hezheng County), with a total investment of 820 million yuan, of which $ 100 million coming from the World Bank loan, which is an integrated project of historic preservation, tourism, construction, roads, landscape and other many industries. The target of the project is to achieve “Alleviating Absolute Poverty and Sharing Economic Prosperity”. Thanks for your cooperation in the questionnaire. The questionnaire will conduct in the way of secret ballot and the results will only be used in academic research, without bring any negative impact on your life and work. Please let us know your true thoughts and fill in what fits your situation or use “✓”. Thank you for your assistance and support!

1. Basic Information
   Your gender: □Male □Female   Age: years old   Nationality:

2. Are you a native? □Yes □No

3. Your religion: □ Islam□ Catholic □ Buddhism□Taoism □Other religions
   □ No religion

4. Business operation type: □Hotel □Restaurant □Agritainment □ Small business operation □Roadside vendors □Entertainment □Other

5. How long have you been engaged in this?

6. What did you do before you engage in this operation?
   □Farming □Off-farm work □Privately or individually-ownedbusiness □Others

7. How much is your annual household income before you engaged in this operation? Yuan/year

8. How much is the net household income from the business operation in Scenic Spot? Yuan/year

9. Whether your household income has been increased after you engaged in the operation in Scenic Spot?
   □Yes, with noticeable increase □Yes, but not increase much □No difference □Income decreases

10. Do you think the development of local tourism has damaged the local ecological environment?
   □Yes, severely □ Yes, slightly □ No □ The local natural environment has become better
because of tourism

11. Do you think the entrance of the tourists has disturbed the normal life of the local people?
□ Serious interference □ No obvious interference □ No

12. How much do you know about the local cultural and natural heritage or the intangible cultural heritage?
□ Very much □ Much □ A little □ Don’t know much □ Nothing

13. Do you pay attention to the development of the local scenic spots?
□ Yes □ No

14. Do you think that the local people should get profits in the development of the local Scenic Spot?
□ Yes □ No □ Do not care

15. Do you think the neighbors have the responsibility to participate in the protection of local cultural and natural heritage or intangible cultural heritage?
□ Yes □ It doesn’t matter □ Non of my business

16. How did you participate the Scenic Spot commercial operation?
□ Scenic recruiting □ The help of acquaintance □ Government support □ Self-registered business operation □ Private □ Other

17. Have you ever participated in job training? □ Yes □ No

18 What’s your advice on the aspects of scenic development helping the villagers to participate in tourism business operations?

Thank you for your support! Wish you a happy life!
Questionnaire 4: Questionnaire for Tourists in World Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project

Hello!

World Bank Loaned Gansu Cultural and Natural Heritage Protection and Development II Project Phrase II is involved with six sub-projects in three cities (Prefectures) of Pingliang, Longnan, Linxia (Yunya Temple in Zhuanglang County, Baili Grottoes in Jingchuan County, Kongtong Mountain in Kongtong Region, Guan’e Gou in Tanchang County, Yangba in Kang County, Songmingyan Hua’er and Ancient Animal Fossil Museum in Hezheng County ), with a total investment of 820 million yuan, of which $ 100 million coming from the World Bank loan, which is an integrated project of historic preservation, tourism, construction, roads, landscape and other many industries. The target of the project is to achieve “Alleviating Absolute Poverty and Sharing Economic Prosperity”. The questionnaire will conduct in the way of secret ballot and the results will only be used in academic research, without bring any negative impact on your life or work. Please let us know your true thoughts and fill in what fits your situation or use “✓”. Thank you for your assistance and support!

1. Basic Information
Your gender: □ Male □ Female Age: years old
Occupation: □ Corporate / Company employee □ Government department staff □ Public institution staff □ Self-employed □ Freelancers □ Teacher/professor □ Student □ Soldier □ The emeritus and retired □ Farmer □ Other

Educational level: □ Junior high school and below □ Senior high school □ Technical secondary school or junior college □ Undergraduate □ Postgraduate or above
Nationality:
Monthly income: □ Below 2,000 yuan □ 2,000 ~ 4,000 yuan □ 4,000 ~ 6,000 yuan □ 6,000 ~ 8,000 yuan □ Over 8,000 yuan

Permanent address: County City (State) Province (autonomous region)

2. Evaluation of the resort status:
   satisfied / quite satisfied / general / less satisfied / very dissatisfied
   1) On the scenic service quality □ □ □ □ □
   2) On the scenic environmental quality □ □ □ □ □
   3) On the scenic value □ □ □ □ □
   4) On the scenic charges □ □ □ □ □
   5) On the traffic status □ □ □ □ □
   6) On the scenic hygienic condition □ □ □ □ □
   7) On the scenic security □ □ □ □ □
8) On the scenic catering

9) On the scenic guide identification

10) On the scenic accommodation

11) On the scenic leisure facilities

12) On the scenic tickets

13) On the scenic conservation status Satisfaction

14) On the overall evaluation of the scenic

3. What’s your purpose of travelling here?
☐ Sightseeing ☐ leisure ☐ Tasting delicious food ☐ Investigating and studying
☐ Exploration ☐ Religious worship ☐ Making friends and seeing relatives ☐ other

4. The expenditure per capita to this Scenic Spot for one time: yuan, spending mostly on _____?

5. How many times have you been here for travel?
_____ times
Do you have the intention to visit here again?
☐ Yes ☐ No

6. What’s your way of organizing this tour?
☐ Individual ☐ Friends or family together ☐ Units organized ☐ Travel agencies
☐ Other

7. How did you know this Scenic Spot? (Multiple Choices)
☐ Tourist brochures ☐ Broadcasting ☐ Friends recommendation ☐ Textbooks
☐ Newspapers and magazines ☐ Network ☐ Travel agencies ☐ Outdoor advertisement ☐ other

8. How much do you know about the concept of the cultural and natural heritage protection?
☐ Very much ☐ Much ☐ A little ☐ almost little ☐ Know nothing

9. What’s your most impressive part in this scenic?
☐ Attractions quality ☐ Scenic environment ☐ Friendly services ☐ Special products sale ☐ Other

10. Whether do you think the tourists should consciously participate in environmental, cultural and natural heritage protection during travelling?
☐ Yes, they should ☐ Not necessary ☐ Unclear
11. Which aspects do you think the Scenic Spot suits to develop to? (Multiple choices)
☐Sightseeing ☐Leisure ☐Recreation ☐Religious worship ☐Folk experience tourism ☐Shopping tourism ☐Cultural tourism ☐Ecotourism ☐Adventure tourism ☐Other

12. Which is your most dissatisfied part of this Scenic?

13. Please propose your personal views on improving service in the Scenic:

Thank you for your support! Wish you a happy life!